Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 28 January 2004

Present	Provost (Dr J Hegarty), Vice-Provost (Dr J B Grimson), Registrar (Mr R A Stalley), Bursar (Dr J W O'Hagan), Senior Lecturer (Dr S M Greene), Dr S P A Allwright, Mr B Connolly, Dr L E Doyle, Dr J A Fitzpatrick, Ms H Fychan, Ms A-M Gatling, Dr H M C V Hoey, Mr H Kearns, Dr J G Lunney, Mr M Miley, Dr A N M Ní Chasaide, Mrs J O'Hara, Dr J C Sexton, Dr F Shevlin, Ms E K Stokes, Dr D L Weaire.
Apologies	Mr M Dowling, Dr S Duffy, Dr H Gibbons, Ms M Leahy, Dr T T West.
In attendance	
(ex officio)	Secretary, Treasurer, Assistant Secretary.
(by invitation)	Dean of Research for item $(6/144)$ and the Director of Buildings for items $(6/145$ and $6/146)$

The Provost welcomed Dr Hoey who was attending Board for the first time.

6/140 Minutes

- (a) The Minutes of the meeting held on 17 December 2003 were approved and signed subject to the following amendments:
 - **4/97 Financial Situation 2004** The phrase 'The Student Representatives and' was included at the start of the final sentence of the minute.
 - **4/98 Financial Situation and Agenda for Change** The final paragraph of the minute was replaced with: 'The Board agreed that work should proceed to develop the proposals as presented and that consideration of issues and recommendations would be channelled through existing Committee structures to the Board for decision/approval in the normal way.'

The Board, noting Ms O'Hara's comments in relation to the inaccuracy of degrees attributed to a number of those listed in *Appendix* **1** – *Nominations for Appointment*, agreed that the Secretary would discuss the matter with Ms O'Hara.

- (b) The Minutes of the meeting held on 21 January 2004 were approved and signed subject to the following amendment:
 - **5/138** Senior Lecturer's Annual Report, 2002-03 The phrase 'noting that in future it will be held on a Saturday so that students will not have to take time out of the school day to attend' was deleted from point (i) in the final paragraph on page 4.

- **6/141** Matter Arising from the Minutes A matter arising from the Minutes was discussed and has been recorded below, (see Minute 6/142).
- **6/142 Audit Committee (see Minute 4/107 of 17 December 2003)** The Board, noting that the term of office of the current Chairman of the Audit Committee, Mr David Kingston, is due to expire on 12 July 2004, approved the Provost's proposal to appoint Mr Terence Forsyth as his successor with effect from 13 July 2004. The Board also approved the cooption of Mr Forsyth to the Audit Committee with immediate effect.

6/143 Provost's Report

(a) *CHIU:* The Provost invited Board's attention to the issues which had been discussed at a meeting which the Minister for Education and Science had with representatives of CHIU, on 17 December 2003, noting that the Minister had expressed particular views about the autonomy of the university sector as enshrined in the Universities Act and, from his perspective, the lack of information about the work of the sector. The Board noted that it had been agreed that the Minister and CHIU would hold discussions on these, and other issues of concern, over the coming months.

The Provost advised Board that it had been agreed, at a meeting of CHIU held in Cork on 25 and 26 January, that there will be a sectoral campaign to raise awareness about the financial difficulties being experienced arising from the reduction in the government's investment. The main message of the campaign is that the sector cannot fully deliver its commitments on the basis of the existing funding levels and that there is a need for reform in this regard. In the course of a discussion, the Board noted issues which should be addressed in any future discussions with the Minister, including Trinity's contribution to the country's national heritage.

The Provost invited the Board's attention to the financial situation in other universities, noting that, in accordance with Section 37 of the Universities Act, the HEA had been notified about a deficit for 2004 in at least one university.

- (b) **OECD Review** The Provost advised Board that there would be a sectoral submission from CHIU to the OECD review of third level education which is being carried out at the request of the Minister for Education and Science. The Board noted that the review team would visit one university in each region and that UCD would be the university visited in Dublin. In response to a query, the Provost advised Board that information on individual institutions would be available to the review team.
- (c) *External Board member:* The Provost advised Board that, due to the demands of his business activities, Dr Horn had, with regret, tendered his resignation as a member of the College Board. The Board approved the Provost's proposal that an informal working group, comprising Dr Allwright, Dr Fitzpatrick, Dr Ní Chasaidhe and Dr West, consider the organisations from which nominations would be sought noting that the appointee will be selected in accordance with the terms of the College's Private Act.

In noting Dr Horn's resignation, the Board paid tribute to his contribution to the Board during his term of office.

(d) *Reform of the Health Services:* The Provost advised Board that, arising from proposed reforms in the Health Services areas, the College and its two main teaching hospitals were at an early stage of discussion on the question of how best to provide world class medical education and service by combining the strength of the three

partners. This would be a long-term strategy and proposals will be brought to Board in due course.

6/144 Strategic Plan - Implementation

(a) The Dean of Research, present by invitation, invited Board's attention to progress on each of the following actions in the Strategic Plan.

Action 2 – Development of Trinity's areas of research strength The Dean advised Board that, following meetings relating to each of the four research areas specified in the Strategic Plan, almost fifty expressions of interest had been received from College researchers. These will be reviewed by the relevant facilitators. The Dean advised Board that facilitators will consult with Principal Investigators on the potential for consolidating selected proposals, noting that emphasis will be placed on crossdepartmental and cross-faculty research, as well as research spanning more than one strategic research area. Principal Investigators will be requested to submit revised proposals for final review and selection and the Board noted that the selected proposals would form the basis of the College's next five-year research plan.

Action 3 – Policy on Research Centres/Institutes The Board noted that a forum on research centres had been established and that its three working groups will address: (i) governance of research centres; (ii) integration of research centre staff into College; and (iii) benchmarking of research centres. The Dean advised Board that a policy on research centres would be developed based on the reports of the working groups. In response to a query, the Dean of Research and the Vice-Provost advised that procedures in relation to SFI centres such as CRANN, which have already been approved by Board, will operate as planned and that work will continue to develop policies for all other College research centres.

Action 9 – Commercialising Intellectual Property/Entrepreneurship Development The Dean of Research advised Board that a policy document on Intellectual Property for the College had been drafted which consolidated all previous policies and procedures. The Board noted that this policy was being considered by the relevant committees and would be presented to Board for approval in due course. The Dean of Research also advised Board that the College's policy and practices in relation to intellectual property compared favourably with other international institutions against which they were benchmarked.

The Board noted that a five-year entrepreneurship development plan would be submitted to Enterprise Ireland in the near future. The Dean advised Board that it was hoped that, with the appointment of a full-time executive with responsibility for entrepreneurship, the number of campus companies will increase, further noting that an entrepreneurship programme has been developed in conjunction with the College's MBA programme.

The Board noted Mr Connolly's comments in relation to the sector's contribution to national competitiveness.

The Board thanked the Dean for his presentation, following which, he withdrew from the meeting.

(b) The Vice-Provost invited Board's attention to progress which had been made in relation to *Action 5 – Inclusiveness and Diversity - The Day Nursery* since the matter had been discussed by the Board at its meeting on 22 October 2003 (minute 2/40 refers). The Board noted that, following the implementation of a number of the

recommendations of the Day Nursery Working Group's report, the Day Nursery is now on much firmer financial base than heretofore. The Vice-Provost also advised Board that there is still a shortage of places in the Day Nursery and all possible options are being examined to redress this situation.

The Vice-Provost also invited Board's attention to progress on each of the following actions in relation to Human Resources in the Strategic Plan.

Action **12** – *Dean of Students* The Board noted that Mr Bruce Misstear, who had been appointed as Dean of Students, took up office on 1 January 2004.

Action 13 – Staff Policy The Board noted that issues such as mentoring and performance management will be addressed through the Sustaining Progress Action Plan, submitted to the Department of Education and Science in December 2003. The Vice-Provost advised Board that approval for the payment of the next phase of awards under Benchmarking and Sustaining Progress had been received and would be paid to the relevant staff groups in February 2004, noting that the College has not yet been authorised to make payments to staff covered by parallel benchmarking agreements. In response to a query, the Vice-Provost advised Board that the Heads of Personnel in the sector are developing a sectoral approach to addressing issues in relation to the employment of contract staff.

In response to a query, the Secretary advised Board that proposals in relation to Chair appointments would be presented to Board at a future meeting.

- **6/145 Development Control Plan** The Bursar, introducing this topic, invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 18 January 2004, which had been circulated together with a copy of the Draft Development Control Plan. The Bursar advised Board that the purpose of the Plan was twofold: (a) to bring together an outline of the policy position applying to the main aspects of the management and development of the physical campus and (b) to set out the key policies on which decisions would be required over the next few years. The Board noted that the discussion would be the first of two, the second of which would take place at the Board meeting on 10 March, at which time it would be asked to decide the following:
 - (i) Whether the Plan is a satisfactory outline of the policy position applying to the main aspects of the management and development of the physical campus?
 - (ii) Whether the key issues for resolution identified in the Report are the correct ones?
 - (iii) Whether the context for these decisions, as set out in the Report, is satisfactory, given that issues will be discussed at the Site and Facilities Committee before any specific decisions are required by Board?

The Director of Buildings, present by invitation, invited Board's attention to the College's current property portfolio in a number of locations throughout the city. The Bursar invited Board's attention to the policies in relation to existing buildings and existing open areas and the potential new sites and/or buildings which were outlined in the Draft Development Control Plan. The Director of Buildings invited the Board's particular attention to the lack of open spaces at the East End of College, and to the proposals that: (a) open space be created by the removal of huts currently providing temporary accommodation at the first possible opportunity; and (b) an architect be commissioned to review the area and make recommendations on options for landscaping. The Director of Buildings also invited Board's attention to a proposal to review the usage of laboratory space in College.

In the detailed discussion which followed, the following points were made by Board members:

(i) the proposed audit of space usage should be carried out as a matter of urgency;

- (ii) the current concentration of lecture and seminar rooms in one or two buildings, with the consequent over-crowding, should be taken into consideration in the development of the revised plan;
- (iii) departmental space may be required in the future to meet central time-tabling requirements;
- (iv) the quality and fitness for purpose of space should be taken into consideration in allocating usage, particularly the quality of teaching space;
- (v) the possible increase in the number of students beyond the current level must be a factor in future planning;
- (vi) there is currently inadequate space for students studying on taught Masters courses;
- (vii) consideration should be given to including elements of the historical introduction to the Draft Development Control Plan in the College Calendar;
- (viii) further opportunities should be sought to develop tourist activities based on the College's historical buildings and features;
- (ix) the Day Nursery needs access to open spaces;
- (x) consideration should be given to charging departments for teaching space.

In response to queries, the Provost advised Board of the status of specific building projects. In response to a query, the Director of Buildings advised Board that it was proposed to consider imposing a charge for space devoted to commercially funded research, campus companies and/or museum-type activities.

The Board agreed that comments in relation to the Draft Development Control Plan should be submitted to the Bursar and the Director of Buildings and that a final decision on the Plan would be made at the Board meeting on 10 March 2004.

CRANN The Provost advised Board that a grant of €11m had been received from SFI for the 6/146 construction of a specialised Centre for nanoscience research and invited the Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 20 January 2004, which had been circulated, outlining options in relation to the location of the Centre. The Provost invited Board's attention to the two sites in the North East Corner where the Centre could be constructed, one to the south of the railway viaduct which could be c.2,250 m² in size and would cost €11m to construct and the other to the north of the railway viaduct which could be c.6,250 m² in size and would cost in the order of €19m to construct the entire shell of the building and to fit out c.2,250 m². The Provost advised Board that, following consideration of the options, the Site and Facilities Committee expressed a strong preference for the site to the north of the railway viaduct as it would complete the development of the North East Corner site and leave space beside the Luce Hall which could be used as an amenity area. The Board noted that the required funding of €19m could be achieved by combining the grant received from SFI with funding previously secured in connection with this site and tax relief available on the basis of a suitable Section 843 certificate, noting that the certificate for Section 843 arrangements is awaited.

Following clarification of a number of issues, the Board agreed that a final decision would be made in relation to the development at its meeting on 10 March, when final details on planning and funding issues would be available. The Board also agreed that the Principal Investigator from CRANN would make a presentation at the March Board meeting.

The Board thanked the Director of Buildings and the Bursar for their presentations.

The Director of Buildings withdrew from the meeting.

6/147 Acta of the University Council The Board confirmed Acta of the University Council from its meetings of 14 January 2004 subject to further comment covering the following: 15/B, 16/A, 17/C, 18/D.

- **6/148 European Universities Association Quality Review of Universities in Ireland (see Actum 15/B (ii) of 14 January 2004)** The Senior Lecturer advised Board that the HEA, in association with the Irish Universities Quality Board (IUQB), had initiated a review of quality assurance in Irish universities, noting that the contract for this review had been awarded to the European University Association (EUA). The Senior Lecturer advised Board that, in accordance with the requirements of the review, the College had established a Steering Committee, chaired by the Senior Lecturer, to oversee the process and to complete a self-evaluation report for submission to the EUA in March prior to a visit of the Assessors in Trinity Term 2004. The Board noted that a second visit would be conducted in Michaelmas Term 2004 following which the EUA would produce a separate report for each institution as well as a cross-sectoral report for the HEA and the IUQB, further noting that institutions will be obliged to publish their own reports on their websites.
- **6/149 Personnel and Appointments Committee (see Actum 16/A of 14 January 2004)** The Board approved the further recommendations of the committee from the meeting of 16 December 2003.
- 6/150 Nominations for Appointment Nominations for Appointment (see Actum 17/C of 14 January 2004) The Board, on the recommendation of the University Council, approved the appointments as summarised in Appendix 1 to these Minutes.
- **6/151 Leave of Absence (see Actum 18/D of 14 January 2004)** The Board approved the following applications for leave of absence.
 - (a) **Nursing and Midwifery Studies** Ms E Curtis Hilary term 2004;
 - (b) **Statistics** Dr M O'Regan Trinity term 2004.
- **6/152 Scholarship** Under Other Business, the Board approved the proposal outlined in a memorandum from the Senior Lecturer, dated 28 January 2004, which had been tabled, that current students on the Professional Course in Theology be permitted to compete for Scholarship in this academic year, noting that an entry regarding the format of the examination will appear in the Calendar for the first time in the academic year 2004/2005.
- **6/153 Students' J1 Visas** Under Other Business the Board noted Ms Gatling's report that students registered for the Degree in Nursing Studies had been deemed ineligible by the US authorities for J1 visas.
- **6/154** Site and Facilities Committee The Board noted the Minutes of the Site and Facilities Committee from its meeting of 6 January 2004 as circulated and approved the recommendations.
- **6/155 Senate Business Meeting of 25 February 2004 Degree of Master in Arts** (*jure officii*) The Board approved the nominations for the Degree of Master in Arts (*jure officii*) as outlined in an amended memorandum from the Registrar, dated 20 January 2004, which had been tabled. In response to a query, the Registrar advised Board that, to date, the criteria for awarding the MA (*j.o.*) degree as prescribed in the Statutes had always been interpreted to apply to full-time staff only.

- **6/156 Higher Degrees** The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 11 December 2003 and 13 January 2004, circulated.
- 6/157 Sealings The Board noted:
 - (a) **Enterprise Centre, Pearse Street Lease** The Seal of the College was put in duplicate to a lease of Unit 1A in the Trinity College Enterprise Centre to Haptica Limited. [11/12/03]
 - (b) Enterprise Centre, Pearse Street Lease The Seal of the College was put in duplicate to two consecutive leases of Unit 32 in the Trinity College Enterprise Centre to Eblana Photonics Ltd. [11/12/03]
- **6/158 Bequests and Benefactions D C Pepper Prize** The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Treasurer, circulated dated 7 January 2004.
- **6/159** Nominations for Appointment The Board approved nominations for appointment, as circulated (see Appendix 2 to these Minutes).
- 6/160 Representation Haughton Institute for Graduate Education and Training in the Health Sciences The Board noted and approved the nomination of Mr M Gleeson as a Director of the above Institute, in place of Professor J B Grimson, who has resigned.
- **6/161 Agreements Mexican Lecture** The Board noted that a Memorandum of Understanding had been signed, between the College and the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the United Mexican States, that an annual Lecture be established, funded by up to US\$5,000 from the Ministry and with additional funding from the Embassy of Mexico, with the College providing accommodation and other facilities related to the Lecture.
- **6/162 Prizes and Other Awards Gold Medal** The Board noted and approved the Senior Lecturer's recommendation that Lisa Aideen Hurley (99010054) (Human Nutrition) be awarded a Gold Medal on the basis of her final examination results.
- **6/163 Technical Staff Committee** The Board noted and approved the following changes in the membership of the above committee for the academic year 2003-04 and two further years thereafter: Dr C A O'Sullivan (replaces Dr L E Doyle); Dr M Lyons (replaces Dr M Meegan); Dr U Bond (replaces Dr S Draper); Dr V Campbell (replaces Dr D B Murray).
- 6/164 Nominating Committees The Board noted the following memberships:
 - (a) Provost's Office Administrative Officer (permanent)
 Vice-Provost
 Dean of Arts (Humanities)
 Academic Secretary
 Assistant Secretary

- (b) Secretary's Office Information Compliance Officer (permanent) Secretary to the College Dean of Arts (Letters) Librarian Director of Information Systems Services Mr E O'Dell Mr M Farrell (UCC)
- (c) Secretary's Office Junior Web Designer (one year contract) Assistant Secretary Director of Information Systems Services Mr M Brady Ms M Horan

Signed:	
Date:	

Appendix 1 to Minute 6/150

Nominations for Appointment (see Actum 17/C of 14 January 2004)

Department	Post	Name and Qualifications	Start date	Termination date
_				(if contract)
Biochemistry	Research Fellow	CARTY Michael, B.Sc. (Belf.), Ph.D. (Belf.)	15.12.2003	15.12.2006
Biochemistry	Research Fellow Senior Demonstrator	ROBINSON Glynis, B.A. (Open), Ph.D. (Dubl.)	01.01.2004	31.12.2004
Biochemistry	Research Lecturer	JEFFERIES Caroline, B.A. Ph.D. (Dubl.)	01.10.2003	30.09.2006
Biochemistry	Research Associate	KELLY Julie Anne, Ph.D., M.Sc. (Manc.) B.Sc. (Hudd.)	01.01.2004	31.12.2004
Chemistry	Research Fellow	NOLAN Michael, B.Sc. (DCU), Ph.D. (NMRC)	01.12.2003	31.05.2005
Clinical Medicine	Honorary Lecturer	O'SULLIVAN Maria, Ph.D. (Dubl.), B.Sc. (Dubl.)	01.09.2003	31.08.2006
Clinical Medicine	Lecturer in Medicine	McLOUGHLIN Ramona, MB, B.Ch. BAO (NUI), MRCP (UK)	01.07.2003	30.06.2004
Clinical Medicine	Lecturer Registrar	GOULDING Carol, MB (RCPI)	01.09.03	31.08.2004
Clinical Medicine	Senior Lecturer	THIRION Pierre, MD (Paris V)	05.01.2004	04.01.2006
Computer Science	Part-Time Lecturer	SIMPSON Jurgen	01.10.2003	30.09.2004
Computer Science	Part-time Lecturer	FITZPATRICK Feargal, B.Des (NUI)	01.10.2003	30.09.2004
Electronic & Electrical Engineering	k Research Fellow	PANARINA Olga, Ph.D. (Dubl.), Dip. Im Chem.(St. Petersburg State University)	01.12.2003	31.12.2004
English	Research Fellow	DILLANE Fionnuala, BA (NUI), MA (NUI)	30.10.2003	30.09.2005
Film/School o Drama	f Part-time Film Librarian/Re- search Assistant	FISHER Dorothy B.F.A. (Calif)	Subject to Work Permit	9 months
Geology	Visiting Professor	JONES Alan, B.Sc.(Nott.), M.Sc. (Birm.) Ph.D. (EDIN)	01.01.2004	31.12.2006
Germanic Studies	Harting Scholar	HARTSUIKER Marjan	01.10.2003	30.09.2004
Germanic Studies	Teaching Assistant	MURPHY Brian, Beng. (Belf) MPhil (Dubl.)	01.10.2003	30.09.2004
Germanic Studies	Teaching Assistant	KULENOVIC Melita, BA (Berkeley)	01.10.2003	30.09.2004
History of Art	Research Fellow	MOORE-McCANN Brenda, MB (NUI), BA Mod (Dubl) PhD (Dubl)	01.10.2003	30.09.2004
History of Art	Temporary Lecturer	GALLAGHER William, BA (Dubl.)	01.12.2003	30.06.2004

IIIS	Visiting Professor	SUTHERLAND Alan, Ph.D., MA (Warw.)	19.11.2003	13.03.2004
Microbiology	Research Fellow	MEEHAN Mary, B.A. (Mod) Ph.D. (Dubl.)	01.01.2004	31.12.2006
Microbiology	Research Fellow	KELLY Barbara, B.Sc (NUI)	01.01.2004	31.10.2004
Modern History	Research Associate	DOYLE E.D, (I.E.E.)	01.12.2003	30.09.2005
Modern History	Research Associate	O'NEILL John, Ph.D (Dubl), M.Phil (Dubl)	01.12.2003	30.09.2005
Modern History	Research Associate	KENNEDY Michael, BA, PhD (NUI)	01.12.2003	30.09.2005
Modern History	Research Fellow	O'CORRAIN Daithi, BA (Dubl.), H.Dip (NUI)	01.11.2003	31.10.2006
Modern History	Research Associate	McMAHON Deirdre, BA, MA (NUI) Ph.D (Cantab)	01.12.2003	30.09.2005
Pharmaceutical Chemistry	Research Fellow	BARRETT Irene, B.Sc. (NUI), Ph.D. (NUI)	08.12.2003	07.12.2004
Pharmacognosy	Research Associate	O'TOOLE Gerard, B.Sc. (NUI), B.Sc.(NUI), Ph.D. (Dubl.)	30.09.2003	30.09.2006
Physics	Research Fellow	O'BRIEN Canice B.Sc. (NUI)	01.01.2004	31.03.2004
Physics	Research Fellow	QUESADA-PATO Roberto, BS, MS, PhD.(Oviedo)	01.11.2003	31.10.2004
Physics	Research Fellow	PERON Nicolas, Ph.D. (Pierre et Marie Curie Paris VI)	08.09.2003	31.08.2004
Physics	Research Fellow	FOURNET Patrick, Ph.D. (Dubl.)	01.01.2004	31.12.2004
Physics	Research Fellow	MORITZ Jerome, Ph.D. (U. Fourier de Grenoble, France)	01.01.2004	31.12.2004
Physiotherapy	Clinical Teacher	O'SULLIVAN Cliona, B.Sc. (Dubl.)	01.12.2003	30.06.2004
Policy Institute	Research Fellow	BOYLE Nigel, Ph.D. (Duke U.) BA (Liv.)	01.11.2003	30.06.2004
Pure & Applied Mathematics	Part-Time Lecturer	MCNAMARA Cronan, B.Sc. (NUI), M.Sc. (Dubl.)	01.10.2003	30.09.2004
Pure & Applied Mathematics	Part-Time Lecturer	FROST Dermot, B.A. (Dubl.)	01.10.2003	30.09.2004
Pure & Applied Mathematics	Part-Time Lecturer	BRADLEY Kevin, Ph.D. (Dubl.), M.Sc. (Dubl.)	01.10.2003	30.09.2004
Trinity Centre for Bioengin- eering	Research Fellow	BYRNE Elaine, B.A. (Dubl.), Ph.D. (Dund.)	27.10.2003	25.10.2005

Appendix 2 to Minute 6/159

Nominations for Appointment

Department	Post	Name and Qualifications	Start date	Termination date (if contract)
Buildings Office	Building Co- Ordinator	CULLEN Patrick,	01.01.2004	PERMANENT
School of Nursing & Midwifery Studies	Assistant Allocation Studies	PIERI Christina,	01.01.2004	INDEFINITE DURATION
Senior Lecturer's Area	Administra- tive Officer	BIRCH Debra, BA, MA (Lond.)	02.02.2004	PERMANENT
Trinity College Library	Assistant Librarian – Grade 2	SEABROOK Nicole, Dip. Modern Irish (UCD), MA (NUI) BA (Olympia WA)	05.01.2004	31.12.2006
Trinity College Library	Assistant Librarian – Grade 2	McMANUS John, Dip. Information & Library Management (Manc. Met.)	05.01.2004	31.12.2006