

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 19 February 2003

Present Vice-Provost (Dr J B Grimson), Bursar (Dr J W O'Hagan), Senior Lecturer (Dr S M Greene), Dr S P A Allwright, Mr B Connolly, Dr L E Doyle, Dr S Duffy, Dr J A Fitzpatrick, Dr H Gibbons, Dr C Horn, Mr H Kearns, Ms M Leahy*, Mr I Moynihan, Mr D Scammell, Dr J C Sexton, Dr F Shevlin, Ms E K Stokes, Dr T T West**.

Apologies Provost (Dr J Hegarty), Registrar (Mr R A Stalley), Ms A-M Gatling, Dr J G Lunney, Dr J M Mossman, Dr A N M Ní Chasaide, Mrs J O'Hara, Mr W Priestley, Dr D L Weaire.

In attendance

(ex officio) Secretary, Treasurer, Assistant Secretary.

(by invitation)

(present for) * Minutes 9/175 to 9/192; ** Minutes 9/175 to 9/185.

9/175 Minutes The Minutes of the meeting of 29 January 2003 were approved and signed subject to the following amendments:

8/152 Staff Development Office The correction of the spelling of the word *Manager* on line four.

8/156 Financial Situation The replacement of lines one and two of the sixth paragraph on page three with the following: *'For the year 2003/2004 the Board approved an income target of €0.5m and pay and non-pay savings objectives of €5m and €4m respectively, further agreeing that the Financial Review'* and the addition of the following sentence at the end of the same paragraph: *'Dr Gibbons dissented'*.

9/176 Matters Arising from the Minutes A number of matters arising from the Minutes were discussed and have been recorded below, (see Minutes 9/177, 9/198, 9/179/ 9/180).

9/177 Governance Procedures (see Minute 8/153 of 29 January 2003) In response to a query from Dr Gibbons, the Vice-Provost advised Board that the establishment of a Partnership Committee in College will be discussed by the Personnel and Appointments Committee at its next meeting.

9/178 Provost's Report (see Minute 8/154 of 29 January 2003) The Secretary invited Board's attention to Item C.10 on the Agenda which advised of the forthcoming joint meeting of Board and Council on 2 April 2003 to discuss the Strategic Plan.

9/179 Provost's Report – Report on CHIU Meeting (see Minute 8/155 of 29 January 2003) In response to a query from Ms Stokes, the Treasurer advised Board that the CHIU Finance Officers' Group is preparing a document on the impact of the reduction in State grant for the sector which it will present to the Heads of Universities within the next few weeks.

9/180 Financial Situation (see Minute 8/156 of 29 January 2003) In response to a query from Ms Stokes, the Secretary invited Board's attention to the communications initiatives which had been taken to inform both internal and external audiences about the College's approach to the current financial crisis, noting that a sectoral approach to communicating the consequences of the reduction in funding will be adopted once the full impact is known. The Treasurer advised Board that the grant notification letter from the HEA was expected towards the end of February, following receipt of which the full impact of the reduction in funding will be known. Following a discussion in which the importance of communications on the matter was stressed, the Board agreed that when information on the impact of the cuts to both the College and the sector becomes available it should be communicated to both internal and external audiences.

The Board noted Mr Moynihan's dissatisfaction with the introduction of a printing charge by Information Systems Services and agreed that the charge would be reviewed after one year.

In response to a query from Dr Allwright, the Vice-Provost advised Board that the current difficulties in the Graduate Studies Office will be addressed as a matter of priority. The Bursar also advised Board that the Graduate Studies Office will receive additional office space over the coming months.

9/181 Senior Lecturer's Annual Report, 2001-02 (including Admissions Data for 2002) The Senior Lecturer invited Board's attention to the Annual Report for 2001-02 which had been circulated for the Board meeting held on 18 December 2002, following which Board had requested that it be considered in more detail at a future meeting. Introducing the report, the Senior Lecturer stated that it dealt with areas of academic progress of students (mainly undergraduates) from admission through to graduation. The report began with undergraduate admissions data for 2002, although all remaining data related to the academic year 2001-02. The Senior Lecturer invited Board's attention to elements of the data presented under the following headings:

- (a) **Applications and Admissions:** Trinity attracted 12.6% of first preference applications in the CAO system (12.3% in 2001). There was an overall College ratio of 2.8:1 (3:1 in 2001) first preference applications to course quotas.
- (i) *Degree in Nursing Studies:* The degree programme was introduced in 2002 and applications were processed through the CAO. The course is funded on a student *per capita* basis and there was some concern regarding a shortfall in student numbers.
 - (ii) *Bachelor in Acting Studies:* Admission to this course had been suspended in 2002 and a case was being prepared for submission to the HEA for increased financial support.
 - (iii) *Entrance Exhibitioners:* A total of 470 students were awarded Entrance Exhibitions having achieved 545, or more, entry points. They represent 23% of the Junior Freshman class of 2002/03.
 - (iv) *Matriculation Examination:* Russian has been withdrawn from the matriculation examination and Geology is now the only subject that will continue to be offered; a reason for its continuation is that it is not examined as part of the Leaving Certificate.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

- (v) *Students applying under the Mature Student Dispensation:* The number of applications under the mature student dispensation scheme was 696 in 2002, an increase of 30% on the previous year.
 - (vi) *New Entrant Survey:* Among the issues identified by this survey were that 72% of the 1425 respondents had consulted Trinity's worldwide web pages while 65% had used the College prospectus as a source of information.
 - (vii) *Schools Liaison Activities:* A wide range of schools liaison activities was reported on; considerable improvements have been made in the organisation of the College's Open Day. The Board also noted that the prospectus has been re-designed and that the admissions website is currently being revised and will include an on-line application facility for mature students.
- (b) **Trinity Access Programme (TAP):** The TAP programme encompasses four initiatives that are supported in part by the HEA through its Targeted Funding Programme for Special Initiatives. These are (a) the second-level programme; (b) the reserved places/ direct application scheme; (c) the Foundation course for Higher Education – Mature Students; and (d) the Foundation Course for Higher Education – Young Adults. Progression from the two foundation programmes to undergraduate programmes in Trinity and to other Colleges was very satisfactory.
- (c) **Student Population:** Information was presented on the gender and geographical distribution of students. A breakdown was also provided on categories of postgraduate students. It was noted that 61% of the student population was female.
- (d) **Academic Staff:** In 2001/02, there were 97 new academic appointments. Of those appointed 50.5% held doctoral degrees compared with 61% in the previous year. The average staff:student ratio for College was 1:17, ranging from 1:11 in Health Sciences to 1:24 in the Faculties of Arts (Humanities) and BESS.
- (e) **Academic Progress:** The percentage of Junior Freshman students who successfully completed the year in 2001/02 averaged 88% across College. Information was also provided on the Foundation Scholarship examination, Commencements, Firsts and Gold Medals and the distribution of grades achieved at undergraduate degree examinations. The Board noted that a number of projects in the area of Student Retention were being undertaken by the Student Counselling Service, supported in part by the HEA Targeted Initiatives Programme.
- (f) **Central Developments in Teaching**
- (i) *Broad Curriculum:* During the year there had been a focus on two Broad Curriculum initiatives: the postgraduate teaching studentships to support small group teaching and learning and the development of six cross-faculty courses.
 - (ii) *Working Party on Teaching and Learning:* The Working Party which had been established in October 2001, presented its report to Council in November 2002. Following consultation with the College community, a proposal will be brought to Council on the implementation of the proposed teaching and learning strategy and arrangements for annual review.
 - (iii) *Centre for Learning Technology (CLT):* The Centre was established in July 2000 and its objective is to support best practice in the use of ICT to enhance student learning and to advise on issues of policy, structure and future developments in educational technology. The CLT will be an integral part of the Centre for Academic Practice and Student Learning.
- (g) **Quality Improvement:** The remit of the Quality Office had been extended since its establishment in November 1999 and in addition to the academic departmental review process, it now included the provision of a centralised student feedback

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

facility, a teaching development grant scheme, and the Provost's Teaching Awards scheme.

In the discussion which followed the Senior Lecturer's presentation, Board members agreed that language and other difficulties encountered by non-Irish students studying disciplines which have not been covered in their school curricula should be addressed.

In response to queries from a number of Board members, the Senior Lecturer advised Board that in view of the differing teaching requirements for individual disciplines it is very difficult to have the same staff:student ratios across all faculties, noting that Deans will be undertaking a review of these ratios, including the norms for individual disciplines in Ireland and abroad. The Board also noted that the comparability between A-levels and Leaving Certificate grades is currently under review

The Senior Lecturer undertook to investigate the feasibility of additional analyses of the data presented in her report, particularly trend analyses and comparisons with other institutions.

The Board thanked the Senior Lecturer and her staff for the very useful and informative report.

- 9/182 SFI Centres** The Vice-Provost invited Board's attention to her memorandum, dated 14 February 2003, which had been circulated accompanying the second report from the Working Party on SFI Centres which outlined proposals in relation to the governance of Major College Research Centres. The Vice-Provost invited Board's particular attention to the proposed definition of a Major Research Centre as one which has a scale of operation equivalent to that of a large department; employs (directly or indirectly) academic, research, administrative and support staff, a number of whom are on permanent contracts or contracts of indefinite duration; and has significant and verifiable funding to sustain the research for at least the next 5 years. The Vice-Provost also invited Board's attention to recommendations in relation to the establishment and management of Centres, the relationship between Centres and Departments/Faculties, the contribution of Centre staff to teaching and postgraduate supervision, the financial arrangements for Centres and other related issues. The Board noted that, in view of the fact that the College's intellectual property is currently under review and that a sectoral report on indirect costs is forthcoming, the Working Party had not made any proposals on either of these issues at this time.

In discussing the proposals, the Board agreed that a communication programme for schools, industry and the general public, highlighting the results of the Centres' research, would be an important dimension to their activity. The Board also noted the potential tensions that might exist between Departments and Centres arising from their inter-disciplinary nature and the fact that Centres and Departments have different and possibly conflicting missions in relation to teaching and research.

The Board, approving the proposals with proposed amendments, agreed that the revised document would be passed to the Research Committee for implementation, with the recommendation that the operation of the Centres programme would be reviewed after one year.

9/183 Acta of the University Council

- (a) The Board confirmed Acta of the University Council from its meetings of 5 February 2003 subject to further comment covering the following: 29/B, 29/C, 31/A, 31/E;

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

- (b) The Board confirmed Actum of the University Council from its meetings of 13 February 2003 subject to further comment covering the following: 33/A.

9/184 Provost's Report - Financial Situation (see Actum 29/B of 5 February 2003) In response to a query from Ms Stokes, the Senior Lecturer advised Board that, while Deans are exploring all options whereby they can achieve pay savings, they have as their primary consideration the maintenance of quality in the delivery of teaching to students. The Board, discussing the longer-term implications of the reduced State grant, agreed that a strategic approach to financial management would have to be adopted if the core activities of teaching and research are to maintain high quality standards. The Board noted Dr Doyle's concerns that the morale of staff is being severely undermined by the scale of the proposed cut-backs in areas such as conference travel.

The Vice-Provost agreed that an overview of the impact of the reduced funding at departmental level would be presented to Board in due course.

9/185 Graduate Studies Annual Report 2001-02 (see Actum 29/C of 5 February 2003) In response to a query, the Senior Lecturer advised Board that the Graduate Studies Annual Report had been well received by Council and that every effort was being made to support the Office during its current crisis.

9/186 Nominations for Appointment (see Actum 31/A of 5 February 2003) The Board, on the recommendation of the University Council, approved the appointments as summarised in Appendix 1 to these Minutes.

9/187 Leave of Absence (see Actum 31/E of 5 February 2003) The Board confirmed the following applications for leave of absence:

Classics

- (a) Dr Hazel Dodge, academic year 2003-04;
- (b) Professor John M Dillon, Michaelmas term 2003;
- (c) Professor Brian C McGing, Hilary term 2004.

9/188 Chair of Theology (1980) (see Actum 33/A of 13 February 2003) The Board noted that the University Council had nominated

Nigel John Biggar, BA (Oxon),
Master of Christian Studies (Regent College, Canada), MA (Chicago), PhD (Chicago)

to the above Chair, further noting that Professor Biggar had indicated that he would be accepting the appointment.

9/189 Living the Trinity Experience Mr Moynihan invited the Board's attention to a memorandum prepared by Ms Gatling following discussions with the Junior Dean and the Warden of Trinity Hall regarding proposals to enhance the sense of community living for campus residents. The Board noted proposals relating to the role of the Assistant Deans, house-based introductory lectures, the introduction of house representatives, the use of noticeboards and the use of the JCR café in Goldsmith Hall as a residents' common room in the evenings.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The Board noted the report's recommendations and agreed that it should be forwarded to the Residence Committee for positive consideration.

9/190 Elections to Board Under Other Business the Board noted Dr Fitzpatrick's concerns about a potentially high turnover of Board members after the election in 2005 and agreed that proposals should be brought forward to address this issue.

9/191 Finance Committee The Board noted and approved the Minutes of the meeting of the Finance Committee held on 5 February 2003. Particular reference was made to the following:

2003/51 Nursing In response to a query from Dr Doyle, the Treasurer advised Board that following a meeting between the Provost and the Secretary-General of the Department of Health and Children, there will be further meetings with the Department to try to resolve the issues in relation to the shortfall in funding arising from the assimilation of nurse tutors on to the staff of Trinity College in respect of years one and two of the course, noting that significant progress has been made in resolving these financial issues. The Board noted that due to initial difficulties the College had not met its quota of students for 2002/2002 which in turn had led to a reduction in recurrent funding for the course.

2003/52 PRTL Cycle 3 – Capital Equipment The Board noted the actions which had been recommended by the Finance Committee in order to secure the delivery of the PRTL Cycle 3 research programme which included providing bridging finance from recurrent cashflows to a level of €2.027m and requesting the HEA to transfer any delayed spending in recurrent funds to the capital heading for 2003 for as long as the deferred capital cashflows last. The Board also noted that the expected annual cost of providing bridging finance from recurrent resources is circa €60,000 and that as the PRTL programme Cycle 3 for the first time provides for an overhead of 15% of defined pay costs it approved the recommendation that this provision should, in the circumstances, be used in part to accommodate the carrying cost associated with the purchase of the minimum capital equipment requirements in the current year.

2003/56 Validation Fees – Church of Ireland College of Education The Board approved the proposal that, in view of the long established relationship with the Church of Ireland and the current ongoing discussions with various parties regarding future education initiatives, validation fees in respect of the two proposed diplomas in Special Education Needs and Learning Support Education should be waived for two years with the matter to be considered again at that time.

9/192 Site and Facilities Committee The Board noted the Minutes of the Site and Facilities Committee from its meeting of 4 February 2003 as circulated and approved the recommendations, noting in particular:

2.4 INS Building Planning Committee The Board noted Dr Lunney's concerns, presented in his absence by Dr Sexton, about the detrimental effect which the removal of the atrium from the INS building scheme had on the INS/SNIAMS development. The Board also noted Mr Kearns comments in relation to the priority which the Planning Committee and the Site and Facilities Committee had placed on the provision of lecture theatres, which, in the context of the reduced level of funding for the building, had necessitated, at least for now, the removal of the atrium. In response to a query, the Vice-Provost advised Board that the Physical Access

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

Working Group was due to sign-off on the design of the building within the following few days.

9/193 Sealings The Board noted:

- (a) **Optigen Technologies Ltd** The Seal of the College was put to a Shareholders Agreement (in duplicate) and an Intellectual Property Agreement between Optigen Technologies Ltd (Campus Company) and the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of Trinity College Dublin. [28/1/03]
- (b) **Crookshank–Glin Archive of Photographs** The Seal of the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin was put in triplicate to an:
 - (i) Agreement and
 - (ii) Assignment of copyright to the College

regarding the above Archive.

[4/2/03]

9/194 Higher Degrees The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 28 January and 11 February 2003.

9/195 Proctors' Lists for the Spring Commencements (14 February 2003) The Board noted that the Proctors' Lists were approved by the sub-committee of Board on 11 February 2003.

9/196 Permissions – St Patrick's Festival In response to a request from the organisers of the St Patrick's Festival the Board agreed that bunting could be placed on the front of College and that discussions could take place with the College concerning the use of the An Post carpark.

9/197 Calendar – Minchin Bursary U60 The Board noted that the Senior Lecturer would no longer be a member of the committee which decides the awards and approved a change of the closing date from 31 October to 10 January.

9/198 Trinity Ball The Board noted and approved the request of the Chairman of the Capitation Committee to hold the Trinity Ball on 9 May 2003.

9/199 TCD Association and Trust—Grant Applications — Hilary Term The Board noted and approved the recommendation of the TCD Association and Trust in relation to the Research Fund, and noted its recommendations in relation to the General Fund, circulated dated 7 February 2003, as follows:

Research Fund

- (a) Dr T Hodkinson (Botany) towards cost of publishing the proceedings of the Conference – Irish Plant Scientists' Association Meeting, March 2003 (to include a suitable acknowledgement); €1,000

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

- (b) Professor B Wright (French) towards cost of translating into French *Eugène Fromentin: A Life in Art and Letters* (to include a suitable acknowledgment); €5,000
- (c) Dr V Politis (Philosophy): to subsidise cost of publishing an edition and translation of Paul Natrop's *Platos Ideenlehre*. €3,200

General Fund

- (a) DU Sub-Aqua Club: trade-in of old diving boat (Humber) and purchase of replacement (Tornado) - TCD Association and Trust logo to be displayed on each side; €6,000
- (b) DU Orienteers: €100 per member up to a maximum to €800, to fund members to travel to Prague Easter Festival of Orienteering, April 2003 (must be supported by DUCAC); €800 (maximum)
- (c) Daniel Gregg: SF Chemistry Broad Curriculum Exercise 2001-02 (Original application February 2002). Shortfall of €102.83 agreed on production of receipts; €102.83
- (d) Voluntary Tuition Programme: on condition that all 450 students know the source of funding. €5,000

9/200 Trinity Hall – Wardenship Nominating Committee The Board noted and approved the following membership:

Vice-Provost *Chair*
 Senior Dean
 Junior Dean
 Mr D F O'Connell
 Ms E K Stokes

In response to a query from Mr Moynihan, the Vice-Provost advised Board that it was not usual for student representatives to sit on Nominating Committees but they were invited to make their views known through the Trinity Hall Management Committee.

9/201 Prizes and Other Awards – Entrance Exhibition 2002 The Board approved the Senior Lecturer's recommendation that Ms Jeananne Craig (02905892) be awarded an Entrance Exhibition.

9/202 Strategic Plan - Joint Board and Council Meeting on 2 April 2003 The Board noted that a joint meeting of Board and Council will be held at 9.15 a.m. on 2 April 2003, in Room 21, Museum Building to discuss the Strategic Plan, which will be circulated in advance of the meeting.

Signed:

Date:

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

Appendix 1 to Minute 9/186

Nominations for Council – 5 February 2003

Department	Post	Name & Qualifications	Start date	Termination date (if contract)
B.E.S.S.	Visiting Research Fellow	KLEMMENSEN, Robert, MSc. (Copen.), BA (Copen.)	01.02.2003	30.05.2003
Biochemistry	Research Fellow	DAVEY, Gavin, BA (Dubl.), PhD (Dubl.)	01.02.2003	31.01.2007
Biochemistry	Research Fellow	McDONALD, Andrew Grieg, BA (Dubl.), PhD (Dubl.)	01.02.2003	31.01.2007
Chemistry	Research Fellow	WU, Bin, PhD (Beijing)	01.01.2003	31.01.2003
Computer Science	Research Associate	BURKE, Michael, BA (Dubl.)	01.02.2003	31.01.2004
Geology	Research Associate	GOODHUE, Robert John Day, BA (Dubl.), PhD (Dubl.)	Renewal of Appointment	
IIS	Research Assistant	GOMEZ-ARANA, Maria Aranzazu, BA (Spain)	20.01.2003	20.09.2003
Mechanical & Manufacturing Engineering	Temporary Lecturer	CATER, Edward John, Beng (Auckland), PhD (Monash)	01.01.2003	31.12.2003
Mechanical & Manufacturing Engineering	Temporary Lecturer	HANN, David Brian, BSc (Edin.), PhD (Edin.)	01.01.2003	30.06.2003
Microbiology	Research Fellow	JERUSALMI, Alan, MS Virology (Flor.)	01.01.2003	31.09.2003
Microbiology	Research Fellow	MANGAN, Michael, BSc (DCU), MSc (IT Tallaght), PhD (NUI)	01.04.2003	Annually renewable for up to 4 yrs
Physics	Research Fellow	BRENNAN, Margaret, BSc Experimental Physics (N.U.I.), PhD (Dubl.)	06.01.2003	05.07.2003
Physics	Research Fellow	JONES, Benjamin James, MPhys (Oxon.), PhD (Dubl.)	01.02.2003	31.01.2004
Physics	Research Fellow	LIPSON, Stephen Malcolm, BA Mod, PhD (Dubl.)	01.01.2003	31.12.2003
Physics	Research Fellow	MINETT, Andrew, PhD (W'gong), BSc (W'gong)	01.01.2003	31.12.2004
Psychiatry	Clinical Tutor	KELLY, Fionnuala, BA, MB, BCh, BAO (Dubl.)	01.2003	05.2003

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

Surgery	Lecturer	BORTON, David, MB, BCh, BAO, (Dubl.), FRCSI, MCh (Dubl.), FRCSI (Orth.)		Ongoing
Surgery	Lecturer	BOYLE, Terence, MB, BCh, BAO, BSc. (N.U.I.), FRCSI, FRCSI (Gen)		Ongoing
Surgery	Lecturer	O’Riordan, Diarmuid, MB, BCh, BAO, (NUI/UCC), MD (NUI/UCC), FRCSI		Ongoing
Surgery	Lecturer	ORR, David John Alexander, MB, BCh, BAO, (Dubl.), MD (Dubl.), FRCSI (Plast.)		Ongoing
Surgery / Health Sciences	Lecturer in Health Sciences Education Research	PATTERSON, Aileen, BSc (Dubl.)	02.01.2003	01.01.08
Zoology	Research Fellow	JENNINGS, Eleanor	01.01.2003	31.12.2005