

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 22 October 2008

<i>Present</i>	Provost (Dr J Hegarty), Senior Lecturer (Dr A Douglas), Registrar (Dr J Barkhoff), Bursar (Dr M M O'Mahony), Dr S P A Allwright, Ms G Clarke, Mr W J Dowling, Ms O S Foley, Mr R Hodson, Dr E Mac Cárthaigh, Dr A McElligott, Dr J F McGilp, Dr K J McGinley, Ms P Murphy, Dr E J O'Halpin, Dr D O'Neill, Dr A J Piesse, Mr C Reilly, Dr H J Rice, Dr S M Ryan, Dr D M Singleton, Mr M Slevin, Mr H Sullivan, Mr B Sweeney, Dr K Walshe.
<i>Apologies</i>	Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Dr P J Prendergast), Dr J K Vij.
<i>In attendance</i>	Ms S Mac Bride.
<i>(ex officio)</i>	Secretary (Acting), Treasurer (Acting).
<i>(by invitation)</i>	Chief Operating Officer Vice-Provost for Medical Affairs (BD/08-09/031, 032) Dean of Research (BD/08-09/035) Dean of Students (BD/08-09/038) Dr E O'Dell (BD/08-09/033, 034)

The Provost advised Board that Ms S Mac Bride, an Administrative Officer in the Secretary's Office, was in attendance to record the minutes of Board meetings.

SECTION A

**BD/08-09/026 Minutes** The minutes of the meeting held on 24 September 2008 were approved and signed subject to the following amendment:

- (i) Dr A McElligott was added to the Board Members in attendance at the meeting.

**BD/08-09/027 Matters Arising from the Minutes** A number of matters arising from the minutes were discussed and have been recorded below, (see minutes BD/08-09/028,029).

**BD/08-09/028 Outlook 2008-2009 (see minute BD/08-09/007 of 24 September 2008)** In response to a query, the Provost advised Board that issues in relation to the Board's Action Plan would be considered in his report to Board (minute BD/08-09/030 refers). He confirmed that proposals on cost savings would be presented to Board for approval in due course.

**BD/08-09/029 University Pension Schemes (see minute BD/08-09/004 of 24 September 2008)** The Acting Secretary invited Board's attention to minute FN/08-09/002 of the Finance Committee of 1 October 2008 for an update on the discussions in relation to the sector's pension schemes.

**BD/08-09/030 Provost's Report** The Provost invited Board's attention to the provisions made for the education sector in the Government's Budget noting in particular:

- (i) the increase in the student charge to €1500 as and from 2009/10;
- (ii) taking into account the block grant and the funds in lieu of fees, the recurrent grant shows no increase in real terms, which, together with unavoidable cost increases, results in a real decrease in current funding of 5.5% or €6 million;
- (iii) an increase in capital to cover committed projects and minor works;
- (iv) that it is likely that PRLTI will proceed.

The Board noted that the Strategic Innovation Fund had been reduced by 30% and that the planned 2009 increase in medical places would be deferred.

The Provost highlighted the need to address the decrease in funds and referred to the Action Plan which had been established last year, many elements of which have now been implemented including an increase in the number of undergraduate students and an increase in international students. The Provost stressed that the plan was now being accelerated and that the Vice-Provost is chairing a Funding Group which is looking at all aspects of the College's financial situation and determining what action needs to be taken. The Provost noted that proposals on how the College might achieve the required cost savings is expected in the coming weeks.

The Provost also advised Board that rationalisation within the sector is being considered by the Minister for Education and Science and that the Comptroller and Auditor General has been invited to carry out an audit of the sector.

The Provost invited Board's attention to the College's recent ranking as 49th in the world by the Times Higher Education Supplement. The Provost, noting the care with which such rankings should be interpreted, paid tribute to the College community and spoke of the challenges facing the College to maintain this level of achievement in the future.

**BD/08-09/031 Trinity Academic Medical Centre (TAMC)** Mr Sweeney, Chair of the TAMC Steering Group, noted that the objective of TAMC is to provide a centre of excellence in education and research as well as improved patient and community care. He advised Board that progress was being made and it was hoped that the initiative would be established on a firmer basis by early 2009.

The Vice-Provost for Medical Affairs/Head of the School of Medicine, present by invitation, stated that TAMC as an entity, would combine the strength of the College Medical School with the two teaching hospitals to provide excellent undergraduate and postgraduate courses, patient care and training of medical experts. He advised Board that this must be a united effort to achieve a high quality centre and bring maximum benefits to the College.

The Vice-Provost for Medical Affairs invited the Board's attention to the proposed Memorandum of Understanding and stated that it is expected to be signed by the end of this calendar year. He discussed the proposed service configuration and advised Board that the TAMC's legal advisors were currently examining the legal implications of drawing the three institutions into one entity and that they were of the opinion that new legislation may be necessary to achieve this.

The Vice-Provost for Medical Affairs advised Board that the best model from the College's point of view would be one based on academic leadership in order to attract and retain medical experts, noting that this would require the full co-operation of senior clinicians in the two hospitals. He also noted the importance of strong governance arrangements for the future success of the initiative.

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*

In response to queries from Board members, Mr Sweeney and the Vice-Provost for Medical Affairs advised that:

- (i) the legal framework of the TAMC would be sufficiently flexible to facilitate institutions being absorbed into it in the future;
- (ii) communicating with staff in the three participating institutions was a priority;
- (iii) the School of Medicine as part of the College will have to remain a distinct entity within the TAMC;
- (iv) a financial plan for the TAMC would be brought to Board in due course.

Mr Sweeney sought Board's approval for the appointment of an interim Chief Executive Officer of the TAMC who would, *inter alia*, act as the overall spokesperson for the Interim Executive.

The Board, approving this proposal, also approved the membership of the Nominating Committee as proposed with the addition of Dr Allwright subject to the approval of St. James's Hospital and the Adelaide and Meath Hospital, Dublin incorporating the National Children's Hospital. It was noted that this appointment will not incur any additional cost to the College.

**BD/08-08/032 Capital Funding - Nurse Education** The Vice-Provost for Medical Affairs, present by invitation, invited Board's attention to the Memorandum from the Dean of Health Sciences, dated 14 October 2008.

He advised Board that in order to meet the requirements of undergraduate and postgraduate education, and to provide appropriate research facilities, a capital development programme of the order of €10 million was proposed for the School of Nursing and Midwifery. He noted that the sum of €4.7 million was available from the capital fund provided for the School in 2001 and that the balance of €5 million will be raised by the School.

The Board noted that these arrangements would allow for the provision of urgently needed undergraduate nursing facilities adjacent to its main site in D'Olier Street, and at the same time allow for previously agreed developments in the Hospital at Tallaght.

In response to queries from Board members, the Provost advised that he was confident the proposed amount can be raised by the School of Nursing and Midwifery, noting that an exact site for the project has not been located and that it has yet to be decided whether this will be a new building or a refurbishment project.

Agreeing that the Faculty of Health Sciences would be required to underwrite any short fall in the funds raised by the School of Nursing and Midwifery, the Board approved the funding arrangements as proposed.

**BD/08-09/033 Statutes - Draft Statutory Change on Academic Year Structure (See Actum CL/08-09/009)** The Registrar invited the Board's attention to a memorandum dated 14 October 2008. The Registrar introduced this item noting that as Board (minute BD/07-08/275 of 7 May 2008) and Council (Actum CL/07-08/155 of 7 May 2008) had approved the introduction of a new academic year structure with effect from 13 July 2009, that Chapter XVII of the 1966 Consolidated Statutes must now be amended. The Registrar invited Board's attention to the proposed revised Statute which, he stated, addressed concerns expressed by the Fellows in the course of the consultation.

In the course of a discussion, the Students' Union Education Officer sought clarification on the timing of reading weeks. The Registrar noted that these were being addressed separately and advised him to discuss the matter further with the Academic Secretary. In response to a query, the Acting Secretary advised that the

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*

Staff Office would engage in discussions with staff representative groups now that the wording of the revised Statute had been agreed.

The Board noted and approved the wording of the revised Statute with one editorial amendment (see Appendix 1 to this minute). The Board noted that the assent of the Fellows would now be sought.

**BD/08-09/034 Statutes Review - Revised Statutes on University, Body Corporate and College** Dr O'Dell, present by invitation, invited Board's attention to the Memorandum from the Statutes Review Working Party, dated 14 October 2008, which had been circulated, outlining the draft text on the following:

- (i) the Body Corporate;
- (ii) the College;
- (iii) the University.

Noting the key provisions of the draft Statutes as presented by Dr O'Dell it was agreed that Board members would submit their comments on the draft text directly to the Statutes Review Working Party.

The Board commended Dr O'Dell and the Working Party for their work and agreed that it would receive a further progress report in due course.

**BD/08-09/035 Research Matters** The Dean of Research, present by invitation, invited Board's attention to a number of research matters. The Dean noted the retirement of Dr Eoin O'Neill as the College's Director of Entrepreneurship and thanked him for his very significant contribution to College over a long period.

The Dean invited Board's attention to performance indicators for the Research Office for the past three months including staffing, the number of contracts signed and technology transfers that had taken place. He highlighted two significant policy items from the Research Committee which had been resolved in recent months, namely a single funding policy for Trinity Research Institutes and a policy on the allocation indirect costs.

The Dean advised Board of a number of achievements in recent months, notably in relation to CRANN and the Stokes Professorship Scheme.

The Dean briefed the Board on the external Social Science review which had been commissioned over the summer. The areas which had been reviewed have now received the reviewers' report and will be formally responding to its contents in the coming weeks. The Dean confirmed that the review and participants' response will be brought to Board via the Research Committee in due course.

The Dean informed Board that the next phase of SFI's Stokes Scheme will be launched later this year, noting that it will be a modification of the initial scheme. He also advised Board that it was expected that there would be a call for proposals before the end of the year for Cycle 5 of PRTL and agreed to brief Board as soon as further information becomes available.

The Provost thanked the Dean for his presentation.

**BD/08-09/036 Administrative Restructuring** The Chief Operating Officer invited Board's attention to his areas of responsibility and to the management arrangements now in place. He advised Board of his initial observations on the administrative structures noting that in his view:

- (i) all administrative departments are cohesive management units in their own right;

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*

- (ii) in many key areas there is an absence of co-ordinated output, both between administrative departments, and across administrative and academic areas;
- (iii) there is a need to develop and implement working arrangements and structures to ensure closer collaboration and teamwork on key issues;
- (iv) strategic planning provides the foundation for the effective operational management of the College;
- (v) there is a need for a co-ordinated provision of information and recommendations to committees.

The Chief Operating Officer invited Board's attention to his key objectives, namely:

- (i) to ensure enhanced coordination within administrative teams leading to greater responsiveness to academic and student communities;
- (ii) to oversee the development and implementation of an Estate Strategy for College;
- (iii) to oversee the development and implementation of an E-Strategy, noting that there will be a report to Board in November 2008;
- (iv) to oversee the development of the new Strategic Plan for the College in partnership with Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer and the College community.

In response to a query, the Chief Operating Officer confirmed that it was not his intention to micro-manage areas but to focus on issues at the College level.

The Provost thanked the Chief Operating Officer for his presentation.

**BD/08-09/037 Student Services Annual Report 2006-2007 (See Actum CL/08-09/007 of 8 October 2008)** Dr Piesse, Chair of the Student Services Committee, invited Board's attention to the Committee's Annual Report for 2006-2007, which had been circulated. Dr Piesse drew the Board's attention to the main services which include the Careers Advisory Service, the College Chaplaincy, the College Day Nursery, the College Health Service, the Department of Sport, the Disability Service, the Student Counselling Service, the Tutorial Service, the Capitation Committee, and the Financial Assistance Committee.

Dr Piesse noted the key issues which remain to be addressed including:

- (i) providing adequate space for student services;
- (ii) consolidating an adequate number of College psychiatrist sessions;
- (iii) providing appropriate line management in the College Day Nursery;
- (iv) conducting a formal analysis of the demand for after-school and holiday care for school-age children and resolving the chronic shortage of places available in the Day Nursery;
- (v) assessing the effect on student services of the diversification of the student body and increase in fourth level participation.

Dr Piesse advised Board that a review of the College Day Nursery is currently underway from which a report is expected in the coming months. She noted that this report would be considered by the Chief Operating Officer and the Student Services Committee in due course. The Board noted that the funding of the report's recommendations would be considered within the overall context of the College's financial position. Dr Piesse invited Board members to consider where a new Student Centre should be located and urged them to engage, as far as possible, in discussions on this matter.

In response to a query, Dr Piesse confirmed that there is no empirical data on the level of demand for places in the College Day Nursery and noted the need to assess current and potential demand, commenting that the cost of childcare in Ireland was possibly the highest in Europe. The lack of childcare and its perceived effect on admissions and retention, especially of mature students, was outlined. The Board

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*

agreed that this level of information would be necessary in order to plan for future provision.

The Provost thanked Dr Piesse and the Student Services Committee for the report.

**BD/08-09/038 Dean of Students' Report 2007-2008 (See Actum CL/08-09/008 of 8 October 2008)**

The Dean of Students, present by invitation, invited Board's attention to his Annual Report for 2007-2008, which had been circulated, noting that as Dean of Students his focus is to promote the Trinity Experience outside the classroom.

The Dean invited Board's attention to the key issues which need to be addressed:

- (i) the proposed location of the Student Centre;
- (ii) accessibility of Student Services;
- (iii) adequate funding for Student Services to attract and retain students as well as to foster graduate loyalty to the College.

The Board noted that €1 million had been allocated to Student Services last year and the Dean acknowledged that this had been of significant help in the provision of services.

The Provost commended the work of the Dean of Students and thanked him for his annual report.

**BD/08-09/039 Acta of the University Council - The Board confirmed the Acta of the University Council from its meeting held on 8<sup>th</sup> October 2008 subject to further comments covering CL/08-09/007, 008, 009, 011, 012, 015, 020. (Items from Section D in the Acta are set out in Section D of these minutes).**

**BD/08-09/040 Gold Medals** The Board approved the tabled recommendations, as follows:

**Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences**

Business Studies	Costello, Rory T
Drama and Theatre Studies	Collins, Christopher
Economic and Social Studies	Lavelle, John D (Sch) McAlinden, Elizabeth Nolan, Charlie (Sch) Travers, Una Liu, Winnie Macwhirter, Francesca C B
Education	Flanagan, Jean
English Studies	Gore, Alice P Langley, Patrick J
European Studies	Bolton, Grace (Sch) Murphy, Isolde
History	Doyle, David H McCann, Conor P
Mental and Moral Science	Cantwell, Sarah
Philosophy and Political Science	Austin, Tara V (Sch)
Social Studies	Kirk, Darragh
<b>Engineering, Mathematics and Science</b>	
Computational Physics	Arthur, Rudy (Sch) Byrne, Michael P (Sch)

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*

Engineering - Civil, Structural and Environmental Engineering	Gamble, Fiona L (Sch)
Engineering - Electronic and Computer Engineering	Hughes, Cecilia Adams, Stephen L (Sch) Ahmed Elghareb, Mohamed A
Engineering -Mechanical and Manufacturing Engineering	Kinsella, Chloe E O’Gorman, Ian Casey, Tiernan Weldon, Barry
Information Systems	Garry, Bernadette
Management Science and Information Systems Studies	Robinson, Rebecca McElligott, Morgan Corrigan, Colm Flynn, Helen O’Brien, Colm
Mathematics	Clancy, Robert (Sch) Cooney, Cathal J P (Sch) Farrell, Niamh O’Brien, Cormac Thom, Howard H Z (Sch)
Medicinal Chemistry	Caffrey, David F Barry, Dawn Moran, Brian W
Natural Sciences - Biochemistry with Immunology	Cassidy, Sorcha A
Natural Sciences - Botany	Stanley, Dara A
Natural Sciences - Chemistry	Quigley, Cormac
Natural Sciences - Microbiology	Tilley, Dorothea O (Sch)
Natural Sciences - Neuroscience	Buckley, Aisling (Sch)
Natural Sciences - Physics	Steer, Brian (Sch) Jensen, Jason Linehan, Anna S (Sch)
<b>Health Sciences</b>	
Medicine	Butler, Gráinne H McMahon, Mary A (Sch) Fitzgerald, Rhea (Sch) Halley, Brigid C M (Sch) Marron, Louise Conway, Catherine Cooney, Sinead B (Sch) Power, Clodagh Smyth, Liam
Nursing Studies - General Nursing	Dennison, Ruth E
Physiotherapy	MacNamara, Eimear Patricia
<b>Multi-Faculty</b>	
Two-subject Moderatorship: Pattern A	Kolesar, Michal (Sch) Curran, Michael P (Sch) Crilly, Niamh (Sch)
Two-subject Moderatorship: Pattern B	Bery, Rahul

**BD/08-09/041 Representation - Science Gallery** Under Other Business the Board noted and approved the nomination of Dr S Ryan to the Board of the Science Gallery.

## SECTION B

**BD/08-09/042 Audit Committee - Trust Funds (Benefactions) Financial Statements for year ended 30 June 2008** The Board noted the Memorandum from the Secretary to the Audit Committee, dated 15 October 2008, which had been circulated recommending the approval of the Trust Funds (Benefactions) Financial Statements by the Board.

**BD/08-09/043 Finance Committee** The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Finance Committee from its meeting of 1 October 2008 with particular reference to:

**FN08-09/04 Draft Trust Funds (Benefactions) Financial Statements for year ended 30 June 2008** The Treasurer (Acting) invited Board's attention to the following documents, which had been circulated:

- (i) Memorandum from the Treasurer (Acting), dated 15 October 2008;
- (ii) Draft Letter of Representation to KPMG, dated October 2008;
- (iii) Correspondence from KPMG to Board, dated 6 October 2008;
- (iv) Draft Trust Funds (Benefactions) Financial Statements for year to 30 June 2008.

The Board noted the Trust Funds (Benefactions) Financial Statements for the year ended 30 June 2008 which had previously been considered by the Finance Committee and the Audit Committee, noting that the accounts had received an unqualified audit opinion by the College's external auditors.

The Board, noting the confidential nature of the Trust Funds, approved the Audited Trust Funds (Benefactions) Financial Statements as presented and authorised the Provost and the Treasurer (Acting) to sign them, and the associated Letter of Representation, on behalf of the Board.

**FN/08-09/07 An Post Site/Biosciences Development** In response to a query, it was agreed that the document on the Biosciences development which had been considered by Board on 27 February 2008 (minute BD/07-08/199 of 27 February 2008) would be circulated to Board members.

**FN/08-09/02 Pensions Update** The Board noted a Board member's comment that careful legal advice will be required in relation to the need, or otherwise, to seek members' agreement in relation to future pension arrangements.

**FN/08-09/11 Haughton Institute** The Board noted the financial statements of the Haughton Institute for the year ended 31 December 2007.

**BD/08-09/044 Information Policy Committee (see Actum CL/08-09/011 of 8 October 2008)** The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Information Policy Committee from its meeting of 3 July 2008 with particular reference to:

**IP/07-08/65 Library and IS Committee Membership and Remit** The Board approved the establishment of the Library and Information Services User Committee to replace the Library and IS Services user

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*

committees, noting that a Head of School will be nominated as a member of the committee.

**BD/08-09/045 Student Services Committee (see Actum CL/08-09/012 of 8 October 2008)** The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Student Services Committee from its meetings of 3 June 2008 and 8 July 2008.

### SECTION C

**BD/08-09/046 Higher Degrees** The Board noted the circulated Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on:

- (i) 30 September 2008;
- (ii) 14 October 2008.

**BD/08-09/047 Principal Committees - Representatives of Deans and Heads of Schools** The Board noted and approved the following nominations:

- (i) **Finance Committee** Dean: Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences (Professor M Marsh);
- (ii) **Information Policy Committee** Dean: Dean of Engineering, Mathematics and Sciences (Professor C Williams), Head of School: Head of School of Social Sciences and Philosophy (Professor J Wickham);
- (iii) **Personnel and Appointments Committee** Dean: Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences (Professor M Marsh), Head: Head of School of Linguistic, Speech and Communications Sciences (Professor J Saeed);
- (iv) **Research Committee** Head: Head of School of Histories and Humanities (Professor R Stalley); Research community representatives: Professor P Honohan to replace Professor P Lane;
- (v) **Site and Facilities Committee** Dean: Dean of Health Sciences (Professor C O'Moráin); Head: Head of School of Nursing and Midwifery (Professor M McCarron);
- (vi) **Student Services Committee** Dean: Dean of Engineering, Mathematics and Science (Professor C Williams); Head: Dean of Dental Affairs (Professor N Claffey).

**BD/08-09/048 Annual Reports** The Board noted the following annual reports, which had been circulated:

- (i) **National Digital Research Centre Limited** Directors' Report and Financial Statements, y/e 31 December 2007;
- (ii) **Dublin Molecular Medicine Centre** Directors' Report and Financial Statements, y/e 30 September 2007.

**BD/08-09/049 Dr Johnson's House Trust - Revised Arrangements** The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Acting Secretary to the College, circulated dated 10 October 2008.

**BD/08-09/050 Risk Management Policy (see BD/08-09/017 of 24 September 2008)** The Board noted that the last sentence of paragraph 3.1.7 should be deleted.

### SECTION D

**In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.**

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*

Signed: .....

Date: .....