

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 9 November 2011

<i>Present</i>	Provost (Dr P J Prendergast), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Professor L Hogan), Senior Lecturer (Professor P Geoghegan), Registrar (Professor S P A Allwright), Bursar (Professor D Lloyd), Mr R Bartlett, Professor S D C Barrett, Ms R Barry, Dr M Bouroche, Dr O Braiden, Professor M A Coffey, Mr F Cowzer, Professor W J Dowling, Mr J Gallagher, Professor H Gibbons, Professor R Gilligan, Professor J F McGilp, Dr K J McGinley, Professor N Marples, Ms L Miller, Ms N Murray, Ms M O'Connor, Professor C O'Farrelly, Professor D O'Neill, Professor H J Rice.
<i>Apologies</i>	Vice-Provost for Global Relations, Ms M A Coffey, Professor E J O'Halpin, Professor D M Singleton.
<i>In attendance</i>	Ms S Mac Bride.
<i>(ex officio)</i>	Secretary to the College, Treasurer.
<i>(by invitation)</i>	Chief Operating Officer.
	Dean of Research (Professor V Cahill) (BD/11-12/074)

SECTION A

- BD/11-12/066 Statutory Declaration** The Provost congratulated Professor O'Farrelly on her election to Board and invited her to make the Statutory Declaration as provided for in the 2010 Consolidated Statutes.
- BD/11-12/067 Minutes**
The minutes of the meeting held on 12 October 2011 were approved and signed.
- BD/11-12/068 Matters Arising**
A number of matters arising from the minutes were discussed and have been recorded below, (see minutes BD/11-12/069, 70, 71 below).

BD/11-12/069 Governance - Appointment of Head of School (see minute BD/11-12/042 of 12 October 2011)

The Provost invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 2 November 2011, which had been circulated. He advised Board that, following the discussion at the last meeting, principles had been developed which stipulated the specific exceptional circumstances when it would be appropriate for a Lecturer to stand for a Head of School election including where staff members on the Senior Lecturer scale or above did not meet the eligibility or other requirements of the post or held other strategic posts of responsibility within the College. It was also noted that, on occasion, eligible Senior Lecturers or above may have extenuating personal circumstances that would preclude them from fulfilling the role of Head of School effectively.

In response to a query, the Provost clarified that the issue of fundraising is discussed at the Heads of School Committee and noted the importance of Heads of Schools' involvement in fundraising activities.

Noting that the principles would now bring greater clarity to the Head of School election process, the Board approved the proposals as presented.

BD/11-12/070 Academic Contract (see minute BD/11-12/043 of 12 October 2011)

The Board noted that IFUT have lodged a formal complaint with the Public Service Agreement Implementation Body regarding an alleged breach by the College of the Croke Park Agreement in relation to contracts of indefinite duration.

BD/11-12/071 University Philosophical Society (see minute BD/11-12/046 of 12 October 2011)

The Board noted that the University Philosophical Society in consultation with the College had withdrawn its invitation to Mr Nick Griffin of the British National Party who had been invited to speak at a University Philosophical Society debate.

BD/11-12/072 Faculty of Health Sciences/Trinity Health: Governance Arrangements

The Provost invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 3 November 2011, which had been circulated. He advised Board that the proposed arrangements had been approved by the Dean of Health Sciences, the Vice-Provost for Medical Affairs and Executive Officers. The Board noted that the proposed arrangements set out the relationship between the School of Medicine, the Faculty of Health Sciences and the hospitals which will allow Trinity Health Ireland operate within the College governance structure.

The Provost invited Board's attention to a number of recommendations under the follow headings:

- (i) Relationship between Trinity Health Ireland and the Faculty of Health Sciences;
- (ii) Academic Governance;
- (iii) Administrative Governance;
- (iv) Faculty Office.

In the course of a discussion, the Board noted concerns about a possible weakening of other Schools in the Faculty of Health Sciences as a result of the arrangements being made for the School of Medicine and agreed that those Schools should not be

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

adversely affected by the proposed arrangements which should be reviewed after a one year period.

The Board also noted that other academic medical centres operate in conjunction with faculties rather than schools and that many successful CEOs in the sector have been from a nursing discipline.

In response to a query, the Provost advised Board that the CEO of Trinity Health Ireland will oversee the budget, which is provided by the College and the two partner hospitals. The Board noted that issues regarding the management of College properties on the two hospital sites by the Faculty of Health Sciences and the School of Medicine will be addressed at the next meeting.

The Board approved the recommendations as presented noting they will be reviewed after one year.

BD/11-12/073 Audit Committee Recommendation and Updates - October 2011

The Chief Operating Officer invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 29 October 2011, which had been circulated together with a schedule outlining the College's response to Audit Committee recommendations as outlined in previous reports considered by the Board.

In response to a query regarding the criteria used to select suppliers in procurement exercises, the Chief Operating Officer and the Treasurer advised Board that while economic advantage is a criterion for selection it is not the determining one, and quality of goods and services is always taken into account. The Board noted that issues in relation to College branding will be addressed in the Communications Strategy which will be presented to Board in due course. In response to a query, the Provost advised Board that there is a procedure in place to govern external earning arrangements of academic staff.

The Board noted the updated position on the recommendations made by the Audit Committee and agreed that any actions requiring a change in College policy would be presented to Board for approval.

BD/11-12/074 Research Update

The Dean of Research, present by invitation, invited Board's attention to a number of research issues under the following headings:

(i) **Implementation of the College's Research Strategy**

The Dean of Research advised Board that although the College had continued to perform well in terms of research outputs it was critically important that it did not become complacent in this regard given the current challenges facing College. The Board noted that the Research Committee has identified a set of research themes which are expected to become the focus of interdisciplinary research over 18 key areas. It is envisaged that such research will have a greater international impact if undertaken in a co-ordinated manner across disciplines with an emphasis on issues of global significance.

The Dean of Research invited Board's attention to factors at national level which are relevant to the College's Research Strategy, including;

(a) **National Research Prioritisation Exercise**

The Board noted that the National Research Prioritisation Exercise is drawing to a conclusion and a report will be made to the Minister for Jobs, Enterprise and Innovation in due course. The focus of the exercise is to identify research areas which will bring economic benefit to the country in the short-medium term. The Dean of Research advised that he hoped the College will be in a position to contribute to research in the identified prioritised areas.

(b) **Review of Research Centres in Ireland**

The Board noted that a review of research centres in Ireland had identified the absence of applied research centres and that proposals are being discussed to create a small number of large research centres with a more applied focus.

(c) **Innovation Task Force**

The Board noted that the Innovation Task Force is currently reviewing the national guidelines on the use of intellectual property created through research.

(d) **Budget December 2011**

The Dean of Research advised Board that it is expected that exchequer funding for research will be reduced in the forthcoming budget and that this will have a direct impact on research income for the College. The Board noted that, at present, there is a high dependency on exchequer funding and there is a need to identify alternative income streams for research in order to support the implementation of the College's Research Strategy.

(ii) **Times Higher Education World University Ranking 2011**

The Dean of Research invited Board's attention to the outcome of the Times Higher Education university rankings for the College. He advised Board that the College had dropped from 76th place in 2010 to 117th place in 2011 noting the categories in which the ratings had increased and decreased over the previous year. The Board noted that although the scores had dropped in some categories the research impact of the College in terms of citation levels was at its highest level ever.

In the course of a discussion, Board members, noting the limitations of rankings, acknowledged their impact on universities' reputations and raised a number of factors which impact on the rankings and how the College should address these in a constructive way to improve its standing world-wide. In particular it was noted that the College should be more pro-active in publicising its positive ratings and their impact on student experience and the quality of teaching and research.

In response to the issues raised, the Dean of Research advised Board that there could be case for the College to carry out its own benchmarking on certain criteria. The Board noted that whether undergraduate programmes

should compensate for deficiencies in the Leaving Certificate outcomes is being addressed by a working group at present and that wider reputational issues will be addressed by the Global Relations Strategy and Communication Strategy which will be presented to Board in due course. The Dean of Research advised Board that the Research Committee will launch a number of initiatives to support diversification of research funding, possibly including staff being placed in Schools to assist academics with research funding applications.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that a ranking strategy sub-group has been established to examine all elements of the ranking criteria and the Board agreed that, while addressing these issues in an appropriate manner should be part of the College's strategic plan, the College's place in international rankings should not drive College strategy.

The Provost thanked the Dean of Research for his presentation.

BD/11-12/075 University Council

The Board confirmed the Acta of the University Council from its meeting held on 21 October 2011 and 26 October 2011 subject to further comments covering CL/11-12/029, 032(i), 034, 035(i), 036, 043, 044:

CL/11-12/029 Thomas Mitchell Chair in Cognitive Neuroscience The Board confirmed the recommendation of Council from its meeting of 21 October 2011 and appointed the named candidate to the Chair, from a date to be agreed.

CL/11-12/032(i) Internationalisation of Academic Titles

Noting the views of Board members regarding inconsistency in the use of the new academic titles and the potential adverse affect this could have on the College's international reputation, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that the Implementation Working Group is due to meet in the coming weeks to establish a consistent practice for use of academic titles approved by Council and Board during the last academic year.

CL/11-12/034 International Study Centre

In response to a query, the Senior Lecturer advised Board that ten students coming from Africa, Asia and South America are currently registered on the Foundation Year in the International Study Centre (September 2011 intake) with the intention of making an application to Trinity for admission in 2012/13.

CL/11-12/035(i) Review of the Office of the Vice-Provost

The Board noted that a schedule for the review of all areas under the remit of the Chief Operating Officer had been agreed

CL/11-12/036 Academic Appeals Committee The Board confirmed the decision of the University Council to accept the recommendations of the Academic Appeals Committee from its meetings of 27, 28, 29, 30 September and 6 October 2011.

BD/11-12/076 Christmas Tree

Under Other Business, the Bursar advised Board that a philanthropic donation had been made to the College which will enable a Christmas Tree to be placed in the Front Square every year for the next five years.

BD/11-12/077 College Student Services

Under Other Business, the Students' Union Welfare Officer paid tribute to the College's Student Services for their support to the class of a recently deceased student.

BD/11-12/078 Croke Park Agreement

Under Other Business, the Board noted Dr McGinley's request for the College to consider an extension of the deadline to 27 December 2011 by which date those intending to retire under the terms of the Croke Park Agreement must give notice to the College of their intention to do so.

SECTION B**BD/11-12/079 Audit Committee**

The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Audit Committee from its meeting of 5 October 2011, noting in particular:

AC/11-12/03 Matters Arising

The Board noted that the Audit Committee had welcomed the strengthening of the arrangements for the approval of the Provost's expenses.

AC/11-12/11 Review of Purchasing Cards

The Board noted that upon review it was found that the operation of purchasing cards presented a specific low risk to the College and that it was hoped this would be resolved by the introduction of the new Financial Information System.

AD/11-12/15 Audit Committee Terms of Reference and Internal Audit Charter

The Board noted and approved the updated Audit Committee Terms of Reference and Internal Audit Charter as presented.

BD/11-12/080 College Safety Committee

The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the College Safety Committee from its meeting of 19 May 2011, noting in particular:

SA/10-11/32 - Revised Smoking Policy

The Board noted and approved the Revised Smoking Policy as presented. The Registrar advised Board of the advantages of the revised policy from both a health and reputational perspective.

SECTION C

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

BD/11-12/081 Board By-Election - Fellows and Fellow Professors Constituency

The Board received a report from the Secretary to the College, dated 3 November 2011 and noted that Professor C O'Farrelly had been elected to membership of the Board for the remainder of the academic year 2011-2012, in place of Professor S Allwright following her appointment as Registrar.

BD/11-12/082 Higher Degrees

The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 26 October 2011, as circulated.

BD/11-12/083 Proctors' Lists for Autumn Commencements

The Board noted that the Proctors' Lists were approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 1 November 2011.

BD/11-12/084 Prizes and Other Awards**(i) Entrance Exhibitions 2011**

The Board noted and approved a report from the Senior Lecturer, circulated, dated 3 November 2011;

(ii) Marian Lynch Medal The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Administrator, School of Social Work and Social Policy, circulated, dated 10 October 2011.**(iii) American Arbitration Association/Rory Brady Prize for Excellence in International Conflict Management (Calendar T41)**

The Board noted and approved the following additional paragraph:

'In order to compete for the American Arbitration Association/Rory Brady Prize for Excellence in International Conflict Management, candidates must submit an essay on any aspect of conflict resolution to the Law School by 4.00 pm on the first Friday in Hilary Term. The winner shall be chosen by a prize review committee consisting of four members of the Law School staff, two practising members of the Irish Bar and a representative of the American Arbitration Association'.

(iv) Mackey Wilson Fund

The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Senior Tutor, circulated, dated 14 October 2011;

(v) Jean Montgomery Fund

The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Senior Tutor, circulated, dated 14 October 2011.

BD/11-12/085 Reporting to Board on Member Companies

The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Secretary, circulated, dated 1 November 2011.

BD/11-12/086 Policy for the Management of Legal Cases and Legal Costs

The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Secretary, circulated, dated 1 November 2011.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

BD/11-12/087 Membership of Board Sub-Committees

The Board noted a memorandum from the Provost, circulated, dated 2 November 2011, and approved that the membership of the Board Sub-Committee on Higher Degrees, and the Sub-Committee established to approve the Proctors' lists for Commencements should comprise:

- Provost
- Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer
- Registrar

BD/11-12/088 Headship of School of Religions, Theology and Ecumenics

The Board noted that Professor A Fitzpatrick had resigned from the headship of the School of Religions, Theology and Ecumenics.

BD/11-12/089 Promotions (see Minute BD/11-12/040 of 12 October 2011)

The Board noted a memorandum from the Director of Human Resources, circulated, dated 20 October 2011.

SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

Signed:

Date: