

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 3 February 2010

<i>Present</i>	Provost (Dr J Hegarty), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Dr P J Prendergast), Senior Lecturer (Dr A Douglas), Registrar (Dr J Barkhoff), Bursar (Dr M M O'Mahony), Dr S P A Allwright, Mr C Cashman, Ms G Clarke, Ms M A Coffey, Mr P G Connell, Mr W J Dowling, Mr R Hodson, Dr A McElligott, Dr J F McGilp, Dr K J McGinley, Mr C Ó Broin, Dr E J O'Halpin, Dr D O'Neill, Dr H J Rice, Dr S M Ryan, Dr D M Singleton, Mr B Sweeney, Dr J K Vij.
<i>Apologies</i>	Mr A Cooke, Dr E Mac Cárthaigh, Ms P Murphy, Dr A J Piesse.
<i>In attendance</i>	Ms S Mac Bride.
<i>(ex officio)</i>	Secretary to the College, Treasurer.
<i>(by invitation)</i>	Interim Chief Operating Officer. The Senior RPM/FECP Accountant (for BD/09-10/128) Dean of Research (for BD/09-10/128) Dr E O'Dell (for BD/09-10/129) Director of Buildings (for BD/09-10/130)

SECTION A

BD/09-10/120 Minutes

- (i) **8 December 2009** The minutes of the meeting held on 8 December 2009 were approved and signed subject to the following amendments:
 - (a) **BD/09-10/083(i) Strategic Plan Update** The following was inserted after the second sentence of the minute: "The Board noted Dr O'Neill's comments in relation to School and Discipline governance which had been raised at the Board meeting held on 7 October 2009, and which will need to be addressed in the context of the implementation of the Strategic Plan".
 - (b) **BD/09-10/095 Personnel and Appointments Committee** The words "Faculty Deans" were replaced with "Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer".
- (ii) **27 January 2009** The minutes of the meeting held on 27 January 2010 were approved and signed.

BD/09-10/121 Matters Arising from the Minutes A number of matters arising from the minutes were discussed and have been recorded below, (see minutes BD/09-10/122, 123, 124, 125 below).

BD/09-10/122 External Relations - Economic and Social Research Institute (see minute BD/09-10/082 of 8 December 2009) The Board approved the nomination of:

- (i) Professor Michael Marsh;
- (ii) Professor Philip Lane;
- (iii) Dr Virpi Timonen;

as College representatives on the Steering Committee responsible for the implementation of the agreement between the College and the ESRI.

BD/09-10/123 Student Charge (see minute BD/09-10/083(iii) of 8 December 2009) The Provost advised Board that the members of the IUA Council had attended the Joint Oireachtas Committee on Education and Science on 28 January 2010, noting that it had been acknowledged in the course of that meeting that the student charge is considered a fee. The Board agreed to the establishment of a Working Party of Board to develop proposals in the context of the existing framework of good practice for the provision of student services and to report to Board through the Finance Committee. The Board approved the following membership of the Working Party:

Dean of Students (Chair)
President of the Students' Union
Two representatives of the Students' Union
Treasurer
Senior Lecturer
Interim Chief Operating Officer
Chair of the Student Services Committee

The President of the Students' Union, acknowledging that the student charge was a national issue, welcomed the opportunity to work in a constructive manner with the Working Party.

BD/09-10/124 Strategic Plan Update (see minute BD/09-10/083(i) of 8 December 2009) The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that a memorandum outlining the implementation and funding arrangements of the Strategic Plan 2010-2014 will be presented to the next Board meeting. He further advised that he had scheduled meetings with each School Executive in order to develop School strategy and operational plans.

In response to a query, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that while specific wording proposed by Board members had not been included in the final version of the Strategic Plan all issues which had been raised had been fully addressed in the final document. He stated that detailed concerns raised by Board members would be addressed in the implementation of the plan.

BD/09-10/125 Pension Matters (see minute BD/09-10/078 of 8 December 2009) Noting that the delegation of discretions relating to retirement at age 60 and added years at age 65 is provided for in the Financial Matters (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 2009, the Board agreed that the Interim Chief Operating Officer will report to Board in relation to any progress which has been made to secure the future delegation and exercise of these discretions.

BD/09-10/126 Provost's Report The Provost invited Board's attention to the following matters:

- (i) **Trinity Academic Medical Centre (TAMC)** - The Provost advised Board that the Boards of St James's Hospital and the Adelaide & Meath Hospital, Dublin Incorporating the National Children's Hospital (AMNCH) had indicated their participation in the proposed TAMC. The Provost invited Board's attention to a

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

memorandum from the Vice-Provost for Medical Affairs dated 27 January 2010, which had been circulated (see minute BD/09-10/134 below) outlining amendments to the draft collaborative agreement. Noting that further amendments may be necessary, the Board agreed to review all amendments when the final draft collaborative agreement is presented to it for approval.

Noting the need for consultation with School of Nursing and Midwifery and the Therapy disciplines in the operation of the TAMC, the Provost advised that the Board would be presented with nominations for the TAMC Committee at its next meeting. The Board noted that clarification is required on the funding arrangements for the TAMC in the expectation that additional resources will not be required from central College funds to support the initiative

- (ii) **Employment Control Framework (ECF)** The Provost invited Board's attention to a presentation on the HEA's proposed Employment Control Framework for 2010 and a memorandum from the HEA, which had been tabled.

The Board noted that a minimum of 6% reduction in the numbers of overall core staff will be required across the Higher Education sector by the end of 2010 compared with the numbers in place at 31 December 2008. The Provost advised Board that filling any posts under the terms of the framework will be conditional on an institution operating within a balanced budget and having an agreed plan with the HEA for the elimination of any accumulated deficits. The Board noted the recruitment procedures in relation to posts resourced by core funding and non-exchequer funding as outlined in the ECF.

The Provost also stated that as adoption of the proposed ECF appears to be in conformity with Section 25 of the Universities Act its implementation would not affect the autonomy of the College.

The Provost advised Board that the Planning Group will consider the implications of the framework on staff numbers and that the Board will be in a position to consider the issue of promotions once details of the annual budget have been received.

In the course of a detailed discussion, the Provost clarified the following issues:

- (a) the 6% reduction in staff numbers applies across the sector, and each institution will be advised separately by the HEA of their target reduction;
- (b) the HEA has yet to clarify how it will engage with the sector on a number of ECF requirements;
- (c) the IUA will continue to communicate with the HEA on the implementation of the framework;
- (d) there will be a risk to the level of services which the College can provide due to decreasing numbers of staff and increasing student numbers.

Noting the potential industrial relations issues which may result from a reduction in staff numbers, and the fact that its adoption will not compromise the College's autonomy, the Board, noting that it would be updated on further contacts between the IUA and HEA, agreed to implement the framework for 2010.

- (iii) **Board Elections 2010 - External Board Members** The Provost advised Board that the external members of Board would end their term as Board members at the end of the current academic year and he paid tribute to their contributions during their term of office. These positions will be filled under the procedures defined in the Trinity College, Dublin (Charters and Letters Patent Amendment) Act 2000.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

- (a) **Government nominee** The Board noted that the Provost will consult with the Minister of Education and Science to appoint one new external Board member.
- (b) **Board appointed nominee** The Board approved the nomination of Ms Coffey and Dr Vij to the Board Sub-Committee to appoint the second external member, noting that this Sub-Committee will be chaired by the Provost and that the Secretary will act as its secretary.

The Interim Chief Operating Officer withdrew from the meeting

BD/09-10/127 Appointment of the Chief Operating Officer The Provost invited Board's attention to a memorandum dated 27 January 2010, which had been circulated. He advised Board that, following the introduction of the Employment Control Framework, the College was now in a position to fill the post of Chief Operating Officer. Noting the job description and schedule for filling the post, the Provost advised Board that the terms of reference developed for the initial appointment had now been modified to include a stronger focus on: optimization of operations to achieve greater efficiency and value for money; delivery of e-strategy; and the provision of motivational and coordinating leadership.

In response to a query the Provost advised that the job specification would be amended to reflect the fact that the position of Chief Operating Officer was that of Head of Administrative and Support Areas.

The Board agreed to the following nominations for the Search Committee as proposed by the Provost:

Provost (Chair)
 Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer
 Professor Shane Allwright
 Mr John Healy (ex-CEO, Atlantic Philanthropies)
 Mr David Allen (University of Exeter)
 Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences
 Professor Jane Ohlmeyer

The Board agreed that the proposal to include a member of the Administrative and Support Staff as an additional member of the Search Committee would be addressed by way of a nomination from the TCD Group of Unions.

The Interim Chief Operating Officer rejoined the meeting

The Provost withdrew from the meeting and the Registrar assumed the chair.

BD/09-10/128 Research Matters - Research Quality Metrics (see Actum CL/09-10/098 of 20 January 2010) The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer invited Board's attention to a memorandum dated 27 January 2010, which had been circulated. He advised Board that the Research Quality Metrics Group, established by Board, had met on four occasions and had consulted with various groups in the College including Directors of Research and the Faculty Deans. He further advised that the draft proposed metrics had been presented at the Research Committee and to the University Council (see Actum CL/09-10/098 of 20 January 2010).

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer invited Board's attention to the draft research quality metrics under the following headings:

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

- (i) Component 1 - staff meeting agreed criteria for research. The Board noted the proposed criteria for the allocation of funds taking into account both the quality and quantity of research.
- (ii) Component 2 - weighted competitive research expenditure.
- (iii) Component 3 - School selected research objectives.

The Dean of Research, present by invitation, invited Board's attention to a presentation noting that the proposed draft research quality metrics are intended to address the perceived inadequacies in ARAM, align with the College's Strategic Plan and provide a practical solution to research funding allocation. He advised Board that Component 1 provided the additional benefit of maintaining current RSS profiles for external reporting purposes. The Board noted the use of weighted competitive research expenditure as a proxy of quality in Component 2. The Dean of Research advised Board that Component 3 would be determined by linking funding to School performance by setting five objectives comprising of a mix of global and local criteria of which at least two would be advanced by the School.

In the course of a detailed discussion, the following issues were raised by Board members:

- (iv) the metric does not provide any reward for excellence in teaching at undergraduate or postgraduate levels;
- (v) Schools' objectives have a weighting of 50% which results in a high risk for those which fail to met all objectives;
- (vi) there is significant risk to high performing Schools by using 5% per annum increases as a criterion for increased funding;
- (vii) there is a risk of statistical error in establishing metrics based on small numbers;
- (viii) risk assessment is not included in the document;
- (ix) based on Schools' objectives, high levels of funding will be allocated based on untested metrics;
- (x) the metric could be advantageous to small Schools that cannot recruit large numbers of research students;
- (xi) the metrics must be formulated in the context of the current economic climate and the uncertainty of future funding;
- (xii) the Working Group did not consult directly with Heads of School in preparing the document;
- (xiii) the Faculty Deans have a strong role in setting research criteria and Heads of School should have more autonomy in this regard;
- (xiv) the thrust of proposals is biased in favour of science and engineering disciplines and militates against research practice in the arts and humanities areas.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer noted correspondence received from the Faculty of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences expressing concern at the applicability of the proposals to their disciplines. In response to the issues raised, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, the Dean of Research and the Senior RPM/FECF Accountant clarified a number of technical issues including that:

- (xv) the Schools' objectives will be weighted using research criteria;
- (xvi) there will be a monitoring system in place to assess the effectiveness of using 5% per annum increases;
- (xvii) teaching has not been included in the metrics as 70% of RPM deals with allocation of funds based on student numbers.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that the Working Group will consult with the Heads of School and bring further proposals to Board taking into account the issues raised by Board members, in particular addressing concerns in relation to the criteria in Component 3. The Board noted that allocations under RPM will not take place until the criteria in Component 3 have been agreed, but that pilot simulations would be carried out in the interim period

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The Registrar thanked the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, the Dean of Research and the Senior RPM/FECP Accountant and invited Board members to submit detailed comments to the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer assumed the chair.

BD/09-10/129 Statutes Review - Draft Ordinance - Procedures for Choosing Future Provost - Electorate Dr O'Dell, present by invitation, invited Board's attention to a memorandum and draft Ordinance from the Statutes Review Working Party dated 29 January 2010, which had been circulated. He advised Board of the proposed amendments to Chapter XXVI as follows:

- (i) Section 17 will be replaced to define the new electoral categories;
- (ii) members of the Dublin Dental Hospital whose appointments have been confirmed by Council and Board will be included in Category 1 of the electorate;
- (iii) Section 18 will be replaced to provide for the procedures for the election and count.

In response to a query Dr O'Dell advised that Category II could be made less prescriptive as to the academic staff included in its membership with the current definition being described in a Schedule, which could be amended by Board at some future date should the need arise.

Noting the consultation process which had taken place with the Fellows, the Board approved the draft Ordinance including the proposed drafting amendments and agreed that it would be presented to the Fellows for assent. The Board noted that as previously agreed by Board (minute BD/09-10/029 of 14 October 2009 refers) should the assent of the Fellows not be forthcoming, the current Statute would remain in operation and agreed that this arrangement would be made clear in the correspondence with the Fellows.

Mr Dowling, Dr Singleton and Dr Vij dissented.

The Registrar thanked Dr O'Dell and the members of the Statutes Review Working Party.

BD/09-10/130 Property Purchase The Director of Buildings, present by invitation, invited Board's attention to a memorandum dated 25 January 2010 and a memorandum from the Treasurer dated 14 January 2010, which had been circulated. He advised Board that he and his staff, together with the College's property advisors, had conducted a thorough review of properties bordering the College which may prove to be a strategic investment for the College and that one particular property had been identified as meeting the College's objectives in this regard. Noting the recommendations of the Site and Facilities Committee (minute SF/09-10/18 of 19 January 2010 refers), the Director of Buildings advised Board that a named property would provide the College with revenue in the short term and in the future could be utilised to meet the College's space requirements.

The Treasurer advised Board of the funding arrangements and expected returns from the investment. In the course of a discussion, the Director of Buildings and the Treasurer clarified a number of technical issues raised by Board members. The Board agreed to the purchase of the building on the terms outlined.

BD/09-10/131 University Council The Board confirmed the Acta of the University Council from its meetings held on 16 December 2009 and 20 January 2010 subject to further comments covering CL/09-10/081, 082, 098 (Items from Section D in the Acta are set out in Section D of these minutes).

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

BD/09-10/132 Honorary Degrees The Board approved the nominations of the Advisory Committee on Honorary Degrees, as presented by the Registrar, noting that those approved will be conferred at Commencements ceremonies during 2009-2010 or as soon as possible thereafter.

SECTION B

BD/09-10/133 Site and Facilities Committee The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Site and Facilities Committee from its meeting of 19 January 2010, with particular reference to:

SF/09-10/18 Proposed Property Purchase The Board noted the recommendation of the Site and Facilities Committee to proceed with the proposed property purchase as outlined by the Director of Buildings.

SF/09-10/26 Naming of Theatre for Ernest Walton The Board noted that the Site and Facilities Committee had supported a proposal from the Provost to erect a statue of Ernest Walton in an appropriate location coupled with the naming of an appropriate lecture theatre. The Site and Facilities Committee had also suggested that an area between the Botany and Fitzgerald Buildings might be designated as the Walton Garden. The Board also noted that the Chair of the Standing Committee of Fellows had agreed to engage with the relevant Schools to facilitate a satisfactory outcome on the naming of lecture theatres which would be proposed to the Site and Facilities Committee. It was noted that a final recommendation would be presented to Board for approval in due course.

SECTION C

BD/09-10/134 Trinity Academic Medical Centre (see BD/09-10/081 of 8 December 2009) The Board noted a memorandum from the Vice-Provost for Medical Affairs, circulated, dated 27 January 2010, together with one revision to the document which had been tabled.

BD/09-10/135 Higher Degrees The Board noted Higher Degrees as circulated, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on:

- (i) 16 December 2009;
- (ii) 20 January 2010.

BD/09-10/136 Sealings The Board noted Sealings, as circulated, attached as Appendix 1 to this minute.

BD/09-10/137 Prizes and Other Awards

- (i) **Henry Flood Bequest** The Board noted and approved the award of the Henry Flood Scholarship for 2009-2010 to Trevor Herbert (04170601) (value €8,000).
- (ii) **Faculty of Health Sciences - Studentships 2009-2010** The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Medical Student and Intern Co-Ordinator, School of Medicine, circulated, dated 18 December 2009.
- (iii) **Additional Gold Medal Awards 2009 - Human Nutrition and Dietetics** The Board noted and approved the following awards
 - (a) Jessica Schram;
 - (b) Caoilean Murphy.
- (iv) **Visual and Performing Arts Fund** The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Provost, circulated, dated 26 January 2010.

BD/09-10/138 Bequests and Benefactions

- (i) **Trinity College Dublin Genetics Award Fund (Dawson Prize)** The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Treasurer, circulated, dated 22 January 2010;
- (ii) **Brian McMurry Prize** The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Treasurer, circulated, dated 11 January 2010.

BD/09-10/139 Committees - Coiste na Gaeilge - Terms of Reference The Board noted a memorandum from the Registrar, circulated, dated 20 January 2010 and approved the terms of reference of Coiste na Gaeilge.

BD/09-10/140 Trinity Long Room Hub - Amendment to Title The Board approved a request for a change in the title from 'Long Room Hub' to 'Trinity Long Room Hub' with the sub-title 'Trinity College Dublin's Arts and Humanities Research Centre'.

BD/09-10/141 Representation

- (i) **Dublin Institute of Technology** The Board noted and approved the nomination of the Registrar, *ex officio* as the College's representative on the sixth governing body of the Dublin Institute of Technology;
- (ii) **Irish Committee for Specialist Training in Dentistry** The Board noted and approved the following nominations to serve on the above committee for three years from 1 May 2010:
 - (a) Dean of Dental Affairs (Professor J Nunn);
 - (b) Director of Postgraduate Teaching and Learning (Dr C Healy);
 - (c) Alternate: Clinical Director: Dr M O'Sullivan.

BD/09-10/142 Senate Business

- (i) **Degrees of Master in Arts (*jure officii*)** The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Registrar, circulated, dated 27 January 2010;
- (ii) **Approval to alter names in which graduates were admitted to degrees** The Board noted a memorandum from the Registrar, circulated, dated 27 January 2010, and approved that the names of the following graduates should be changed in the Register:
 - (a) Khalid Ibrahim (M.Sc., 14 December 2001) to: Khalid Farhan Ibrahim;
 - (b) Sridhar Medishetty Kumar (BSc (Pharmacy) 13 February 2009) to: Sridhar Kumar Medishetty.

BD/09-10/143 Annual Reports - Directors' Reports and Financial Statements - year ended 31 December 2008 (see FN/09-0/39 of 16/12/09) The Board noted the following:

- (i) National Digital Research Centre Limited (NDRC);
- (ii) National Institute for Bioprocessing Research and Training Limited (NIBRT).

BD/09-10/144 Tutorship The Board noted and approved the request of the Senior Tutor that Dr P Coleman's chamber be changed from a half chamber to a full chamber to facilitate the appointment of a Tutor to the one term students.

BD/09-10/145 Dublin Institute for Advanced Studies/School of Physics - Memorandum of Understanding The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Registrar, circulated, dated 20 January 2010.

SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

Signed:

Date:

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

Sealings

9 December 2009

The University of Dublin Trinity College Dublin (Closed) Pension Scheme – Statutory Instrument

The Seal of the College was put to a Statutory Instrument in relation to the University of Dublin Trinity College Dublin (Closed) Pension Scheme between the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin, Tom Boland, Chief Executive Officer, An t-Údarás um Ard-Oideachas, Batt O'Keeffe, Minister for Education and Science and Brian Lenihan, Minister for Finance.

11 January 2010

Trinity Centre, St. James's Hospital – Unit 3.81 – Cellix Limited

The Seal of the College was put to a Licence Agreement for Unit 3.81, Trinity Centre, St. James's Hospital, between the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and Opsona Therapeutics Limited.

11 January 2010

Trinity Centre, St. James's Hospital – Units 2.09, 2.10 & 2.11 – Opsona Therapeutics

The Seal of the College was put to a Licence Agreement for Units 2.09, 2.10 and 2.11 Trinity Centre St. James's Hospital between the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and Opsona Therapeutics Limited.

11 January 2010

Trinity Technology and Enterprise Campus – Unit 2.4 – Cellix Limited

The Seal of the College was put in duplicate to a Licence Agreement for Unit 2.4 in the Trinity Technology and Enterprise Campus between the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and Cellix Limited.

11 January 2010

Trinity Technology and Enterprise Campus – Unit 6.1 – Da Capo Limited

The Seal of the College was put in duplicate to a Memorandum of Rent Review for Unit 6.1 in the Trinity Technology and Enterprise Campus between the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and Da Capo Limited.

11 January 2010

Trinity Technology and Enterprise Campus – Unit 3.7 – Alan Ardiffe Studio

The Seal of the College was put in duplicate to a Lease Agreement for Unit 3.7 in the Trinity Technology and Enterprise Campus between the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and Alan Ardiffe.