

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 3 March 2010

<i>Present</i>	Provost (Dr J Hegarty), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Dr P J Prendergast), Registrar (Dr J Barkhoff), Bursar (Dr M M O'Mahony), Dr S P A Allwright, Ms G Clarke, Ms M A Coffey, Mr A Cooke, Mr W J Dowling, Mr R Hodson, Dr E Mac Cárthaigh, Dr K J McGinley, Ms P Murphy, Mr C Ó Broin, Dr D O'Neill, Dr A J Piesse, Dr H J Rice, Dr S M Ryan, Dr D M Singleton, Dr J K Vij.
<i>Apologies</i>	Senior Lecturer (Dr A Douglas), Mr C Cashman, Mr P G Connell, Dr A McElligott, Dr J F McGilp, Dr E J O'Halpin, Mr B Sweeney.
<i>In attendance</i>	Ms S Mac Bride.
<i>(ex officio)</i>	Secretary to the College, Treasurer.
<i>(by invitation)</i>	Interim Chief Operating Officer.

SECTION A

- BD/09-10/151 Minutes** The minutes of the meeting held on 3 February 2010 were approved and signed subject to the following amendments:
- BD/09-10/126(ii) Employment Control Framework** The last sentence of the minute was amended to read "Noting the potential industrial relations issues which may result from a reduction in staff numbers, and the fact that its adoption will not compromise the College's autonomy, the Board, noting that it would be updated on further contacts between the IUA and HEA, agreed to implement the framework for 2010."
- BD/09-10/152 Matters Arising from the Minutes** A number of matters arising from the minutes were discussed and have been recorded below, (see minutes BD/09-10/153, 154, 155, 156, 157, 158 below).
- BD/09-10/153 Student Charge (see minute BD/09-10/123 of 3 February 2010)** The Provost advised Board that the Working Group had completed its proposals on the Student Charge and a report will be considered by the Finance Committee and then presented to Board.
- BD/09-10/154 Trinity Academic Medical Centre (TAMC) (see minute BD/09-10/126(i) of 3 February 2010)** The Provost advised Board that it was hoped to present the names of the nominees for the TAMC Committee to the next Board Meeting.
- BD/09-10/155 Board Elections 2010 - External Board Members (see minute BD/09-10/126(iii) of 3 February 2010)** The Provost advised Board that the Sub-Committee of Board had met

to consider nominations for the Board nominated external member in accordance with the Trinity College Dublin (Charters and Letters Patent Amendment) Act, 2000. The Board approved the Committee's proposal to seek nominations from the following professional bodies:

- (i) Engineers Ireland;
- (ii) The Arts Council;
- (iii) The Royal Hibernian Academy;
- (iv) The Institute of Directors.

**BD/09-10/156 Appointment of the Chief Operating Officer (see minute BD/09-10/127 of 3 February 2010)** The Provost advised Board that Mr Frank Berigan, a member of the Administrative and Support Staff, had been nominated by the TCD Group of Unions to be appointed to the Search Committee for the appointment of the Chief Operating Officer.

The Board agreed that the Secretary would clarify previous practices in this regard with Dr McGinley prior to the next Board meeting.

**BD/09-10/157 Statutes Review - Draft Ordinance - Procedures for Choosing Future Provost - Electorate (see minute BD/09-10/129 of 3 February 2010)** The Provost advised Board that as the Ordinance on the Procedure for Choosing Future Provost had not received the assent of the Fellows, as previously agreed, the current Statute would remain in force. The Board noted that the restatement of the Statutes will be considered at a joint meeting of Board and Council on 10 March 2010.

In the course of a discussion the Board noted the views of some Board members, in particular the Student members, that an opportunity had been lost to widen the electorate and to create a more inclusive College community. The Board also noted views that the correct result had been achieved and that the provisions in the current Statute were satisfactory.

**BD/09-10/158 Site and Facilities Committee (see minute BD/09-10/133 of 3 February 2010)** The Provost advised Board that the issues surrounding the renaming of a lecture theatre to honour Ernest Walton were nearing resolution.

**BD/09-10/159 Provost's Report** The Provost invited Board's attention to the following matters:

- (i) **Appointment of Associate Dean of Research** The Provost, noting that the Dean of Research currently operates without any direct operational support, sought Board approval for the appointment of an Associate Dean of Research. The Board noted that the reactivation of this role would greatly assist the Dean of Research given his significant workload arising from the implementation of the Strategic Plan and approved the nomination of Dr Patrick Geoghegan to this position.
- (ii) **Banking Concession** The Treasurer advised Board that, following a successful tender process which resulted in three expressions of interest, Bank of Ireland had been awarded the contract for the operation of a banking concession on campus. The Board noted that the contract is due to commence on 1 July 2010 and provides for the Bank operating initially in two outlets on campus, with a planned move to a new purpose-built facility in the new Student Centre in the future. In response to a query, the Treasurer clarified that the College would continue to receive rental income from the two existing outlets on campus in addition to the concession.

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*

Noting the terms of the contract between the College and Bank of Ireland, the Board noted the President of the Students' Union's request that a percentage of any revenue generated by virtue of the concession be contributed to the new Student Centre.

The Board thanked the Treasurer, his staff and all those involved in the tender process.

- (iii) **Grade Inflation** The Provost invited Board's attention to the recent debate in the media surrounding the issue of grade inflation. The Provost advised Board that a paper had been presented by the Academic Secretary to University Council at its meeting on 25 November 2009 (Actum CL/09-10/051 refers). The Board noted that Council had requested the Undergraduate Studies Committee to consider the matter and report back to it as soon as possible. The Board also noted that the IUA is addressing the fact that the Health Professions Admission Test (HPAT) cannot currently be taken through the medium of Irish.

**BD/09-10/160 Strategic Plan - Risk factors and costs associated with Strategic Plan actions** The Vice Provost/Chief Academic Officer invited Board's attention to a memorandum dated 26 February 2010 and a table cross-referencing the actions of the Strategic Plan to the College's High-Level Risk Register which had been circulated. He advised Board that each action had an indicative costing and that these costs have been divided into the following three categories:

- (i) actions for which the financing is obtained centrally in the College;
- (ii) actions for which there are no incremental costs;
- (iii) actions for which costs are met through carrying out the action itself with the intention that the incremental revenue will be greater than the incremental cost.

The Vice Provost/Chief Academic Officer, noting that Schools have been issued with guidelines for the implementation of the Strategic Plan, advised Board that he had met with the Heads of Schools together with the relevant Faculty Dean and the Academic Secretary to discuss development of School strategic plans. Completion of these plans will be the next milestone in the College's strategic planning. The Board noted that a similar exercise is being carried out in Administrative and Support Areas under the stewardship of the Interim Chief Operating Officer.

In the course of a discussion the Vice Provost/Chief Academic Officer and the Interim Chief Operating Officer clarified a number of issues raised by Board members, including that:

- (i) internal governance is linked to the management of reputational risk and the College Secretary is responsible for the implementation of the associated actions;
- (ii) detailed financial plans will be derived for each action in the Plan as Schools/Administrative Areas strategic planning proceeds;
- (iii) a potential decline in the quality of teaching and research due to reducing resources is identified as a risk which will have to be addressed in the implementation stage;
- (iv) it will be a challenge to balance the successful implementation of the actions with the necessity to reduce overall costs;
- (v) it is recognised that some of the Strategic Plan actions do not now have funding in place for the duration of the Plan, particularly in the area of student services, noting that ongoing funding will be addressed in the context of the College's overall budget.

The Provost thanked the Vice Provost/Chief Academic Officer and Interim Chief Operating Officer and advised that the risks and costs will be reviewed regularly in light of the changing economic climate.

**BD/09-10/161 Report from the Planning Group** The Vice Provost/Chief Academic Officer invited Board's attention to a memorandum dated 23 February 2010 which had been circulated. He advised Board that the Planning Group had been meeting fortnightly with the objective of creating a plan to ensure that a strategic approach would be taken to the use of current financial resources in light of the current economic climate. The Board noted the progress of the Planning Group in implementing the recommendations contained in their first report (see minute BD/08-09/313 of 8 July 2009) and the scheduled work programme to carry out the current recommendations. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer invited Board's attention to the recommendations from the Planning Group under the following headings:

- (i) Strategic Planning;
- (ii) Introduction of the new Resource Planning Model;
- (iii) Income generation;
- (iv) Cost Management;
- (v) Governance of Areas outside Faculties/Chief Operating Officer;
- (vi) SFI OIP 2010.

The Board noted that the recommendations had been considered by the Finance Committee at its meeting on 24 February 2010 (minute FN/09-10/46 refers) and had received the endorsement of Executive Officers. The Board also noted that, where necessary, a separate policy document will be presented to the relevant Principal Committees for review prior to their consideration by Board.

In the course of a detailed discussion, a number of issues were raised by Board members including that:

- (a) the College should consider the introduction of a Voluntary Early Retirement Scheme;
- (b) an increase in fees for post-graduate courses will place pressure on students who are funded by SFI;
- (c) the additional charge for use of suppliers other than preferred suppliers could have an adverse affect on areas where supply needs change rapidly.

In response to the issues raised, the Treasurer advised Board that the recommendation relating to procurement would deliver significant savings for the College and that all related procedures will be communicated to the College community. He noted that the policy was not intended to include specialist equipment in specific academic areas. The Board noted that all current research funded posts have been included in staff numbers for the purposes of staff planning in the future.

The Provost thanked the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer and the Board approved the recommendations of the Planning Group as set out in section 5 of the report.

**BD/09-10/162 Fellowship 2010** The Board noted the nominations to Fellowship as presented by the Provost.

**BD/09-10/163 University Council** The Board confirmed the Acta of the University Council from its meeting held on 17 February 2010 subject to further comments covering CL/09-10/106, 116, 117 (Items from Section D in the Acta are set out in Section D of these minutes).

## SECTION B

**BD/09-10/164 Finance Committee** The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Finance Committee from its meeting of 24 February 2010, with particular reference to:

**FN/09-10/44 Procurement** The Board noted an amendment to the Procurement Policy introducing a charge for non-compliance with the College's preferred supplier agreements on the first day of Michaelmas Term 2010.

**BD/09-10/165 Student Services Committee (see Actum CL/09-10/106 OF 17 February 2010)** The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Student Services Committee from its meeting of 3 November 2009 subject to the following amendment:

**SS/09-10/24 Any Other Business** The second sentence was amended to read "A study had been done by an MBA student on internationalization in College."

## SECTION C

**BD/09-10/166 Joint Meeting of Board and Council - Statutes Review** The Board noted that a joint meeting of Board and Council had been scheduled for 10 am on 10 March 2010 in the Innovation Academy, 3-4 Foster Place.

**BD/09-10/167 Dean of Students - Annual Report 2008/9 (see Actum CL/09-10/073 of 16 December 2009)** The Board noted the report from the Dean of Students, circulated, dated 2008/9.

**BD/09-10/168 Board Elections - Amendment to Regulations concerning Nomination Papers** The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Secretary to the College, circulated, dated 11 February 2010.

**BD/09-10/169 Higher Degrees** The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 17 February 2010.

**BD/09-10/170 Proctors' List for Extraordinary Commencements** The Board noted that the Proctors' List was approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 19 February 2010.

**BD/09-10/171 Senate Business**

(i) **Approval of New Degree Titles** The Board noted a memorandum from the Registrar, circulated, dated 25 February 2010 and approved the following:

(a) **Bachelor in Deaf Studies**

Latin Title: Baccalaureus in Studiis Surditatis

Abbreviation: B.St.Su.

Gown: Black

Hood: Black, lined with yellow

(b) **Bachelor in Science in Human Health & Disease**

Latin Title: Baccalaureus in Scientiis quae attinent ad hominum valetudinem

Abbreviation: B.Sc. (Hom. Val.)

Gown: Black

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*

- Hood: Dark green, lined with black
- (c) **Law & Political Science**  
 Latin Title: Baccalaureus in Utroque Jure una cum Scientia Politica  
 Abbreviation: LL.B. (Pol. Sc.)  
 Gown: Black  
 Hood: Black, lined with white
- (d) **Law & Business**  
 Latin Title: Baccalaureus in Utroque Jure una cum Studiis Negotialibus  
 Abbreviation: LL.B. (B.S.)  
 Gown: Black  
 Hood: Black, lined with white
- (e) **Bachelor in Science in Human Nutrition & Dietetics (joint degree program with DIT)**  
 Latin Title: Baccalaureus (Coniunctim) in Scientiis una cum Arte Alimentaria et Diatetica  
 Abbreviation: B.Sc. (Hum. Nut. & Diet.)  
*Academic Dress to be agreed with the Dublin Institute of Technology.*
- (ii) **Approval to alter name in which graduate was admitted to degree** The Board noted a memorandum from the Registrar, circulated, dated 24 February 2010 and approved that the name of Olivia Sophie von dem Bussche (B.A., 5 November 2009) should be changed in the Register of Alumni to 'Olivia Sophie von dem Bussche-Ippenburgh'.

**BD/09-10/172 External Relations - Economic and Social Research Institute (see BD/09-10/122of 3 February 2010)** The Board noted the representatives of the ESRI to serve on the Steering Committee to implement the agreement between the College and Institute.

Professor P O'Connell  
 Professor J Williams  
 Professor A Barrett

**BD/09-10/173 Dublin Dental Hospital - Governance Arrangements** The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, circulated, dated 23 February 2010.

**BD/09-10/174 Representation - Marino Institute of Education Board** The Board noted and approved the appointment of Professor D J Dickson as the College nominee on the Board of the Marino Institute of Education, in place of Dr Dermot McAleese.

**BD/09-10/175 Senior Fellowship** The Board noted that Dr T J Foster had been co-opted to Senior Fellowship, following the retirement of Dr J M Scott.

**BD/09-10/176 Agreements/MOU**

- (i) **Agreement - Wellcome Trust** The Board noted that an Agreement relating to the terms and conditions of an award from the Wellcome Trust for the Clinical Research Facility at St James's Hospital, Dublin was signed on 16 July 2009;
- (ii) **A memorandum of Understanding - TCD and National Rehabilitation Hospital** The Board noted that a Memorandum of Understanding was signed in July-August 2009 between TCD and the NRH for co-operation in teaching and research.

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*

**BD/09-10/177 Annual Report 2008-2009 - National Digital Research Centre** The Board noted the annual report of the NDRC  
[http://www.ndrc.ie/fileadmin/user\\_uploads/documents/NDRC\\_AnnualReport\\_download.pdf](http://www.ndrc.ie/fileadmin/user_uploads/documents/NDRC_AnnualReport_download.pdf)

**BD/09-10/178 Sealings** The Board noted Sealings, as set out in Appendix 1 to this minute.

**BD/09-10/179 Prizes - Calendar Part 1 - School of Pharmacy and Pharmaceutical Sciences** The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Director of Teaching and Learning (Undergraduate), circulated, dated 22 February 2010.

**BD/09-10/180 Revised Borrowing Framework (approved by Finance Committee on 24 February 2010)** The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Treasurer dated 25 February 2010 and Revised Borrowing Framework, dated 22 September 2009, circulated, as required by the Higher Education Authority.

**BD/09-10/181 Students' Union - Sabbatical Officers 2010-2011** The Board noted that the following have been elected:

- President: Mr N Trigoub-Rotnem\*
- Education Officer: Ms J Fox\*
- Welfare Officer: Ms S Fleming\*
- Communications Officer: Mr T Lowe
- Entertainments Officer: Mr D Genockey

\*members of Board 2010-2011

[Minute added to the record 5/5/10]

**BD/09-10/186 Scholarship - Intermission of Foundation and Non-Foundation Scholarship** The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Senior Lecturer, circulated, circulated, dated 22 February 2010.

**SECTION D**

**In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.**

Signed: .....

Date: .....

Appendix 1 to Minute BD/09-10/178

**Sealings**

9 February 2010

**TILDA - Additional space licensed from UCC and CIT**

The Seal of the College was put in triplicate to a Licence Agreement for additional space at Copley Court, Copley Street Cork for use by the TILDA research project between University College Cork and Cork Institute of Technology of the one part and the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin of the other part.

9 February 2010

**Purchase Deed - Pearse Street Garda Station**

The Seal of the College was put in duplicate to a Purchase Deed for the ground rent of Pearse Street Garda Station between the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and the Commissioners of Public Works in Ireland.