Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 26 November 2003

Present Provost (Dr J Hegarty), Vice-Provost (Dr J B Grimson), Registrar (Mr R A Stalley),

Bursar (Dr J W O'Hagan), Senior Lecturer (Dr S M Greene), Dr S P A Allwright, Mr B Connolly, Mr M Dowling, Dr S Duffy, Dr J A Fitzpatrick, Ms H Fychan, Ms A-M Gatling, Dr H Gibbons, Mr H Kearns, Ms M Leahy*, Dr J G Lunney*, Mr M Miley, Dr J M Mossman, Dr A N M Ní Chasaide, Mrs J O'Hara, Dr J C Sexton, Dr F Shevlin*, Ms

E K Stokes, Dr D L Weaire, Dr T T West*.

Apologies Dr L E Doyle, Dr C Horn.

In attendance

(ex officio) Secretary, Treasurer, Assistant Secretary.

(by invitation)

(present for) * Minutes 3/67-3/74.

The Provost welcomed Mr M Dowling, President of the Graduate Students' Union, attending Board for the first time.

3/67 **Minutes** The Minutes of the meeting held on 22 October 2003 were approved and signed subject to the following amendment:

2/34 Minutes - 1/8 Seanad Electoral Reform The amendment was re-worded to read: The word 'Electoral' was removed from the heading and the final sentence of the minute was replaced with: 'The Board, noting that Mr Connolly welcomed the consideration of Seanad related matters by the Board, further noted his disappointment at the limited scope of the proposals made by the College in this regard.'

- 3/68 Matters Arising from the Minutes A number of matters arising from the Minutes were discussed and have been recorded below, (see Minutes 3/69, 3/70, 3/71, 3/72, 3/73).
- **Disciplinary Matter (see Minute 2/36 of 22 October 2003)** The Board established a working group comprising Dr West, Dr Fitzpatrick, Dr Duffy and Dr Allwright to consider issues in relation to the reinstatement of a named staff member to Fellowship of the College, agreeing that the Secretary would convene the first meeting of the group as soon as he receives written legal advice on the matter.

- 3/70 St Catherine's College of Education for Home Economics (see Minute 2/37 of 22 October 2003) In response to a query from Ms Gatling the Registrar advised Board that there would be a meeting of the Co-ordinating Committee for the Bachelor in Education Degree Course on 27 November 2003 at which it was hoped there would be further information on the closure of St Catherine's College of Education for Home Economics and on the way it would be managed by the Department of Education and Science.
- 3/71 Provost's Report International Students (see Minute 2/38 (d) of 22 October 2003) The Registrar advised Board that a meeting had been arranged with Officers of the Students' Union to discuss the business plan for international students which is currently being prepared.
- 3/72 Elections to Board Working Group's Report (see Minute 2/41 of 22 October 2003) The Secretary advised Board that following a meeting of the working group on 5 December 2003 it was hoped to present a final report on procedures for Board elections to the Board at its next meeting.
- 3/73 Appointment of a Board member to replace Dr Mossman (see Minute 2/42 of 22 October 2003) The Board noted that Dr Hoey had accepted the invitation to become a member of the Board and that she would begin her term of office on 1 January 2004 with effect until 31 August 2005.
- 3/74 Financial Situation 2004 Introducing the topic, the Provost advised Board that since the publication of the Book of Estimates, Executive Officers had been considering all possible options as to how the College might address the shortfall in funding for 2003/2004 and the follow-on reduction in subsequent years. The Provost also advised Board that, as a result of the strong campaign mounted by CHIU in relation to the impact of the financial cuts on the university sector, funding has been restored to Cycle 3 of the PRTLI. The Department of Finance has now requested the Department of Education and Science to analyse the university sector's financial situation. The Provost stated that the HEA had decided at its meeting on 25 November to initiate a review of the total finances of all universities. The Board, noting that this review would be conducted by external experts and that all aspects of the College's finances would be subject to examination, expressed concern at this unprecedented action by the HEA, further noting that, in the past, the HEA had relied on the College's own audited accounts and reports of the C&AG. In response to a query, the Treasurer advised Board that the review would commence without delay and it was scheduled for completion by the end of January 2004, noting that one of its objectives was to achieve comparability in a number of areas across all institutions. The Treasurer also emphasised the need for the sector to act as a cohesive group in this regard thus allowing CHIU to mount an effective campaign against the on-going reductions in the government's allocation to the universities' core grant.

The Provost invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 21 November 2003, which had been circulated, outlining the expected financial situation for 2003/2004 together with details of the options considered by Executive Officers and recommendations for Board's attention.

The Provost advised Board that, arising from the publication of the Estimates for 2004 on 13 November 2003, preliminary indications were that university funding for 2004 will be within the same cash levels of funding as for 2003 and that the cost of pay increases arising in 2004 is to be met from this allocation. Board noted that early estimates had indicated that the expected shortfall in funding will be about €8m relative to the 2003 level. The Provost advised

Board that arising from the availability of once-off streams of income and assuming that the HEA will fund Benchmarking and IMLT up to 31st December 2003 it will be possible to meet about €3m of the shortfall in this way, strictly for one year only. The Board noted that this will leave an estimated deficit in the order of €5m in 2003/2004 in addition to the reduction in expenditure already in train for the year.

The Provost invited Board's attention to the following options which the Executive Officer Group had reviewed in trying to identify ways in which the College might meet its obligations in 2003/2004 within the context of the Universities Act 1997:

- borrowing
- selling an asset
- incurring deficits
- revenue generation
- further reduction in pay
- deferring payment of the sustaining progress pay award
- reintroduction of fees
- reduction of departmental balances

The Provost also invited Board's attention to the following recommendations that Executive Officers proposed be presented for consideration which in summary are:

- (a) 2003/2004 targets for financial savings for Faculties/Departments will be set on the basis of *cista communis* funded Faculty/Departmental non-pay and recurrent equipment credit/unspent reserves/balances at 30th September 2003 which will amount to some €4.8m.
- (b) Recognising that the distribution of reserves/balances across faculties and departments is uneven, and that some departments have a deficit in the *cista communis* accounts, overspent balances will continue to be carried by the relevant departments, so that there is no question of some departments being penalised to make up for the inability of other departments to operate within budget.
- (c) There will be a full year's non-pay allocation to the Deans' Committee in 2003/2004 equal to the allocation made in 2002/2003 (€2,418,120). This means that expenditure by departments will be maintained at the same level as previously.
- (d) The targets set will be in addition to non-pay commitments already made to fulfil pay savings targets arising from the €5m pay saving targets applicable from 1st October 2003.
- (e) A policy for future years should be developed by the Executive Officers in relation to unspent *cista communis* reserves/balances in faculties and departments.
- (f) Subject to funding available on completion of the 2004 detailed estimates, it is expected that a recurrent equipment allocation in 2003/2004 of €600,000, in line with the recommendation of the Financial Review Advisory Group Report of 26th May 2003, will be made.
- (g) In the context of maintaining overall student numbers to ensure that State funding is not depleted through unfavourable unit cost comparisons with other universities, there will be a need for the College to review the viability of some courses, and how numbers can be redistributed between disciplines, between undergraduate and postgraduate courses, and between EU and non-EU students.
- (h) A review of the burden of 2002/2003 cuts in non-pay baselines reveals that 19% of the cuts applied to academic areas while 81% of the non-pay cuts applied to service and administrative areas (mainly from Library, Information Systems Services and Premises maintenance); further reductions in pay and non-pay allocations, in the order of €1m, will be made in the Service/Administrative areas, on a once-off basis.
- (i) There will be an emergency fund of €800,000 available to deal with non-pay crises in both the academic and administrative support areas.

(j) The temporary emergency arrangements currently in place to deal with pay costs/staffing decisions (already funded by FRAG2) for the next number of months should continue to be in place pending the bringing forward of a proposal from Executive Officers in December 2003 to address the management of pay costs in 2003/04 which will not compromise pay savings opportunities in 2004/2005.

In the ensuing discussion the following issues were raised by student, and other members of Board, the former expressing concern that they had not been consulted in the preparation of the document under consideration:

- (a) Services to students are currently under severe strain, some are almost at breaking point and the application of further cuts in funds to IS Services and the Library will have very serious implications for the student body as a whole.
- (b) The proposals for 2003/2004 do not, in their view, appear to have been framed in a strategic manner and the consequences for students have not been adequately addressed.
- (c) In order to protect services to students, consideration should be given to achieving the €1m savings, currently being sought from the service and administration areas, from unspent balances in academic departments, with an option to refund those departments as soon as funding should become available; alternatively consideration should be given to allocating the emergency fund to the maintenance of student services.
- (e) The reduction in services for students could result in fewer overseas postgraduate students applying to come to College in the future.
- (f) Consideration should not be given to the re-introduction of fees.

In the course of a long discussion the following comments were made by Board members:

- (g) The distribution of unspent balances is uneven across College with some departments having been able to accumulate funds in this way, while others did not have the opportunity to do so.
- (h) The potential to avail themselves of the current buoyant funding environment for research is not possible for all departments and there are large segments of the College for whom external research funds are extremely difficult to source.
- (i) Funding for research overhead costs should be reinvested in IS Services and equipment required to support research.
- (j) Reducing funds for maintaining the fabric of the College is a false economy and will lead to higher costs in the long-term.
- (k) Efforts must be intensified in the process of making the public and public representatives aware of the position.
- (l) The government's approach to the funding of third level education, both the core grant and research funds, raises significant questions in relation the perceived role of university education in Irish society, with an increasing emphasis being placed on funding activities from which a discernible commercial gain will be assured.

In response to queries the Treasurer advised Board that:

- (i) If the recommendation in relation to departmental balances were to be approved, all departmental non-pay accounts and recurrent equipment accounts which are funded from the *cista communis* and which were in credit on 30 September 2003 will have the amount of their balances on that date deducted from their accounts with immediate effect.
- (ii) Funding to support Nursing students is protected.
- (iii) Under the proposed arrangements, service and administration areas will be required to provide significantly increased levels of services without any increase in budget.

- (iv) It is anticipated that, as proposed, the reduction of departmental balances is to be a once-off action but that the outcome of the HEA review may have an impact in this regard.
- (v) All commitments for non-pay and equipment expenditure which were notified by departments to the Treasurer's Office for inclusion in accounts to 30 September 2003 will be honoured, and payment for new equipment which had not been notified in this way must come from this year's allocation (see point (f), page 3 above).

In response to a query in relation to options being considered for 2004/2005, the Secretary advised Board that there were no specific plans in relation to out-sourcing or redundancies at this time and that any proposals in relation to these matters would be discussed with the relevant staff representative groups.

The Board noted the Senior Lecturer's comments in relation to the difficulties faced by the Executive Officers in formulating proposals to address a financial situation which has been imposed on the College by the government, noting that the proposals were formulated so as to try and minimise the impact on students while at the same time maintain the academic core activities of the College.

In response to a query, the Bursar advised Board that the Executive Officers had given serious consideration to reducing departmental balances by an amount equivalent to the department's annual allocation and providing no allocation in the current year, but concluded that this would have very serious consequences for those departments which had no positive balances at 30 September 2003, noting that in the view of Executive Officers, the current proposals represented a more equitable approach.

The Provost, in response to the comments made, advised Board that the impacts of the reduction in budget in all areas of the College will need to be quantified and advised to the government in making any case for a reinstatement of previous funding levels. The Provost also invited Board's attention to the proposal that a policy in relation to departmental balances should be developed (see point (e), page 3 above). In response to queries in relation to any possible reintroduction of student fees the Provost advised Board that this would be a sectoral issue, noting that the OECD review of the sector which will be carried out during 2004 may raise issues in this regard.

The Board, agreeing that the emergency fund must be available to all areas of the College and not be allocated in advance to any specific area, agreed that proposals in relation to the administration of the fund and other issues in relation to the implementation of the recommendations would be considered at the next meeting.

In response to a query, the Provost advised Board that information in relation to the financial difficulties would be outlined to staff at the forthcoming staff meetings.

The Provost invited the Board's attention to the very difficult task of planning for 2004/2005 which will commence as soon provisions have been put in place to address the expected short-fall in funds for the current year, noting that proposals in this regard must be agreed by April 2004.

The Board approved the recommendations as presented in the memorandum dated 21 November 2003; the student representatives dissented.

- 3/75 Strategic Plan Implementation Due to the unavailability of time the Board agreed to defer discussion of the following Strategic Plan actions until its next meeting:
 - (a) Research;

- (b) Developing Human Resources and Physical Infrastructure;
- (c) Governance and Stewardship of Resources.
- 3/76 **Risk Management in College** The Secretary invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 10 November 2003, which had been circulated outlining the current approach to risk assessment in College together with proposals for a formalised approach to risk management. Following a brief discussion of the issues raised, the Board agreed that the following approach should be adopted and reviewed after one year of operation:
 - (a) all administrative areas should complete a risk assessment exercise, with risks arising from inter-dependence being addressed by the Senior Administrators' Group;
 - (b) academic risks identified in the Departmental Review/quality assurance process should be advised to the Academic Secretary/Senior Lecturer and addressed through the Deans' Committee, to Council, and thence to Board, via the Executive Officers' group;
 - (c) the Principal Committee with responsibility for each area should be advised of risks identified, and the process for addressing them;
 - (d) the Executive Officers' Group should consider the overall levels of risk, review the adequacy of proposals for their management, and consider the acceptability or otherwise of certain risks in the context of the risks/cost benefit ratios associated with such risks; the Executive Officers' Group should be responsible for prioritising the risks in its report to Board;
 - (e) the Provost should bring forward a consolidated report to Board for its consideration on an annual basis.

In response to a query, the Secretary advised Board that any costs incurred in the risk assessment exercises would be borne by individual areas or departments.

In approving the above proposals, the Board agreed that the Executive Officers' Group should complete its deliberations in October of each year, and that the Provost's report should be brought to Board early in Michaelmas Term so that any issues arising therefrom would be known to Board in advance of the Auditors' report in January of each year.

3/77 School of Pharmacy – Accreditation of Course – Visitation by Pharmaceutical Society of Ireland The Senior Lecturer invited Board's attention to developments which had taken place in relation to the School of Pharmacy. In particular, the Board, noting that Mrs I Hook had been elected as Head of the School, approved her appointment with immediate effect until the appointment to the Chair of Pharmacy. The Board also noted that the Pharmaceutical Society of Ireland (PSI) had formally visited the College on 25 November and that the Dean of Science, the Head of the School and the College Officers had agreed to prepare a written plan of action for submission to the PSI by 20 December 2003, which if implemented, should ensure accreditation for the B.Sc (Pharm.) in March 2004.

The Senior Lecturer advised Board that the course content for Senior Sophister students had not been adversely affected by the recent difficulties in the School and that the plans currently being prepared would address the disruption which had been experienced by students in the other years' courses.

The Secretary invited Board's attention to the approval given by the Board at its meeting on 2 July 2003 (Minute 16/337 refers) to appoint a Chair in the School of Pharmacy no later than October 2005 and to identify funding to cover the costs of one permanent lectureship to which an appointment would be made in the current academic year. Two 2-year contract posts are also being filled from Faculty funds. The Board noted that these commitments would be part of the plan being prepared for the PSI.

- **Robert Emmet Bicentennial** In response to a query, the Secretary advised Board that as previously agreed by Board (Minute 1/20 of 24 September 2003 refers), a permanent commemoration to Robert Emmet would be put in place in College and sought suggestions as to how best this might be achieved.
- 3/79 **Douglas Hyde Gallery** Under Other Business the Board noted and approved the appointment of Dr Yvonne Scott (to replace Professor Dennis Kennedy) as a Board nominee to the Board of the Douglas Hyde Gallery.
- **Scholarship** Under Other Business the Board approved the Senior Lecturer's request in request of the following:
 - (a) permission for a Foundation Scholar (00003557) to intermit in the academic years 2004-5 and 2005-06 constituting two years of intermission;
 - (b) permission for a Non-Foundation Scholar (97308323) to intermit in the academic year 2003-04, constituting a third year of intermission, having previously intermitted in 2001-02 and 2002-03.
- **Finance Committee** The Board noted and approved the Minutes of the meeting of the Finance Committee held on 1 October 2003. Particular reference was made to the following:

2004/26 Trust Funds (Benefactions) Financial Statements for the year ended 30 June 2003 The Board approved the Trust Funds (Benefactions) Financial Statements for the year ended 30 June 2003 in respect of which an unqualified audit opinion had been issued. The Board noted correspondence from PricewaterhouseCoopers indicating that no changes were recommended to the accounts as presented by the Treasurer and that the format of financial reporting had been reviewed and deemed appropriate in the context of the Common Investment Scheme (Trust Deed).

The Board, noting that the Audit Committee had indicated that it had no concerns in relation to the Trust Funds which it wished to bring to the attention of Board, agreed that they should be signed, further noting the confidentiality of the material contained therein.

Consideration of the memorandum in relation to the Pension Fund and Pension Supplementation from the Secretary and the Treasurer, dated 22 October 2003, which had been circulated, was deferred until the next meeting.

- 3/82 Site and Facilities Committee The Board noted the Minutes of the Site and Facilities Committee from its meeting of 4 November 2003 as circulated and approved the recommendations.
- 3/83 **Personnel and Appointments Committee** Following a clarification in relation to the IS Services Database Administrator/Software Developer, the Board approved the recommendations of the Personnel and Appointments Committee from its meeting of 24 October 2003 which had been circulated.

In response to a query, the Secretary advised the Board that a policy in relation to Chair appointments is currently being developed.

- **Academic Appeals Committee** The Board noted and approved the Minutes of the Academic Appeals Committee of 3 October 2003, as circulated.
- 3/85 **Board Membership** The Board noted that Mr Michael Dowling had been elected President of the Graduate Students' Union on 7 November 2003 and would replace Mr Dylan Scammell as a member of the Board.
- 3/86 **Higher Degrees** The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 21 October 2003, as circulated.
- **Proctors' Lists for Autumn Commencements** The Board noted that the Proctors' Lists were approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 4 and 13 November 2003.

3/88 Sealing The Board noted:

Enterprise Centre, Pearse Street – Memorandum of Rent Review The Seal of the College was put in duplicate to a Memorandum of Rent Review on Units 3.1 and 3.2 (Deirdre McGuire). [6/11/03]

3/89 Bequests and Benefactions

- (a) **John A Boland Memorial Prize** The Board noted and approved memorandum from the Treasurer, circulated dated 14 November 2003;
- (b) **Dr Leonard Nurock deceased** The Board noted and approved memorandum from the Treasurer, circulated dated 14 November 2003.

3/90 Prizes and Other Awards

(a) TCD Association and Trust – Grant Applications – Michaelmas Term 2003 The Board noted and approved the recommendation of the TCD Association and Trust in relation to the Research Fund, and noted its recommendations in relation to the General Fund, circulated dated 17 November 2003, as follows:

Research Fund

€

- (a) Graduate Studies Committee: towards post-doctoral, post- 32,000 graduate travel
- (b) Professor W T Coffey (Electronic and Electrical Engineering): 1,200 towards cost of publication of RIA Symposium on 'Diffusion and relaxation in Disordered Fractal Systems' (September 2002)
- (c) Dr E J McParland (History of Art/Russian/Early Printed 1,150 Books): to enable senior curator from the Hermitage Museum, St Petersburg, to visit College and report on a recent discovery in the Dept of Early Printed Books.

General Fund

- (d) Prof J B Grimson (Vice-Provost) to support Symposium, 10,000 commissioning and performance of Fanfare to celebrate 100th anniversary of entry of women to TCD (e) Dr D E Thomas (Crèche): essential catering equipment to 4,000 supply meals for children to comply with European legislation St Vincent de Paul: funding for (1) Trinity Club (2) Kids Club (f) 2,640 (3) Flat Decorating Professor W E Lyons (Philosophy): up to a maximum of €7,200: (g) max to provide €2 for each €1 raised by Department towards 7.200 production costs of promotional video for School Guidance Teachers for School and Mature Students and for display on College Open Day
- (h) Professor A E Murphy (Economics): development of play, 2,500 *Millionaires*, so that it may be staged in 2004
- (i) Dr Y Gun'ko (Chemistry): once-off grant for bursaries for JF 5,000 Advanced Materials Students
- (b) **E C Smith Scholarship 2003-04** to approve the award of the E C Smith Scholarship in Pathology (€9,523.04 per annum) to Miss Susanne Cahill for the academic year 2003-04;
- (c) Entrance Exhibitions Report 2003 The Board noted and approved the Senior Lecturer's recommendations, as set out in a memorandum, circulated dated 18 November 2003, together with additional recommendations for 2003 Awards, circulated dated 18 November 2003;
- (d) **John Bennet Fund** The Board noted and approved the recommendation on behalf of the Governors of Erasmus Smith Schools that Mr Benedict Okonji be awarded this bursary for the academic year 2003-04, value €507.90.
- **3/91 Christmas Closure** in view of the College's current financial difficulties the Board approved, without setting a precedent, a change in the opening day of the College after the Christmas break from Friday 2 January to Monday 5 January 2004.
- **Nominations for Appointment** The Board approved nominations for appointment, as circulated (see Appendix 1 to these Minutes), and noted nominations as tabled:
 - (a) **Edward Kennedy Chair in Health Policy and Management** Professor Charles Edward Murray Normand, BS (Stir), DPhil (York), FFPH from 1 January 2004;
 - (b) Erasmus Smith's Chair of Mathematics (1762) Professor Adrian Constantin, DEA (Nice), Masters Pure Maths (Nice), PhD (Courant Inst. NY), Habil (Zur) from 1 September 2004.
- 3/93 **Staff Matters Early Retirement** The Board noted and approved requests for early retirement, on a cost neutral basis to the Pension Fund, from the following:
 - (a) Ms D Gill (Provost's Office) 30 November 2003;

- (b) Ms P Gillard (Housekeeping) 23 December 2003.
- 3/94 Permissions Library The Board noted and approved memorandum from the Librarian, circulated dated 18 November 2003, for the loan of books to MART Museum, Trento, Italy, for the exhibition, 'Mountain, from Leonardo to Beuys between science and art', 19 December 2003 to 17 April 2004.
- 3/95 Nominating Committees The Board noted the following memberships:
 - (a) Director of Buildings Office Telecoms Administrative Officer (permanent post)

Bursar

Director of Buildings

Ms P Gray

Mr R Cottrell

(b) Faculty of Health Sciences/Treasurer's Office – Administrative Officer (3) Finance (3-year contract post)

Dean of Health Sciences

Professor K P Conlon

Deputy Treasurer

Ms F McNamara

(c) Senior Lecturer's Office/Information Systems Services – SAS Business Analyst (permanent post)

Academic Secretary

Ms P Callaghan

Mr M Nowlan

(d) Director of Buildings Office – Buildings Co-ordinator (permanent post)

Deputy Director of Buildings

Mr B Leahy

Mrs I L I Hook

Ms N Lloyd

(e) Centre for Academic Practice and Student Learning* (CAPSL) - Academic Developer (1-year contract post)

Senior Lecturer

Dr D Kelly

Dr M Fellenz

- * proposed to Board rather than to Council because the committee will meet before the next Council meeting.
- **Tutorship** The Board noted and approved memorandum from the Senior Tutor circulated dated 19 November 2003.

Signed:	
Date:	

Appendix 1 to Minute 3/92

Nominations for Appointment

Department	Post	Name and Qualifications	Start date	Termination date (if contract)
Careers Advisory Service	Careers Advisor (Term-time)	RYAN, Sarah Jane; BA (Dubl.); PG Dip Statistics (Dubl.); Cert Education Management of an Adult Guidance Service (NUI)	01.12.2003	30.04.2005
Faculty of Health Sciences	Faculty Secretary	MCNAMARA, Fedelma, BBS (U.L.)	03.11.2003	Permanent
Genetics	Administrative Officer	BROWNE-TRIGOUB, Nadia, BA (Moscow State); Dip French and English (Moscow) H. Dip (Moscow State)	15.09.2003	14.09.2004
Information System Services	Software Developer	WATSON, Andrew, BA (NUI); LLB(NUI); H.Dip Systems Analysis (UCG)	01.11.2003	Permanent
Senior Lecturer's Area	Manager SAS Unit	O'HARA, Helen, BSc Financial Information Systems (Dubl.)	19.01.2004	Permanent