

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 24 September 2003

Present Provost (Dr J Hegarty), Registrar (Mr R A Stalley), Bursar (Dr J W O'Hagan), Senior Lecturer (Dr S M Greene), Dr S P A Allwright, Mr B Connolly, Dr L E Doyle, Dr S Duffy, Dr J A Fitzpatrick*, Ms H Fychan, Ms A-M Gatling, Dr H Gibbons, Mr H Kearns, Ms M Leahy, Dr J G Lunney, Mr M Miley, Mr D Scammell, Dr J C Sexton, Dr F Shevlin, Dr D L Weaire, Dr T T West**.

Apologies Vice-Provost (Dr J B Grimson), Dr C Horn, Dr J M Mossman, Dr A N M Ní Chasaide, Mrs J O'Hara, Ms E K Stokes.

In attendance

(ex officio) Secretary, Treasurer, Assistant Secretary.

(by invitation) Staff Secretary for Minute 1/14.

(present for) *1/1 to 1/13; ** 1/1 to 1/13 (pt)

1/1 Minutes The Minutes of the meeting held on 9 July 2003 were approved and signed subject to the following amendment:

Appendix 1 to Minute 17/362 The degrees awarded to the penultimate name on page 19 were amended to read:

JORDAN, Peter, BA (Dubl), BAI (Dubl), PhD (Dubl)

1/2 Matters Arising from the Minutes A number of matters arising from the Minutes were discussed and have been recorded below, (see Minutes 1/3, 1/4, 1/5, 1/6, 1/7, 1/8, 1/9, 1/10, 1/11, 1/12).

1/3 Disciplinary Matter (see Minute 17/355 of 9 July 2003) The Secretary advised Board that the hearing of the Disciplinary Panel will take place on 21 October 2003, noting that the College had been advised that the staff member involved had indicated that he may refer the matter to the Supreme Court.

1/4 Haughton Institute (see Minute 17/357 of 9 July 2003) The Provost advised Board that the conditions which the Board had approved as being necessary for the College's continued involvement in the Haughton Institute had been forwarded to the Board of the Institute, noting that the Institute's own review of its operations is underway.

1/5 Board Elections (see Minute 17/358 of 9 July 2003) The Board noted that a paper from the working group on Board elections would be presented to the next Board meeting. In

response to a query, the Secretary advised Board that the working group had been established to look specifically at issues in relation to the election of Board members and that revision of the Statutes was a matter for the Registrar noting that the Universities Act and the College's Private Act take precedence over certain Statutes.

- 1/6 Kennedy Chair in Health Services Management and Policy (see Minute 17/367 of 9 July 2003)** The Secretary advised Board that Professor Normand will take up his position as Professor in Health Services Management and Policy on 1 January 2004.
- 1/7 Dean of Students (see Minute 17/368 of 9 July 2003)** The Board approved the Provost's nomination of Mr B D R Misstear as Dean of Students, noting that as Mr Misstear is currently on leave of absence he will not take up this position until 1 January 2004. The Board noted the concern expressed by the student representatives at the delay in having a Dean of Students in place.
- 1/8 Seanad Reform (see Minute 17/369 of 9 July 2003)** The Registrar advised Board that a copy of the College's submission on Seanad Electoral Reform to the Oireachtas sub-committee will be circulated to all Board members. The Board, noting that Mr Connolly welcomed the consideration of Seanad related matters by the Board, further noted his disappointment at the limited scope of the proposals made by the College in this regard.
- 1/9 Advisory Committee on Honorary Degrees (see Minute 17/370 of 9 July 2003)** The Registrar invited Board's attention to an issue which had arisen in relation to the specific Honorary Degree which it had been agreed would be awarded to a named candidate. Having reviewed the circumstances as outlined by the Registrar, the Board approved the awarding of an Honorary LL.D. to the candidate instead of the previously approved Litt.D.
- 1/10 Visitor to the College (See Minute 17/373 of 9 July 2003)** The Board noted that, in accordance with the procedures laid down in the Statutes and following consideration of two nominees proposed by the Senate of the University, the Government had appointed Mr Justice Brian McCracken as Visitor to replace Mr Justice Henry Barron.
- 1/11 College Policies (a) Information Policy Committee (see Minute 17/380 of 9 July 2003)** Dr Sexton invited the Board's attention to difficulties which the approved Information Systems Security Policy pose for the operation of the High Performance Computing Centre. The Board agreed that all issues arising from the implementation of Board policies should, in the first instance, be considered by the Principal Committee at which the policy proposals are formulated prior to their presentation to Board. The Bursar, noting that the policy had been considered at a number of meetings of the Information Policy Committee, agreed to discuss the matter with the Director of IS Services and to refer it to the Information Policy Committee for further consideration.
- 1/12 Committees 2003-04 – Catering Management Committee (see Minute 17/387 of 9 July 2003)** The Board referred Ms Leahy's request that a member of the Catering Staff be included as a member of the Catering Management Committee to the Finance Committee.
- 1/13 2003-2004: Financial and Related Issues** Introducing the topic, the Provost invited Board's attention to the actions which had been taken by the College during the previous year to

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

address the very sharp decrease in government funding for the university sector in 2002/2003 and the anticipated cut in 2003/2004. The Board noted that the Financial Review Advisory Group, which had been established for the specific purpose of addressing the financial crisis, had presented an interim report to Board in January 2003 (see Minute 8/156 of 29 January 2003) and a final report in July 2003 (see Minute 16/333 of 2 July 2003) and that the Board had approved the Group's recommendations on both occasions. The Provost advised Board that, in common with all universities in the sector, the impacts of the required reductions in staffing and services were causing difficulties in all areas of College. The Board noted that indications were that there would be no improvement in the government's allocation to the sector for the foreseeable future, further noting that a further cut in the block-grant was likely in the current year.

The Provost invited Board's attention to the following issues which the Executive Officers have proposed should be examined thoroughly in the context of both the College's Strategic Plan and the declining government funding for the sector. The Board noted the issues under two broad headings (a) alternative sources of funds and (b) the College's operations and core activities:

- (a) **Alternative sources of funds**
 - (i) Opportunities for recruitment of international students
 - (ii) Raising income from physical assets by way of rent or sale
 - (iii) Research income
 - (iv) Philanthropic income
 - (v) Reintroduction of fees

- (b) **College's operations**
 - (i) Resource Allocation
 - (ii) Flexibility to respond to opportunities
 - (iii) Quality and relevance of courses, departments and schools
 - (iv) Provision of services and the opportunities for out-sourcing
 - (v) Overall management of resources

The Provost invited Board's attention to the urgency with which these issues need to be addressed in the current year noting that action in these areas will require the support of all members of the College if the current financial crisis is to be addressed.

The Treasurer invited Board's attention to the decline in the government block-grant for the sector which has been evident over the past ten years, noting that allocations have not kept pace with pay and non-pay increases which the College has had to fund. The Treasurer also invited the Board's attention to the correspondence from the HEA in July 2003 requesting that all expenditure items are kept under review and that the College ensures that all activities (including staffing and other spending proposals) will not result in future commitments that the College cannot meet from its own resources.

The Treasurer advised Board that the publication of the Book of Estimates in November 2003 will provide the first indication about the likely allocation for 2004 but that firm notification of the block-grant will not be available until February 2004 at the earliest. The Treasurer invited the Board's attention to a number of issues such as provision for benchmarking pay awards and the obligations of the Part-Time Workers Act which will put the College's finances under pressure on an on-going basis, noting that it is not clear whether these commitments will be fully taken into account in determining the College's block-grant for 2004.

In discussing the issues raised by the Provost and the Treasurer, the need for a sectoral approach in making representations to the Minister for Education and Science and in

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

communicating the message to the general public was stressed by a number of Board members.

In response to a query, the Bursar advised Board that the principle of equal pain in relation to the financial cuts was a crude instrument in response to an immediate crisis and that the College will need to be more strategic in the application of financial control in the future.

The Board noted Ms Gatling's concerns about any proposed reintroduction of tuition fees and Ms Fychan's comments on the impact which reduced services is having on students. The Board also noted comments in relation to the need to improve services for international students.

In response to a query as to what actions will be taken to address the issues raised, the Provost advised Board that Executive Officers will develop proposals, through the relevant Principal Committees, for consideration and discussion by Board in due course. The Board noted the need for wide consultation with the College Community. The Provost invited Board members to contribute suggestions and/or observations directly to him or through the Board representatives on the relevant Committees.

- 1/14 Partnership** The Staff Secretary, present by invitation, invited the Board's attention to two documents which had been tabled: (a) a proposal for the establishment of a Partnership Committee and (b) a template for Higher Education Institutions' Action Plans under Sustaining Progress as defined by the Education Sector Performance Verification Group (ESPVG).

The Staff Secretary advised Board that the proposal to establish a Partnership Committee had its origins in the commitments to partnership which were fundamental elements of National Wage Agreements since Partnership 2000, noting that the definitions of partnership set out in the National Agreements provide the context for the partnership structure in College. The Staff Secretary advised Board that in order to progress matters, in the absence of a formal Partnership Committee, a working group had been established, chaired by the Vice-Provost, to agree the Action Plan for submission by the Provost to the Education Sector Performance Verification Group by 26 September 2003. The Board noted that the proposals in relation to the establishment of a Partnership Committee had been considered and approved by the Personnel and Appointments Committee at its meeting on 22 September 2003.

The Staff Secretary invited the Board's attention to the proposed Terms of Reference and membership of the Partnership Committee, noting that it was proposed that the Partnership Committee would review these terms of reference within two years. The Board noted the proposal that, once established, the Committee would undertake appropriate training and that the College would become a member of the Skillnets Partnership Programme. In response to a query, the Staff Secretary advised Board that funds are available from the HEA for specific partnership activities including training. The Staff Secretary also advised Board that the Partnership Committee will not replace established staff relations procedures.

In response to a request from Ms Gatling that a student representative be included as a member of the Partnership Committee, the Staff Secretary advised Board that this issue had been discussed in detail by the working group. The Board noted that, in view of the fact that the primary focus of the Committee is employer/employee relations and that the Committee is at a very early stage of development, the working group considered it premature to include students as members at this time; the working group had agreed that the matter would be reviewed in due course. The Board approved the establishment of the Partnership Committee as proposed and requested that the Committee consider inviting a student representative to attend its meetings as an observer.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The Staff Secretary invited Board's attention to the draft Action Plan which had been tabled and advised Board that the implementation of the specific actions contained in the Plan would be the responsibility of managers of specific programmes and activities in College. In response to concerns expressed by a number of Board members over the very short-time scale in which the Action Plan was prepared and its resource implications for the College, the Staff Secretary advised Board that the working group had considered all such issues very carefully in the preparation of the plan and advised that the proposed actions were based on the Strategic Plan and would be introduced on a phased basis throughout the College. The Board noted that the decision on whether the College can make the Sustaining Progress and Benchmarking payments will be made by the Secretary General of the Department of Education and Science based on progress reports from the Provost and the Partnership Committee and an assessment by the ESPVG in advance of each payment date.

The Board agreed that the implementation of the Action Plan would be kept under review.

- 1/15 St Catherine's College of Education for Home Economics** Under Other Business the Registrar advised Board that the College had very recently received notification that the Department of Education and Science intended to close St Catherine's College. The Board noted that this decision had been made without any consultation with Trinity or the staff in St Catherine's and that discussions on the implications for Trinity were due to take place as soon as possible.
- 1/16 Verification of Audit** Under Other Business the Board approved the draft letter to the HEA, which had been tabled, verifying the issues identified in the agreed procedures for the financial governance of Irish universities which the Provost is required to address following the audit of the College's financial statements.
- 1/17 Permissions – Library** Under Other Business the Board granted permission for the loan of Jean Puget de la Serre, *Le secrétaire à la mode*, (Paris, 1640) shelf mark: Fag.II.4.50 to the National Gallery of Ireland for inclusion in the Gallery's exhibition, 'Love letters: Dutch paintings in the age of Vermeer'.
- 1/18 Nominating Committee** Under Other Business the Board approved the following membership:
- Senior Lecturer's Office – Administrative Officer (Permanent post)**
 Assistant Secretary
 Academic Secretary or Assistant Academic Secretary
 Mr R B Otway Norwood
- 1/19 Technical Staff Committee – 2003 Review** Under Other Business the Board approved the following recommendations for promotion, effective from 1 October 2003, as set out in the Staff Secretary's memorandum, tabled dated 25 September 2003:
- (a) **Physiology** Mr David Fletcher;
 - (b) **Information Systems Services** Mr Paul Jones;
 - (c) **Geology** Ms Maura Morgan;
 - (c) **Civil, Structural and Environmental Engineering** Mr Michael Harris;
 - (d) **Microbiology** Mr Joseph O'Connell; Mr Patrick Reid.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

- 1/20 **Robert Emmet Bicentennial** In response to a query from Dr Duffy the Board agreed that every effort would be made to commemorate the bicentennial of Robert Emmet's death in some permanent way in College during the course of the current year.
- 1/21 **Pensions for Part-time Staff** Under Other Business, in response to a query, the Secretary advised Board that all members of the part-time staff are eligible to avail themselves of the College's PRSA scheme.
- 1/22 **Personnel and Appointments Committee** The Board, noting the recommendations of the Personnel and Appointments Committee from its meeting of 12 September 2003 which had been circulated, agreed that the procedure for house loan purchases as applied to part-time staff would be referred to the Finance Committee for consideration. The Board approved all other recommendations.

The Board approved the recommendations of the Personnel and Appointments Committee from its meeting of 22 September 2003 which had been tabled. In response to a query in relation to a specific appointment from the Strategic Fund the Provost advised Board that the recommendations were made on the basis of the bids received and an assessment as to how they would contribute to the achievement of the College's strategic objectives.

- 1/23 **Allocation of Financial Resources: Structures, Management and Systems Working Group (see Minute 16/333 of 2 July 2003)** The Board noted and approved the following membership:

Professor J A Murray *Chair*
 Bursar
 Professor J Ohlmeyer
 Professor D B Shanley
 Professor D L Weaire
 Treasurer
 Academic Secretary

In response to a query from Ms Gatling the Provost advised Board that the membership of the proposed Working Group was determined by individuals' expertise in relation to financial resource allocation and was not a representative group.

- 1/24 **Visitors**
- (a) **Appeal** The Board noted that in the matter of an appeal by a postgraduate student a settlement had been reached between the student and the College.
- (b) **Dubium** The Board noted that, in the case of a Senior Fellow who had retired early from the College, the Visitors had ruled that he is a Fellow *Emeritus* from the date of his retirement.
- 1/25 **Agreement with St Patrick's Hospital – Pre-Registration Bachelor in Science in Nursing Programme** The Board noted that an agreement between the College and St Patrick's Hospital has been signed, dated 20 January 2003, for pre-Registration Bachelor in Science in Nursing Programme.
- 1/26 **Committees – Site and Facilities Committee** The Board noted that Mr R Adams has been appointed to membership of this committee.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

- 1/27 Reid Entrance Exhibition – Trust Fund** The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Treasurer, circulated dated 15 July 2003.
- 1/28 Sealings** The Board noted:
- (a) **1-2 College Green, Dublin 2** The Seal of the College was put to the Particulars and Conditions of Sale of 1-2 College Green, Dublin 2 by the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin to Treasury CMBS Limited. [5/8/03]
 - (b) **4-5 College Green, Dublin 2** The Seal of the College was put to the:
 - (i) Particulars and Conditions of Sale of 999 years of 4-5 College Green, Dublin 2 to Soffan Limited, and
 - (ii) Particulars and Conditions of Sale of Sub-Lease of 4-5 College Green, Dublin 2 by the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin to Soffan Limited. [5/8/03]
 - (c) **3 College Green – Lease of Basement and Ground Floor** The Seal of the College was put to a lease between the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin, Bobbio Limited and Castlemarket Holdings Limited regarding the Basement and Ground Floor of 3 College Green, Dublin 2. [5/8/03]
 - (d) **Investment Management Agreement** The Seal of the College was put in duplicate to an Investment Management Agreement between the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and Irish Life Investment Managers (ILIM). [20/8/03]
 - (e) **Health Sciences Building, Tallaght Hospital** The Seal of the College was put in triplicate to an Engrossment of the Licence permitting the College to building the Health Sciences Centre at Tallaght Hospital. [25/8/03]
 - (f) **Trinity Hall** The Seal of the College was put to:
 - (i) A Charge over a Bank Account between the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and Allied Irish Banks plc (in duplicate);
 - (ii) An Equipment Lease Agreement between Cluremay Ltd and the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin (in duplicate);
 - (iii) An Agreement for Lease dated 27 November 2001 between the Investors and the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin. [11/9/03]
- 1/29 Bequests and Benefactions**
- (a) **Patrick O'Brian deceased – Interest on Legacy** The Board noted a memorandum from Treasurer, circulated dated 11 August 2003.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

- (b) **Caricatures by 'DH'** The Board recorded with appreciation the gift of three original caricatures of College staff by 'DH' from Mrs Elizabeth Alston (née Waterhouse) (MA, 1952).
- 1/30 Scholarship – Requests to Intermit** The Board noted and approved the request of the Senior Lecturer, with the agreement of the Dean of Graduate Studies, that the following be allowed to intermit their Non-Foundation Scholarships in the academic year 2003-2004, constituting a second year of intermission in cases (a) to (c) and a third year of intermission in case (d):
- (a) 98031074;
 (b) 98742400;
 (c) 98951050;
 (d) 97075469.
- 1/31 Nominations for Appointment** The Board approved the revised list of nominations for appointment, as tabled (see Appendix 1 to these Minutes).
- 1/32 Administrative and Library Staff Review - Recommendations** The Board approved the recommendations of the Administrative and Library Staff Review Committee from its meeting of 16 September 2003 in respect of the following promotions in accordance with the memorandum from the Staff Secretary, circulated dated 17 September 2003. The recommendations will take effect from 1 October 2003.
- (a) **Director of Buildings Office** Ms Ita Keenan;
 (b) **Department of Sport** Ms Michelle Bennett;
 (c) **Treasurer's Office** Mr William O'Connor;
 (d) **Information Systems Services** Ms Nicola Kelly; Mr Neil Homan; Ms Una Lynch;
 (e) **Centre for Learning Technology** Ms Catherine Kane;
 (f) **Faculty of Health Sciences** Ms Aine Wade; Ms Fidelma McNamara; Mr Frank O'Rourke;
 (g) **Faculty of Engineering and Systems Sciences** Mr M Slevin;
 (h) **Faculty of Business, Economic and Social Studies** Ms Pamela Hennessy;
 (i) **Faculty of Science** Ms Aileen Treacy; Ms Fidelma Haffey;
 (j) **Faculty of Arts (Humanities)** Ms Michelle Le Good;
 (k) **Faculty of Arts (Letters)** Ms Orla Sheehan;
 (l) **Senior Lecturer's Area** Ms Lynne Balfe; Ms Penney Storey;
 (m) **Staff Office** Ms Karen Roantree; Ms Mairead O'Connor.
- 1/33 Vacation Procedures** The Board noted that the following requests had been approved under Vacation Procedures:
- (a) **Prizes and Other Awards – A J Leventhal Scholarship** awarded to Mr Warren Russell Brown (98156403) (€1,500) and Mr Emmanouil Sisamakias (01167987) (€785);
 (b) **Leave of Absence** Mr A Johnstone (Music) – Michaelmas term 2003;
 (c) **Centre for Academic Practice and Student Learning – Revised Committee Structure** Memorandum from the Senior Lecturer, circulated dated 11 July 2003;
 (d) **Pro-Deanship** the following were appointed Pro-Deans of their Faculties, to act in regard to specific issues:
 (i) Professor J A Murray (Business, Economic and Social Studies);
 (ii) Professor D Taylor (Science);
 (iii) Professor M B Jones (Science).

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

- (e) **Staff Matters – Early Retirements**
 - (i) Ms Sheila Burke (23 October 2003 – normal date 30 September 2004);
 - (ii) Ms Pamela Stotter – retiring on 30 September 2004 on a cost neutral basis.
- (f) **Tutorship** memoranda from the Senior Tutor, circulated dated 11 July and 1 September 2003;
- (g) **Scholarship – Permission to Intermit in 2003-04** (second year of intermission in each case except (iv), being a third year of intermission:
 - (i) 98000241;
 - (ii) 01159909;
 - (iii) 01160681;
 - (iv) 96704012.

The following item of business was deferred:

A.5 Library and College Archives – Annual Report 2001-2002

Signed:

Date:

Appendix 1 to Minute 1/31

Nominations for Appointment

Department	Post	Name and Qualifications	Start date	Termination date (if contract)
Graduate Studies	Administrative Officer Grade 1	Sadowska, Ewa, Dip. History of European Painting (Dubl.), M.Phil. English (Warsaw), M.Litt. (Dubl.) Grad. Dip. Business Studies (N.C.E.A.)	01.11.2003	Permanent
Information Systems Services	Software Developer	Devereux, Susan, H.Dip. Computer Science (N.U.I.) Cert. I.T. (U.C.D.) B.Sc. Environmental Sciences	22.09.03	21.09.04
Institute of Molecular Medicine	Technical Manager	Murphy, Anne, B.A., Ph.D. (Dubl.)	01.09.2003	31.08.2006
Institute of Molecular Medicine	Operations and Administration Manager	Thurai, Tharmarani Raja, B.Sc. (Lond.)	01.09.2003	31.08.2008
Irish Art Research Centre	Director	Scott, Yvonne Dr, B.B.S., M.A., Ph.D. (Dubl.)	01.10.2003	30.09.2006
School of Physic	Administrative Officer Grade 1	Flender, Anja, M.A. (German & Philosophy) (Düsseldorf)	01.08.2003	Permanent
Treasurer's Office	Administrative Officer Grade 2 Fees Section	McHugh, George, B.A. Business Studies (Ulster), B.T.E.C. Cert. Business Studies	28.10.03	Permanent
Library	Assistant Librarian Early Printed Books	Forbes, Corinne, MA (Glas.), Dip.Info. & Library Studies (Strath.)	11.08.2003	Permanent
Library	Assistant Librarian	Madden ,Anne, B.A. (N.U.I.), Dip Mgmt. Law (D.I.T.), B.Sc. (Mgmt.) (Dubl.), Higher Dip. Lib. & Info. Studies (N.U.I.)	06.10.2003	05.10.04