#### Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

#### The University of Dublin

#### **Trinity College**

#### Minutes of Board Meeting, 28 September 2005

Present	Provosť (Dr J Hegarty), Vice-Provosť (Dr R M J Byrne), Registrar (Dr D J Dickson), Bursar (Dr D C Williams), Senior Lecturer (Dr C Kearney), Dr N Biggar, Dr W J Blau, Dr A Butterfield, Mr H Kearns, Dr J M Kelly, Ms M Leahy, Dr E Mac Cárthaigh, Mr D McCormack, Dr K J McGinley, Mr J Mannion, Ms S O'Brien, Dr E O'Dell, Dr D O'Donovan, Dr E O'Halpin, Dr J Parnell, Dr A Piesse, Mr R P Sheridan, Mr B Sweeney.
Apologies	Ms G Clarke, Ms M Coffey, Dr A Donnelly, Dr M Lynch, Treasurer.
In attendance	
(ex officio)	Secretary, Assistant Secretary.
(by invitation)	Deputy Treasurer.
(present for)	BD/05-06/001-006 and 008-022

The Provost welcomed Board members attending their first Board meeting.

## SECTION A

**BD/05-06/001 Minutes** The minutes of the meeting held on 6 July 2005 were approved and signed subject to the following amendment:

**BD/04-05/360 Governance – Support Services** The word 'agreement' replaced the word 'implementation' in the penultimate line of the third paragraph.

- **BD/05-06/002** Matters Arising from the Minutes A number of matters arising from the Minutes were discussed and have been recorded below, (see Minutes BD/05-06/003, 004, 005).
- BD/05-06/003 Academic Structures: Relationship between new schools, faculties and central decision-making (see minute BD/04-05/365 of 6 July 2005) The Board noted and approved the designation of the previously approved Heads of School Forum as the Heads of School Committee.
- **BD/05-06/004** Master in Arts (*jure officii*) (see minute BD/04-05/375 of 6 July 2005) The Board, noting that the recommendation from the meeting of the Personnel and Appointments Committee held on 1 July 2005 in relation to the awarding of additional days annual leave to staff with long-service would be considered by the Board at its next meeting, noted Mr Kearns's recommendation that the scheme be implemented from 1 September 2005.

**BD/05-06/005** Governance: Proposed exceptions to documents approved by Council and Board (see minute BD/04-05/369 of 6 July 2005) In response to a query concerning the outcome of discussions on student representation on School Executives and the exceptions to the guidelines which had been proposed by the Schools of Physics, Engineering and Mathematics, the Senior Lecturer advised Board that there had been a series of discussions over the summer with the student representatives and the relevant Heads of School and that these discussions were on-going with a view to a resolution being presented to Board for consideration at its next meeting. The Board noted that the matter had also been discussed at the Heads of School Committee.

In the course of a long and detailed discussion, the following points were raised by Board members:

- School Executive Committees are currently meeting without student representatives and as such are operating outside the Board approved guidelines, noting that unless this is addressed as a matter of urgency there is a risk that other Schools could also begin to operate outside approved governance arrangements;
- (ii) the Board had provided for departures from governance guidelines on the understanding that all significant departures would be approved by Board before being implemented, noting that Board approval had not been granted in the three instances under discussion;
- (iii) whether the business of School Executives which are meeting outside approved membership guidelines should be suspended until the matter is resolved;
- (iv) all School Executives should adhere to the approved guidelines until the proposals for departure from them have been fully addressed.

It was also noted that the School of Engineering has opted not to include support staff on its Executive Committee.

The Senior Lecturer, noting that the issues are complex and that there are strongly held views on both sides, advised Board that questions have been raised in relation to the interpretation of the approved guidelines which have to be resolved.

The Board, acknowledging the Senior Lecturer's work to date in trying to resolve this matter, agreed that he would present a proposal to the next Board meeting.

#### BD/05-06/006 Provost's Report The Provost invited Board's attention to the following issues.

1. **Board business:** The Provost advised Board that it was proposed to maintain the same operational arrangements for the new Board as had been in place previously, viz. that the Board would meet monthly with the option of having additional meetings if the business so required. He noted that all Board members would be heavily involved in the work of the Board's Principal Committees and that mechanisms for establishing stronger connections between the Board and the Committees would be considered during the course of the year.

In response to queries from a number of Board members about the reporting mechanisms from Principal Committees to Board, the Provost advised that, following the adoption of the Governance Working Group's recommendations (Minute 9/246 of 14 April 2004 refers), the format of the minutes of Principal Committees had been amended to improve reporting to Board and that, as well as the Chair of the committee reporting to Board, Board representatives on these

committees were encouraged to report on any issues of concern. The Board, noting comments that the operation of Principal Committees had improved significantly since the introduction of the new procedures, agreed that a more formal mechanism for reporting by Board representatives on Principal Committees should be introduced viz. the Board representatives would be invited to comment on any issue brought to the attention of Board.

In response to the concerns expressed by a number of Board members that monthly Board meetings would not allow sufficient time for appropriate consideration of Board business, the Provost advised that, as in previous years, additional meetings would be convened when required. Following a detailed discussion, in the course of which a number of options were considered, the Board agreed that it would, in the future, meet at 10.30 a.m. on a monthly basis. In reaching this decision the Board agreed that it would maintain the flexibility of holding additional meetings if required and that business would be conducted as expeditiously as possible in the time available.

Dr O'Dell noted his disappointment that his recommendation of fortnightly meetings had not been accepted.

- 2. *Review of Strategic Plan:* The Board noted that the mid-term review of the Strategic Plan would take place when the individual School plans were completed.
- 3. *Academically-based Resource Allocation Model (ARAM):* The Provost advised Board that the operation of the ARAM would be monitored during the current academic year, particularly to identify any unintended consequences arising from its implementation, and that the Board would be briefed accordingly.
- 4. *Review of administrative structures:* The Provost advised Board that arising from discussions in relation to the resourcing and structuring of administrative and support areas and from the Board's decisions on 7 July 2005 (BD/04-05/360 of 6 July 2005 refers) the following two Task Forces had been established, reporting in the first instance to Executive Officers and then to Board:
  - (i) Task Force 1 will address value for money issues and the costs of administration and services including benchmarking them against other institutions. The Task Force will also assess the impact of e-strategy on administrative and service areas. The Task Force's membership comprises the Bursar (chair), the Senior Lecturer, the Treasurer, the Academic Secretary, the Secretary to the College and the Head of the School of Natural Sciences;
  - (ii) Task Force 2 will address the organisation and reporting structures for administrative and support areas and the role of Academic Officers. It will comprise the Senior Lecturer (chair), the Registrar, the Dean of Research, the Secretary to the College and the Staff Secretary.

The Board noted that a communications strategy will be put in place to assist the two Task Forces and that the Board will be advised as their work progresses. It is hoped that the two Task Forces will complete their work by the end of January 2006.

- 5. *Challenges for the academic year:* The Provost invited Board's attention to the main challenges facing the College in the coming year, noting in particular:
  - (i) the increasing international competition for staff and students and the impact which the cost of housing in Dublin is having in this regard;

- (ii) the trend towards increasing levels of research collaboration across institutions and national boundaries;
- (iii) the third level sector's response to the needs of the knowledge-based society;
- (iv) the development of new funding models for the College and the sector, noting that all possible sources of funding will have to be explored to ensure that the College will be able to undertake its core activities and develop for the future.
- 6. *BA Festival of Science:* The Board noted the success of the BA Festival of Science which had been held in the College from 3 to 10 September 2005 and extended its congratulations to the Dean of Science and his staff and to those across all areas of the College who contributed so significantly to the event. The successes of the Science in the City and the Schools' programmes were particularly noted. The Provost stated that an opportunity should be sought to host a similar event for the arts and humanities.
- 7. *School of Business and the Irish Management Institute:* The Provost advised Board that further to a discussion at a previous Board meeting (minute BD/04-05/231 of 20 April 2005 refers) he was in a position to report that the Board of the Irish Management Institute had agreed in principle to establishment of a joint initiative with the College's School of Business and that the governance and financial details would be considered by the Boards of the two institutions in due course.

The Vice-Provost withdrew for this item of business.

BD/05-06/007 Senior Promotions Committee - Recommendations of Meeting of 21 September 2005 The Board approved the following nominations for promotion as outlined in a memorandum from the Acting Secretary of the Academic and Senior Administrative Promotions Committee dated 23 September 2005 which had been tabled. (i) Associate Professorship Dr S J Matterson (English) Dr K Rockett (Drama) Dr A R Kramer (Modern History) Dr K R Benoit (Political Science) Dr M M O'Mahony (Civil, Structural and Environmental Engineering) Dr S M Draper (Chemistry) (ii) **Clinical Professorship** Dr J B Walsh (Medical Gerontologist) (iii) **Personal Chair** Professor L A J O'Neill (Biochemistry) Professor R M J Byrne (Psychology) Professor I M Graham (Clinical Medicine) Professor J W O'Hagan (Economics) **Senior Administrative Grades** (iv) Ms D F Alexander (Research and Innovation Services) - to Senior Administrative Grade 3 Dr M Woods (Research and Innovation Services) - to Senior Administrative Grade 3 Ms P Callaghan (Assistant Academic Secretary) – to Senior Administrative Grade 2

- **BD/05-06/008 Principal Committees** The Registrar invited Board's attention to a memorandum dated 27 September 2005 which had been circulated outlining the following proposals in relation to the representation of Board members on Principal Committees:
  - 1. that all Board members be invited to serve on Principal Committees, which would result in some committees having more than three elected Board members. The Board noted that adopting such an approach would mean that all elected Board members would have an opportunity to contribute fully to the governance of the College and that the risk of Committee meetings not being quorate would be reduced without deviating from the principle of small, effective committees which had been the basis of the Board's decisions on governance;
  - 2. that each of the externally-appointed Board members be invited to serve on one Principal Committee which would mean that the external Board members' expertise would be used to the advantage of Principal Committees and external Board members would become more fully involved in the governance of the College. The Board noted the proposal that that external Board members would be invited to be members of the Audit Committee and the Research Committee.

The Board approved the proposals as presented.

The Board also approved the following Board membership of Principal Committees. The Board noted that recommendations in relation to the representation of Heads of School and Deans on Principal Committees would be presented at a future meeting.

## Audit

Dr Donal O'Donovan

#### Finance

Mr Henry Kearns Professor John Parnell President, Students' Union

#### **Information Policy**

Dr Eoin Mac Cárthaigh Dr Andrew Butterfield Education Officer, Students' Union President, Graduate Students' Union (or nominee)

#### Personnel and Appointments

Professor Werner Blau Dr Eoin O'Dell Professor Eunan O'Halpin Welfare Officer, Students' Union

#### Research

Professor Nigel Biggar Dr Alison Donnelly Professor Marina Lynch Mr Brian Sweeney President, Graduate Students' Union

## Site and Facilities

Professor John Kelly Dr Kieran J McGinley President, Students' Union

## **Student Services**

Ms Mary Coffey Ms Mary Leahy Dr Amanda Piesse Welfare Office, Students' Union President, Graduate Students' Union

In approving the membership, the Board recommended that in future there should be greater consultation with individual Board members on membership of committees prior to proposals being presented to Board for approval so as to ensure greater balance, including gender balance, across all committees.

**BD/05-06/009 Governance: Verification Letter to the HEA** The Board approved the letter as proposed subject to a number of editorial changes and the inclusion of additional material in relation to the College's financial situation. In response to a query, the Secretary advised Board that it is expected to have an actuarial evaluation on the pension fund before the end of 2005. The Board, noting Mr Sweeney's comments in

relation to the need for sufficient resources being made available to the Internal Audit function to address the increased reporting and verification requirements, further noted that the Provost had met with the Chair of the Audit Committee to discuss options in this regard.

- **BD/05-06/010 Committees, Subcommittees of Principal Committees and Other Committees** The Registrar invited Board's attention to a memorandum dated 19 September 2005 listing the committees and subcommittees of Board and Council. The Registrar advised Board that the dissolution of the Academic Affairs Committee has, for this year, resulted in a number of subcommittees reporting directly to Council pending the establishment of the Heads of School Committee. The Board noted that this arrangement would be reviewed at the end of this academic year and may not apply in the future.
- **BD/05-06/011** Faculty of Social and Human Sciences: Vice-Deanery Under Other Business, the Board approved the appointment of Dr Hilary Delany as Vice-Dean of the Faculty from 13 July 2005 to 12 July 2008.

#### SECTION B

**BD/05-06/012** Site and Facilities Committee The Board noted and approved the terms of reference for the Site and Facilities Committee arising from a meeting held on 8 March 2005. The Board noted comments in relation to the need for strong reporting from the Committee to the Board in future.

#### SECTION C

#### BD/05-06/013 Board of Trinity College

- Nominee of the Minister for Education and Science The Board noted that Ms Geraldine M Clarke had been nominated in accordance with Section 3 (2) (h) of the Trinity College, Dublin(Charters and Letters Patent Amendment) Act, 2000;
- (ii) List of Members The Board noted the list of members, 2005-2008-10;
- (iii) **Dates of Meetings of Board [revised] and Council** The Board noted the revised list of Board and Council meetings for 2005-2006.

**BD/05-06/014** Sealings The Board noted:

- Benefactions Investments The Seal of the College was put to a transfer from the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of Trinity College, Dublin of: 24,931 Standard Chartered 7 3/8% Non-Cumulative Irredeemable Preference Shares. [29/7/05]
- Benefactions Investments The Seal of the College was put to a transfer from the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of Trinity College, Dublin of: 34,092 Bank of Ireland Ordinary stock. [29/7/05]
- (iii) Enterprise Centre, Pearse Street Lease for Unit 2, XSIL Limited The Seal of the College was put in duplicate to a Lease for Unit 2 in the Trinity College Enterprise Centre with XSIL Limited. [2/9/05]
- (iv) Enterprise Centre, Pearse Street Indenture of Lease, XSIL Limited The Seal of the College was put in duplicate to an indenture of lease relating to demised

premises at Unit 29 in the Trinity College Enterprise Centre with XSIL Limited. [2/9/05]

- (v) Enterprise Centre, Pearse Street Agreement for the Amendment of Leases for Units 3 and 5, XSIL Limited The Seal of the College was put in duplicate to an Agreement for the Amendment of Leases for Units 3 and 5 in the Trinity College Enterprise Centre with XSIL Limited. [2/9/05]
- (vi) Enterprise Ireland Licence Agreement The Seal of the College was put to a Licence Agreement between Enterprise Ireland and Trinity College, Dublin in relation to an incubator unit (Unit C) in a portion of Suite 728, Shanghai Centre, 1376 Nan Jing Xi Road, Shanghai, China. [7/9/05]
- (vii) Basement and Ground Floor, 1-2 College Green The Seal of the College was put (in triplicate) to a Licence between the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity near Dublin, Treasury CMBS Limited and Starbucks Coffee Company (Ireland) Limited in respect of works on basement and ground floor of 1-2 College Green, Dublin 2. [7/9/05]
- (viii) Deed of Amendment University of Dublin Trinity College Pension Scheme The Seal of the College was put to a Deed of Amendment, to the University of Dublin Pension Scheme, between the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity near Dublin, Irish Pensions Trust Limited and the Trustees of the Pension Scheme. [15/9/05]
- **BD/05-06/015** Germanic Studies Acting Headship of Department The Board noted that Dr J Barkhoff would serve as acting Head of Department during Professor Moray McGowan's leave of absence for Michaelmas term 2005-2006.
- **BD/05-06/016 Prizes and Other Awards School of Physic Prizes and Medals 2005** The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Faculty of Health Sciences, circulated dated 17 August 2005.

## BD/05-06/017 Bequests and Benefactions

- (i) Mary Maureen Pollard Deceased The Board noted that under the terms of the Last Will and Testament of Dr Pollard her entire collection of early 18<sup>th</sup> and 19<sup>th</sup> century children's books have been bequeathed to the College subject to the following conditions: (a) that the collection is preserved by the College in its entirety, with power to add to but not to diminish it and (b) that IR£75,000 or such greater (but not lesser) sum as will yield an annual income of not less (but possibly more) than IR€3,500 per annum (and in the event of such income falling short in anyone year the same to be supplemented by Trinity College) into a scholarship fund to support postgraduate work in Irish bibliography as defined by the Keeper for the time being of Early Printed Books.
- (ii) Homan Potterton Prize/Lisa Sexton Memorial Award The Board noted and approved memoranda from the Treasurer, circulated dated 15 July 2005 and 20 July 2005.
- (iii) Meath Hospital Medal The Board noted the re-institution of the Meath Hospital Medal, and approved the following *Calendar* entry: 'Meath Hospital Medal. The Medal is awarded to the student achieving the highest score in the clinical component of the final medical examinations in both Clinical Medicine and Surgery.'
- **BD/05-06/018** Nominations for Appointment The Board approved nominations for appointment, as circulated (see Appendix 1 to these Minutes).

- **BD/05-06/019 Dublin Molecular Medicine Centre** The Board noted that on 25 April 2005 an Agreement was entered into by the University of Dublin (Trinity College, Dublin), University College Dublin, National University of Ireland, Dublin, the Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland, and the Dublin Molecular Medicine Centre in respect of the following actions:
  - (i) a collaborative programme of research in molecular medicine until at least 2012;
  - (ii) Governance of the company in accordance with the Articles of Association which have been amended to accommodate RCSI's equal ownership;
  - (iii) the management of the company by the Board of Directors (reflecting parity of ownership by the Directors);
  - (iv) to operate the DMMC in accordance with its Operating Principles.
- **BD/05-06/020 Tutorship** The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Senior Tutor, circulated dated 19 September 2005.

**BD/05-06/021** Nominating Committees The Board noted the following memberships:

- Senior Lecturer's Area (Examinations Office) Administrative Officer (Grade 3/2)– Examinations and Timetables (Permanent)
  Assistant Academic Secretary
  Examinations and Timetables Officer
  Mr B Tangney
  Ms G Wilson (UCD)
- Senior Lecturer's Area Manager, Academic Development (Senior Administrative Grade 3) (3-year contract)
   Secretary to the College
   Senior Lecturer
   Dean, Faculty of Engineering and Systems Sciences
   Academic Secretary
   Ms S Huntley Moore
- **BD/05-06/022** Vacation Procedures The Board noted that the following matters were dealt with under Vacation Procedures:
  - (i) Deans, Vice-Deans, Heads of Schools. Disciplines/Departments The following were elected, 13 July 2005-12 July 2008 (except where otherwise stated): *Faculty of Arts and Humanities* Dean: Professor T P McC Brown *School of Humanities and Histories* Head of School: Professor J H Ohlmeyer (13 July 2005-12 July 2009); Heads of Discipline/Department
    Classics: Dr C E Morris
    - Classics: Dr C E Morris
    - History: Dr M K Simms
    - History of Art: Dr P McEvansoneya
    - Irish and Celtic Languages: Professor D P B McManus (13 July 2005-12 July 2006);

*Vice-Deanery* Vice-Dean: Professor V J Scattergood *Faculty of Social and Human Sciences* Dean: Dr P P Walsh School of Social Sciences and Philosophy

Head of Discipline/Department (Acting)

• Political Science: Professor M Gallagher (from 13 July 2005, pending election in Michaelmas term)

School of Psychology

Head of School: Dr H V Smith (13 July 2005-12 July 2009);

Vice-Deanery

Acting Vice-Dean: Dr H Delany (Michaelmas term 2005, pending election);

• Law – Acting Head: Professor G F Whyte (Michaelmas term 2005, pending election)

Faculty of Engineering and Systems Sciences

Heads of Discipline/Department

- Civil, Structural and Environmental Engineering: Dr M M O'Mahony
- Computer Science: Professor J B Grimson
- Statistics: Dr F Bannister

Faculty of Science

Heads of Discipline/Department

- Geography: Professor P Coxon
- Inorganic and Synthetic Materials Chemistry: Dr S M Draper
- Organic, Medical and Biological Chemistry: Professor M Senge
- Physical, Computational and Materials Chemistry: Dr G Watson
- (ii) Refurbishment of Front Square Residences (see BD/04-05/129 of 14 December 2004) The firm of Messrs Patrick Brock has been appointed to carry out the works.
- (iii) Assistant Reserve Junior Deans 2005-2006 Assistant and reserve Junior Deans were appointed, as set out in a memorandum from the Junior Dean, circulated dated 16 August 2005.
- (iv) **Tutorship** Tutors were appointed, as set out in memoranda from the Senior Tutor, circulated dated 15 July and 4 August 2005.
- (v) Nominations for Appointment (under Vacation Procedures)
- (vi) **Scholarship Permission to Intermit** The following were granted permission to intermit in 2005-2006 for a second year of intermission:
  - (a) 00672823 (having previously intermitted in 2002-2003);
  - (b) 00029921 (having previously intermitted in 2004-2005).
- (vii) **Nominating Committees** The following committees were approved:
  - (a) Assistant Librarian (Bibliographic Data Management Department) –
    (Permanent) Librarian; Assistant Librarian; Keeper Collection Management; Dr J Doherty; Ms F Tipple (UCD)
  - (b) Assistant Librarian (Nursing) (3-year Contract) Librarian; Deputy Librarian; Keeper, Readers' Services; Dr G McKee; Ms A Healy
  - (c) **Student Counsellor Administrative Grade 1 (5-year Contract):** Secretary to the College; Dean of Students; Director of Student Counselling, Dr S O'Brien, Ms A Naughton; Mr P Moriarty (UCC).
  - (d) **Engineering Services Manager (Permanent):** Secretary to the College; Acting Director of Buildings; Professor D B Murray; Mr M Poland (UCC).

Signed:	
Date:	

# Appendix 1 to Minute BD/05-06/018

# Nominations for Appointment

Department	Post	Name and Qualifications	Start date	Termination date (if contract)
Histories and Humanities	Extramural Co-Ordinator	McGRATH, Charles Ivar, BA (NUI), MA (NUI), PhD (Lond.)	01-09-2005	31-08-2008
Information Systems Services	Systems Administrator	HUGHES, Tracie, BA (NUI), MA (NUI), MCSE NT (Sylvan Prometric)	20-06-2005	19-06-2006
Information Systems Services	Network Administrator	KELLY, Nicola, BSc (Syst. Inf.), Dip. Information Systems	20-06-2005	19-06-2006
Information Systems Services	Systems Administrator	O'HARE, Kieran, BA (Dubl.), PG Dip. (DIT)	13-06-2005	12-09-2005
Library	Assistant Librarian	HARTE, Niamh, BA (NUI), BDes (NCAD), MLIS (NUI)	03-10-2005	03-04-2007
Library	Assistant Librarian	MORAL, Encarna, BA (Universidad Complutense de Madrid), Dip.LIS (NUI)	22-08-2005	21-08-2009
Library	Assistant Librarian	SEABROOK, Nicole, BA (Evergreen State College), MLIS (NUI)	02-08-2005	01-08-2009

# Appendix 2 to Minute BD/05-06/022 (v)

Department	Post	Name and Qualifications	Start date	Termination date (if contract)
Information Systems Services	Database/Oracle Application Server Administrator	McGRATH, David, BSc (Griffith College)	13-08-2005	12-08-2006
Information Systems Services	Administrative Officer	RAPPLE, Conor, BA, PG Dip. Computer Engineering (Dubl.)	03-08-2005	02-08-2008
Information Systems Services	MIS Programmer	ROONEY, Enda, Nat. Dip. Computing (Sligo RTC), BSc (Ulster)	16-08-2005	15-08-2006
Library	Assistant Librarian	MacNAUGHTON, David, BsEcon (Univ. of Wales), MA (DCU), Dip.LIS (NUI)	03-08-2005	02-08-2006
Senior Lecturer's Area	Administrative Officer	GRAHAM, Deirdre, BA (Griffith College)	01-07-2005	30-06-2006
Senior Lecturer's Area	Academic Developer	HANRATTY, Orla, BEd (NUI), MSc (NUI)	05-09-2005	27-01-2006
Staff Office	Administrative Officer	BARTON, Angela, BESS (Syd.)	01-07-2005	31-12-2005
Staff Office	Administrative Officer	DUNNE, Karen, BA (NCI)	01-07-2005	30-06-2006
Staff Office	Administrative Officer	RYAN, Cara, BComm (NUI), CIPD	15-08-2005	14-08-2006

# Nominations for Appointment (Vacation Procedures)