

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 16 September 2009

<i>Present</i>	Provost (Dr J Hegarty), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Dr P J Prendergast), Senior Lecturer (Dr A Douglas), Registrar (Dr J Barkhoff), Bursar (Dr M M O'Mahony), Dr S P A Allwright, Mr C Cashman, Ms G Clarke, Ms M A Coffey, Mr A Cooke, Mr P G Connell, Mr W J Dowling, Mr R Hodson, Dr E Mac Cárthaigh, Dr A McElligott, Dr J F McGilp, Dr K J McGinley, Ms P Murphy, Mr C Ó Broin, Dr E J O'Halpin, Dr A J Piesse, Dr S M Ryan, Mr B Sweeney.
<i>Apologies</i>	Dr D O'Neill, Dr H J Rice, Dr D M Singleton, Dr J K Vij.
<i>In attendance</i>	Ms S Mac Bride.
<i>(ex officio)</i>	Secretary to the College, Treasurer.
<i>(by invitation)</i>	Interim Chief Operating Officer.

The Provost welcomed the new Student Members attending their first Board meeting.

The Board noted with great sadness and regret the death on 13 September 2009 of Dr Gernot Biehler, Fellow and member of the School of Law.

SECTION A

BD/09-10/001 Minutes The minutes of the meeting held on 8 July 2009 were approved and signed subject to the following amendments:

BD/08-09/313 Planning Group - First Report On Page 3 the wording of point (d) was amended to read: 'following the decision to increase rent for on-campus accommodation for 2009/2010, further decisions in this regard would be deferred until the Director of Accommodation and Catering carried out a review of this matter in the context of external market forces in Michaelmas Term 2009.'

BD/08-09/316 Resource Planning Model (RPM) - Research Quality Metrics Under Principle 3 on Page 5 the following was inserted:
'(xi) projections of the effect of any proposed metrics on the RPM will be necessary to enable Board to make an informed decision, particularly regarding risk assessment.'

BD/08-09/319 Annual Office At the top of page 7 the first line was amended to note Dr J Graham as Senior Proctor.

BD/09-10/002 Matters Arising from the Minutes A number of matters arising from the minutes were discussed and have been recorded below, (see minutes BD/08-09/003, 004, 005, 006, 009 below).

- BD/09-10/003 Pension Matters (see minute BD/08-09/310 of 8 July 2009)** Board members expressed concern at the recent decision by one third level institution to withdraw previous offers of early retirement to staff. The Board noted the legitimate expectations of College staff in relation to the provisions of the College's pension scheme, including the option to retire at aged 60. Noting that negotiations are ongoing with the Department of Finance on this, and related matters, the Board recommended that every effort be made to resolve these issues before the arrangements for the transfer of the College's pension scheme's assets and liabilities are finalised.
- BD/09-10/004 Nominations for Appointment - Chairs (see minute BD/08-09/326 of 8 July 2009)** The Secretary advised Board that the preferred candidates for the Chair of Medieval and Renaissance Literature (1977) and the Chair of Theology (1980) had declined to take up the positions offered. The Board noted that discussions with the second appointable candidate for the former position are ongoing and as there was no second appointable candidate for the Chair of Theology, it would remain vacant for the present.
- BD/09-10/005 Nominations for Appointment - Secretary to the College and Treasurer (see minute BD/08-09/327 of 8 July 2009)** In response to a query, the Interim Chief Operating Officer advised Board that the process will continue to fill the vacant post of Director of Information Systems Services.
- BD/09-10/006 Resource Planning Model (RPM) - Research Quality Metrics (see minute BD/08-09/316 of 8 July 2009)** The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that three Board members: the Registrar, the Bursar and Dr Allwright had now been co-opted on to the Research Quality Metrics Working Group.
- BD/09-10/007 Outlook 2009-2010** The Provost, introducing his Outlook for 2009-2010, invited Board's attention to the importance of achieving the College's strategic goals in the context of the current external environment.

The Treasurer advised Board that the College expected a breakeven financial outturn for 2008/2009 having achieved significant reductions in expenditure. The Board noted that, as these savings were mainly opportunistic, it may be a challenge to embed ongoing reductions in the future. Noting the College's track record of prudent and effective financial management, the Treasurer advised Board that the College had managed its activities within its budgetary constraints resulting in effectively no accumulated recurrent deficit and a strong balance sheet. The Board noted that the Planning Group's Report was currently being implemented in an effort to stabilise the 2009/2010 financial position in the expectation of a reduction in the State Grant in 2010.

The Provost invited Board's attention to external factors affecting College and their associated risks, including:

1. Public finances.
2. Report from "An Bord Snip".
3. Employment control framework.
4. The report of the HE Steering Group expected before the end of 2009.
5. The pressure on the sector for knowledge transfer/commercialisation.
6. Innovation Task Force -TCD/UCD Alliance.

The Provost outlined the major decisions which the Board had taken in the previous year, the policy decisions taken by Council and the major capital projects undertaken by the College. Noting the importance of CAO statistics to strategic planning, the

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

Provost invited Board's attention to the profile of undergraduate admissions for 2009/2010 and the impact of newly introduced courses, noting in particular:

1. The strong performance in undergraduate admissions in 2009.
2. The high uptake of new courses introduced in 2009.
3. The significant increase in the number of applications to science and nursing courses.

The Provost, stressing the importance preserving the College's autonomy and independence, invited Board's attention to the Action Plan for 2009-2010 which will address the most critical risks facing the College:

- (i) **Employment control framework** - The Provost advised Board of the need to manage the employment control framework noting that the IUA is still in negotiation with the HEA regarding the terms of the framework and that the College had entered into discussion with the HEA on the applicability of the Incentivised Scheme for Early Retirement (ISER) within the College. The Interim Chief Operating Officer advised Board that the Pension Trustees will require assurance on the likely impact of ISER on the pension fund.

In the course of a brief discussion, Board members noted the implications that ISER would have in terms of a reduction in the staff/student ratio and the provision of services by College staff. The Board noted that staff availing of ISER may not be included in the required 3% reduction in staffing for 2009. It was noted that a further staff reduction of 3% per annum may be required over the coming years which would cause severe difficulties in delivering the College's academic programmes and support services. In response to issues raised, the Interim Chief Operating Officer advised that the College would continue to fulfil its contractual obligations to staff in relation to pay and conditions and that, at present, and further to the decision of Board (minute BD/08-09/279(ii) of 17 June 2009 refers), there would be no promotions in any grade. He stated that any industrial relations matters would be dealt with as they arise.

- (ii) **Implementing Council policies;**
- (iii) **Finalising Board issues, including**
Committee review;
Statutes review;
Provost's Appointment Procedures;
Strategic Plan.
- (iv) **Progressing e-strategy;**
- (v) **Progressing the administrative and service review;**
- (vi) **Trinity Academic Medical Centre (TAMC)** - The Board noted that the Vice-Provost for Medical Affairs would report to the Board on the status on the TAMC at the next meeting;
- (vii) **TCD/UCD Alliance** - The Board noted that agreement had been reached with Irish entrepreneurs in Silicon Valley, who will act as business mentors and provide capital funding for spin-off companies associated with the TCD/UCD Alliance;
- (viii) **Research** - Noting the importance of creating a knowledge economy, the Provost advised the Board of the need explore other sources of research funding in light of expected reductions in SSTI funding. The Provost also advised Board that previous plans to collaborate with the IMI would now not proceed;

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

- (ix) **Recent graduates** - Noting the need to provide support to recent graduates who have failed to secure employment, the Provost advised Board of plans to establish a graduate network which would allow graduates maintain links with the College.

In the course of a brief discussion, Board members noted the necessity of strategic savings over the coming year and working within budgetary constraints while maintaining the College's high academic standing and capitalising on the opportunity to contribute to the creation of a knowledge economy. The Provost invited Board's attention to the Board Agenda for 2009/2010.

BD/09-10/008 Draft Strategic Plan -2009-2014 The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer invited Board's attention to a memorandum dated 8 September 2009 and to the draft Strategic Plan, which had been circulated.

Noting that the Strategic Planning Group had engaged in a wide level of consultation throughout College, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that the Strategic Plan will act as a framework document setting out prioritised actions for College for the next five years. He invited Board's attention to the context in which the Strategic Plan was written including, public policy, the need to set realistic, achievable goals which match national targets and the current economic climate, noting that the plan must be adaptable to changes in those circumstances.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer outlined the draft chapters of the Strategic Plan, including:

1. Trinity's Strategy for the Future.
2. Education.
3. Knowledge Generation and Transfer.
4. Student Experience.
5. Engagement with Society.
6. Enabling the Strategy.
7. Implementing the Strategy.

In the course of a discussion, the following issues were raised by Board members:

- (i) it is important that the goals set are achievable in light of the current economic climate;
- (ii) there is a need to focus on the creation of a smart economy;
- (iii) there is a need to connect the Strategic Plan to our internal processes;
- (iv) the Plan should recognise the needs of society rather than focus solely on the economy;
- (v) the chapter on the student experience should emphasise students' contribution to developing this experience;
- (vi) equal emphasis should be placed on teaching and research throughout the Plan;
- (vii) the role of the student centre in enhancing student support services should be highlighted;
- (viii) a commitment to modernise the playing fields at Santry should be included in the Plan;
- (ix) it is important not to jeopardise the College's commitment to sustaining a multidisciplinary community by focussing only on income-generating courses.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer noted the comments made by Board members, advising that phrasing and style concerns will be addressed by a copy editor before the final version would come back to Board for approval at a special Board meeting to be held on 7 October 2009.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

BD/09-10/009 Student Case - Mental Health Issue (see BD/08-09/318 of 8 July 2009) The Secretary invited Board's attention to the decision which had been taken at the previous meeting to suspend a named student pending the fulfilment of a stated condition, noting that this decision had been taken in accordance with Section 43, Schedule II, Chapter XII of the Statutes. She stated that, in accordance with the Statutes, this issue will be kept under review by the Board from time to time and that the student will have the opportunity on each occasion to comment in advance of such consideration.

She invited Board's attention to a memorandum from the Junior Dean which stated that, to date, the stated condition on which the suspension was contingent had not yet been fulfilled. She also advised Board that the named student had appealed the Board's decision of 8 July 2009 to the Visitors and had submitted his case to the Chancellor on 20 August 2009. The Board noted that the Chancellor had devolved her power in this case to the next available Pro-Chancellor and that the student's case was now being forwarded to the Visitors for their consideration. The Secretary also advised Board that, in view of the fact that the named student had been suspended from College, the Dean of Graduate Studies had placed the student off-books pending the lifting of the suspension.

The Board confirmed the continuation of the student's:

- (i) suspension, pending the fulfilment of a stated condition;
- (ii) off-books status for the period of his suspension.

BD/09-10/010 Advisory Committee on Honorary Degrees The Board approved the nominations of the Advisory Committee on Honorary Degrees, as presented by the Registrar, noting that those approved will be conferred with Honorary Degrees at Commencements ceremonies during 2009-2010 or as soon as possible thereafter.

SECTION B

There was no business under this heading.

SECTION C

BD/09-10/011 Administrative Procedures - 13 July to 30 August 2009 The Board noted a memorandum from the Secretary, circulated, dated 7 September 2009. Nominations for appointment which had been approved are set out in appendix 1 to this minute.

BD/09-10/012 Proctors' Lists for Second Summer Commencements The Board noted that the Proctors' Lists were approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 7 July 2009.

BD/09-10/013 Deanship of Dental Affairs The Board noted the resignation of Professor N Claffey as Dean of Dental Affairs and approved the nomination of Professor J Nunn as Acting Dean to 30 April 2010.

BD/09-10/014 Draft Code of Practice Regarding the operation of Closed Circuit Television Cameras (CCTV) The Board approved the revised Draft CCTV Code of Practice, as circulated. The Board noted that the Group of Unions has indicated its acceptance of the Code and further noted that the Students' Unions had agreed to participate as members of the Monitoring Committee.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

BD/09-10/015 Calendar B140 - Disciplinary Committee (Student) The Board noted and approved the appointment of Ms M Alcock as Secretary to the Disciplinary Committee (Student) with effect from 7 September 2009.

BD/09-10/016 Bequests and Benefactions

- (i) **Estate of Professor George W P Dawson deceased** The Board noted that a final sum of €26,462.46 had been received from the finalisation of the estate of the late Professor G W P Dawson, as set out in a memorandum from the Treasurer, circulated, dated 7 August 2009;
- (ii) **Seamus Herity Bequest** The Board noted the bequest of a signed, limited edition framed print (690/1904, 52 cm x 73 cm), entitled *Rejoyce Dublin* by Martin Stuart Moore, from the estate of the late Mr Seamus Herity, former Senior Technical Officer in the School of Chemistry, who died on 14 July 2009;
- (iii) **Minchin Bursary - increase in value** The Board approved the increase in value of €2,000 in the Minchin Bursary as set out in a memorandum from the Treasurer, circulated, dated 7 August 2009;
- (iv) **Normanby Trust** The Board noted with appreciation the receipt of an amount of €250,000 from the Normanby Charitable Trust for the refurbishment of research space within the Moyne Institute of Preventive Medicine as set out in a memorandum from the Treasurer, circulated, dated 7 August 2009;
- (v) **Estate of Diana Simpson** The Board noted the receipt of GBP10,000 (€11,576.75) from the estate of the late Mrs Diana Simpson for the Library as set out in a memorandum from the Treasurer, circulated, dated 7 August 2009.

BD/09-10/017 Representation - National Digital Research Centre The Board noted and approved the nomination of Dr J Callaghan (Associate Director - Trinity Research and Innovation) as the College-nominated Board member of the NDRC (replacing Dr D Lloyd), with immediate effect.

BD/09-10/018 Committees - Advisory Committee on Honorary Degrees The Board noted and approved the nomination of Professor L Hogan and Professor C Begley (replacing Dr G McHugh and Professor M O'Moore) together with the nomination of Mr R Adams (representative of the administrative staff) and Ms A Murphy (postgraduate student representative) on the above committee.

SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

The following items on the agenda were withdrawn, pending consideration by the Finance Committee at a future meeting:

C.7

Annual Reports

- (i) HEAnet - Annual Report and Financial Statements 2008
- (ii) Molecular Medicine Ireland - Draft Directors' Report and Financial Statements, year ended 30 September 2008

Signed:

Date:

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings