

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*

**The University of Dublin**

**Trinity College**

**Minutes of Board Meeting, 2 July 2003**

*Present* Provost (Dr J Hegarty), Vice-Provost (Dr J B Grimson), Bursar (Dr J W O'Hagan), Senior Lecturer (Dr S M Greene)\*, Dr S P A Allwright, Mr B Connolly, Dr S Duffy, Dr H Gibbons, Mr H Kearns, Ms M Leahy, Dr J G Lunney, Dr A N M Ní Chasaide, Mrs J O'Hara, Mr D Scammell, Ms E K Stokes, Dr D L Weaire, Dr T T West.

*Apologies* Registrar (Mr R A Stalley), Dr L E Doyle, Dr J A Fitzpatrick, Ms A-M Gatling, Dr C Horn, Dr J M Mossman, Mr I Moynihan, Mr W Priestley, Dr J C Sexton, Dr F Shevlin.

*In attendance*

*(ex officio)* Secretary, Treasurer, Assistant Secretary.

*(by invitation)*

*(present for)* \* Minutes 16/327 to 16/336.

**16/327 Minutes** The Minutes of the meeting held on 11 June 2003 were approved and signed subject to the following amendment:

**15/309 - Minutes** The date '16 April 2003' was replaced with '4 June 2003'.

**16/328 Matters Arising from the Minutes** A number of matters arising from the Minutes were discussed and have been recorded below, (see Minutes 16/329, 16/330).

**16/329 Trinity Ball 2002 (see Minute 15/311 of 11 June 2003)** In response to a query, the Secretary advised the Board that as the investigation into the theft at the Trinity Ball 2002 had been inconclusive no further information would be available for reporting to Board.

**16/330 Disciplinary Matter (see Minute 15/317 of 11 June 2003)** In response to a query, the Secretary advised Board that the College was awaiting the Judge's decision in regard to the disciplinary matter in question.

**16/331 Provost's Report** The Provost invited Board's attention to the following issues:

- (a) *Special Olympics:* The Provost invited Board's attention to a request which had been received at very short notice from the organisers of the Special Olympics for accommodation for over 300 athletes for the duration of the Games in Dublin and advised Board that due to the favourable outcome of the judicial review in relation to the Trinity Hall development, which had been made known on 20 June 2003, the College had been in a position to assist in this regard. The Board expressed great

satisfaction that the legal barriers, which had heretofore prevented the College from contributing to the Special Olympics as fully as it would have wished, had been removed and that it had been possible to provide accommodation for the athletes and their coaches in Trinity Hall.

The Board paid special tribute to the College staff in many areas including Housekeeping, the Accommodation Office, the Director of Buildings Office and the Warden of Trinity Hall, for the speed and efficiency with which the Trinity Hall facilities had been prepared for the Special Olympians and agreed that the Board's appreciation should be expressed to all concerned.

In response to a query, the Secretary advised Board that the full implications of the legal judgement are not yet fully known and will be advised to the Site and Facilities Committee and Board in due course.

- (b) *Strategic Plan:* The Provost advised Board that the Strategic Plan is currently being printed and that there will be an internal launch, to which all staff will be invited, on 9 July at 4.00pm in the Dining Hall.
- (c) *Education in Health Sciences:* The Provost advised Board that the HEA had commissioned a Consultant to investigate the issues associated with entry to Health Sciences courses, including medicine, dentistry, veterinary medicine and pharmacy, and invited Board's attention to the preliminary recommendation from the Consultant's first report that all medically-related courses would be at postgraduate level, students having first undertaken an undergraduate degree. The Board agreed that the Dean of Health Sciences should be asked to initiate discussions in the Faculty and the College on the proposals, with a view to contributing effectively to the formulation of national policy in this regard.

**16/332 Annual Officers 2003-2004** The Board approved the Provost's nominations for Annual Officers for 2003-2004, as proposed at its meeting on 11 June 2003 (see Minute 15/314) as follows:

Vice-Provost	Dr J B Grimson
Bursar	Dr J W O'Hagan
Dean of Research	Dr M J Gibney
Registrar	Mr R A Stalley
Senior Lecturer	Dr S M Greene
Senior Proctor	Dr V J Scattergood
Junior Proctor	Dr W T Coffey
Senior Dean	Dr C J Smyth
Junior Dean and Registrar of Chambers	Mr D B Tangney
Public Orator	Dr J V Luce

The Board also noted the appointment of Dr C Laudet as Senior Tutor.

**16/333 Financial Review Advisory Group Final Report** The Board resumed the discussion which had taken place on the final report of the Financial Review Advisory Group at the meeting held on 11 June 2003 (see Minute 15/312). In response to queries from a number of Board members, the Bursar advised that a first report will be prepared by the Executive Officers' Group on the criteria for use in determining the distribution of funds and will be presented to Board by the end of 2003 and that a specialist group to examine structures, management and systems for the allocation of resources will be established by Executive Officers and Board and will commence work by October 2003 at the latest. The Board agreed that the views of all

***Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings***

relevant committees and working groups should be sought in the development of proposals for the allocation of resources.

In response to a query, the Bursar advised that it is recommended that no charge be introduced for car parking on the campus at this time.

In response to a query, the Secretary advised Board that consultation on the implementation of the proposed financial cuts was an integral part of the process. The Provost advised Board that representations had been made to the Minister for Education and Science on the impacts of the reduced funding, noting that in the meantime, the College has a budget for 2003 within which it must operate and that State policy requires that there should be no deficit at the end of the year. The Board noted that other universities are now implementing programmes to address the reduction in funding.

The Board approved the adoption of the Financial Review Advisory Group's proposals; Mr Gibbons dissented.

**16/334 Implications of Reduction in Pay Budget 2003-2004** The Senior Lecturer invited Board's attention to a factual report from the Unit Cost Management Working party on the implications of reductions in the pay budget for 2003-2004 which had been circulated.

The Senior Lecturer invited Board's attention to the varied means by which Faculties and Administrative and Support areas achieved their pay targets for 2003-2004 including retirements, non-renewal of contracts, resignations, savings from quarterly salaries in academic areas, contributions from non-pay sources, career breaks, unpaid leave and other measures, noting in particular the very wide divergence in opportunities across different areas to achieve savings.

The Senior Lecturer invited the Board's attention to the following implications of the budget reductions in Faculties:

- (a) the non-filling of Chairs, noting that in addition to those unfilled Chairs which are contributing towards pay savings there are other vacant Chairs in a number of Faculties;
- (b) the reduction in opportunities for postgraduate students to engage in part-time teaching, noting however that with the support of additional funding recommended by the Financial Review Advisory Group for the Postgraduate Teaching Fellowship Scheme, the maintenance grant will be increased and students in receipt of an award will be required to make a contribution of up to six hours teaching and preparation per week during the teaching term, thus providing additional funding for postgraduate students and providing departments with additional teaching resources. The Board noted that the details of the revised scheme are currently being developed by the Dean of Graduate Studies and the Graduate Studies Committee and that it is envisaged that the Centre for Academic Practice and Student Learning will assist students in preparing for teaching duties;
- (c) reduction in small group teaching, tutorials, demonstrations, laboratory work;
- (d) reduction in the employment of part-time teaching staff which will potentially damage the College's relationship with such staff in the long-term and will impact on the capacity of some departments to deliver courses, noting that this is particularly significant in the Faculty of Health Sciences.

The Senior Lecturer, noting the extra burden which the cuts places on existing staff, also invited Board's attention to the possible impacts of reduced funding in specific areas where there are possibilities of: reductions in options and electives; the withdrawal of certain student support activities and of some courses and programmes; and a lack of funding for

***Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings***

placement supervision. The Board also noted possible difficulties regarding accreditation in professional areas and the potential impacts of the cuts on research.

The Senior Lecturer, again noting the extra burden which the budget cuts are placing on existing staff particularly in an environment of increasing legislative compliance, also invited the Board's attention to the following impacts of the budget reductions on administrative and support areas:

- (a) the non-filling of senior and specialist posts;
- (b) possible risks to the College in terms of meeting its legislative and statutory requirements;
- (c) a reduction in flexibility to deal with unexpected legal or funding requirements;
- (d) delays in implementating new systems/projects;
- (e) reduction in services to the College Community;
- (f) reduction in student support services;
- (g) delays in response time to external users of services;
- (h) changes in work practices, noting that any such changes would be a matter for discussion with the areas concerned;
- (i) lack of funding to replace equipment and an associated increased demand for maintenance.

The Board noted that, in the context of continuing financial difficulties in relation to the College's core grant, the report concluded that the strategies adopted for 2003-2004 are not sustainable in the longer term and that there will be a very significant cumulative effect on the operations of the College should this level of budgetary cut-backs continue.

In discussing the report, the potential for postdoctoral fellows to contribute to teaching and the need to spread the burden of additional duties evenly across all members of departments and administrative and service areas were raised by Board members:

The Board agreed that the implications of the cuts, many of which are felt directly by students, should be communicated publicly.

The Board, noting that it is probable that further reductions in budgets will need to be made in 2004-2005, approved the proposal that Executive Officers consider the development of a more strategic approach to addressing this problem and that they develop recommendations for consideration by Board in Michaelmas Term.

**16/335 Governance** The Provost invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 25 June 2003, which had been circulated summarising the position in relation to the Audit Committee's report to Board on governance which had been considered by Board at its meeting on 18 December 2002 (minute 6/111 refers). Introducing the topic, the Provost advised Board that while it had initially been intended to present a response to the report's recommendations during Hilary Term, the pressure of business relating to the current financial crisis and the finalisation of the Strategic Plan had intervened. The Provost advised Board that following discussions by the Executive Officers on the issues raised in the Audit Committee's report an initial meeting had taken place with the Audit Committee on 20 June, noting that due to examination and other time pressures it had not been possible to convene a meeting of non-Officer members of the Board.

The Provost, advising Board that the Executive Officers had broadly welcomed the thrust of the report's recommendations, invited Board's attention to three areas where it was felt an approach different to that proposed by the Audit Committee could be considered as a means to achieving the same objectives in relation to accountability and transparency in decision-

***Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings***

making, namely: (a) the role of Principal Committees, (b) the role of Executive Officers, (c) chairing of Committees.

The Provost invited the Board's attention to a proposal that a small working group be established comprising two members of the Audit Committee, two Executive Officers and two non-Officer Board members to consider the Audit Committee's report with specific reference to the issues listed at (a), (b) and (c) above as well as the roles of the University Council and Deans and to bring forward recommendations for consideration by Executive Officers which would then be presented to Board for consideration in Michaelmas Term. The Board also suggested that the role of Fellows in the governance of the College be addressed.

In approving this proposal, the Board also approved the following membership of the group, agreeing that the group would be free to consult beyond its membership should the need arise:

*Audit Committee representatives:*

Mr D Kingston (chair of group)

Professor J F McGilp

*Executive Officer representatives:*

Bursar

Secretary to the College

*Non-Officer Board members*

Dr L E Doyle

Professor J G Lunney

**16/336 School of Pharmacy** The Provost invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 20 June 2003, which had been circulated with the papers for the Council meeting held on 25 June 2003 and the draft Actum from that Council meeting which had been tabled. The Provost advised Board that an Accreditation Visit had been carried out by the Pharmaceutical Society of Ireland (PSI) in November 2002 and its report had been received in May 2003. The Board noted that the PSI had given accreditation for the B.Sc. (Pharm.) degree course for eighteen months from November 2002 instead of the normal four years. The Provost advised Board that the Report had raised serious issues in relation to the organisational structure of the School and in relation to resources and had indicated that a further accreditation visit will be conducted within eighteen months from November 2002.

The Board noted the structure of the School of Pharmacy as having four departments, one Centre, and a total staff full-time equivalent of almost 19. The Board further noted that in addition to the four Heads of Department and Co-ordinator of the Centre, there is a Director of the School and that resources and staffing are allocated to Departments within the School.

The Provost advised Board that he had met with Heads of Department in the School to discuss the internal structure of the School and staffing issues and that he had also met with the PSI Visitors and had read the accreditation report. The Provost stated that in his view, immediate action was required to address the underlying structural problems of School and its departments and that implementation of the following recommendations would be in the best interests of the programme and the School and would facilitate the School in moving forward in a strong and integrated manner, noting however, that there was no guarantee that re-structuring the School would achieve long-term accreditation for the BSc (Pharm.) course:

- (a) the four Departments in the School should cease to exist as separate departments and be merged into a single organisational unit called the School of Pharmacy with effect from 1<sup>st</sup> October 2003. While retaining the title 'School', the new unit will operate as a department for all College purposes;
- (b) the post of Director of the School should be abolished when the term of appointment of the incumbent ends on 12<sup>th</sup> July 2003;

***Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings***

- (c) the Dean of Science, in consultation with the Faculty, should submit proposals to the Senior Lecturer as soon as possible, but no later than Michaelmas Term 2003, setting out financial arrangements regarding the filling of a Chair in the School of Pharmacy (specialism to be decided) no later than October 2005. On appointment, the incoming Chairholder will assume Headship of the new School;
- (d) in consultation with the relevant Officers, the Provost should identify funding to cover the costs of one vacant lecturer post to which an appointment will be made in the coming academic year;
- (e) an election for Headship of Department should be conducted as soon as possible. The person appointed will serve in this capacity for a period of up to two years commencing 13 July 2003 or until the new Chairholder takes up appointment.

In the course of a lengthy discussion, the importance of meeting the criteria for accreditation was stressed and a number of issues in relation to precedent, consultation with the members of the School and relations with the Pharmaceutical Society of Ireland were clarified.

The Board unanimously approved the proposals as presented, agreeing that the required resources should be made available to the School to implement the required changes and agreed that the Provost should have flexibility in this regard. The Board requested that it be kept informed of developments.

**16/337 Strategic Plan Implementation** The Provost invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 25 June 2003, which had been circulated outlining steps which have been taken to begin implementation of the following nine of the Strategic Plan's twenty-one actions:

<i>Action 2</i>	<i>Development of Trinity's areas of strengths</i>
<i>Action 4</i>	<i>Centre for Academic Practice and Student Learning</i>
<i>Action 5</i>	<i>Inclusiveness and Diversity:</i>
	<i>Improving Access</i>
	<i>Internationalisation</i>
<i>Action 8</i>	<i>Commercialising Intellectual Property/Entrepreneurship Development</i>
<i>Action 12</i>	<i>Appointment of Dean of Students</i>
<i>Action 16</i>	<i>Development Control Plan</i>
<i>Actions 19-21</i>	<i>Governance and Stewardship of Resources</i>

The Board noted that work has also begun on a number of other actions in the Plan and that a full Implementation Plan with detailed targets, timescales, and costings will be presented to Board in Michaelmas Term 2003, including the development of a set of templates appropriate to the different areas in College which will support them in the development of their plans to align themselves with, and support, the overall strategic goals of College.

In response to a query, the Provost advised Board that the terms of reference for the Dean of Students would be presented to the next meeting of Board.

The Board welcomed the progress which had been made in progressing the actions at this time.

**16/338 Property Matters – College Green** The Treasurer invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 24 June 2003, which had been circulated outlining the current status of the proposed exchange with a property developer of street and basement levels in 1-2 College Green for the upper floors of 3-4 College Green, the proposals for which had been advised to a previous Board meeting (minute 3/43 of 13 October 2002 refers). The Treasurer advised Board that planning permission had been obtained for change of use on 1-2 and 5 College Green but that the College did not received planning permission for the entry/exit linking 3-4

***Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings***

Foster Place and 1-2 College Green and the proposed entry/exit link at first floor level between 3-4 and 5 College Green. The Board noted the financial implications of the current planning decisions noting that there will no longer be a requirement to pay the consideration of €900,000 for the exchange of space but that the opportunities for savings on pay costs for a reduced number of Attendants in the buildings would not now be possible.

The Treasurer invited Board's attention to the advice of the College's property advisors, which has the support of Executive Officers, to:

- (a) proceed to complete the exchange of space
- (b) consider appealing the current planning permission or re-lodging a new planning permission to secure the entry/exit routes

Following clarification of a number of technical and legal issues, the Board approved the proposals as presented, noting that funding for refurbishment as originally envisaged can be bridged in the short-term but will require longer term consideration in the context of alterations to the College's property portfolio.

**16/339 Academic Promotions** The Vice-Provost invited Board's attention to the draft report of the Academic Promotions Working Party which had been circulated. The Vice-Provost advised Board that this draft had been placed in the College's website for consultation with the academic community and as it is still at the consultative stage it has not yet been considered by Council. The Board noted a number of issues which have been raised by members of the College community to date and which will be addressed in the next version of the report.

In response to a query the Vice-Provost advised Board that criteria for the assessment of teaching will be developed in conjunction with the Centre for Academic Practice and Student Learning.

The Provost invited Board members to submit their comments on the report to the Vice-Provost.

**16/340 Erasmus Smith's Chair of Mathematics (1762)** Under Other Business, in response to a query, the Secretary advised Board that the candidate to whom the Erasmus Smith's Chair of Mathematics (1762) had been offered had not accepted and that consideration was being given to contacting the second candidate whom Council had deemed to be appointable. In a wide-ranging discussion on College's procedures for appointment to established Chairs a number of suggestions were made for future consideration. The Board noted the difficulties which the cost of living, and in particular house prices in Dublin, create in attracting the best candidates to posts in College.

**16/341 Benchmarking awards** Under Other Business, in response to a query, the Secretary advised Board that approval for the payment of the Benchmarking Awards had not yet been received from the HEA.

**16/342 Finance Committee** The Board noted and approved the Minutes of the meeting of the Finance Committee held on 28 May 2003.

**16/343 Site and Facilities Committee** The Board noted the Minutes of the Site and Facilities Committee from its meeting of 3 June 2003 as circulated and approved the recommendations, noting in particular:

***Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings***

**3.1 Awnings on the Pavilion Bar** In response to a query, the Bursar advised that issues in relation to extending the proposal beyond its current scope would be a matter, in the first instance, for the Site and Facilities Committee.

**16/344 Centre for Microscopy and Analysis – Annual Report 2001-2002** The Board noted the Annual Report of the Centre for Microscopy and Analysis for 2001-2002, as circulated.

**16/345 Freedom of Information Acts - Implementation** The Board noted and approved memorandum from the Provost, circulated dated 4 June 2003.

**16/346 Sealings** The Board noted:

- (a) **Enterprise Centre, Pearse Street – Lease** The Seal of the College was put in duplicate to a lease of Unit 1b in the Trinity College Enterprise Centre to Eneclann Ltd. [5/6/03]
- (b) **Dublin Molecular Medicine Centre** The Seal of the College was put in duplicate to a Memorial of Indenture of Lease between the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and Nerville. [19/6/03]
- (c) **Dublin Molecular Medicine Centre** The Seal of the College was put to a Statutory Acknowledgement and Undertaking of the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin to Nerville. [19/6/03]
- (d) **Dublin Molecular Medicine Centre** The Seal of the College was put in duplicate to a Termination Agreement between the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and Nerville [19/6/03]
- (e) **Enterprise Centre, Pearse Street – Lease** The Seal of the College was put in duplicate to a lease of Unit 3.5 in the Trinity College Enterprise Centre to Terry Cartin. [20/6/03]

**16/347 Higher Degrees** The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 24 June 2003, as circulated.

**16/348 Proctors' Lists for First Summer Commencements** The Board noted that the Proctors' Lists were approved by the sub-committee of Board on 17 June 2003.

**16/349 Headship of Department (Acting) – Germanic Studies** The Board noted and approved the nomination of Dr T R Jackson as acting Head of Department during Professor McGowan's leave of absence in Michaelmas term 2003.

**16/350 Chaplaincy** The Board noted and approved the recommendation of the Archbishop of Dublin, Cardinal Desmond Connell, that Fr Kieran Dunne should replace Fr Richard Sheehy as Roman Catholic Chaplain to the College, with effect from 5 July 2003.

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*



**16/351 Prizes and Other Awards**

- (a) **Entrance Exhibitions 2001** The Board noted and approved the recommendation of the Senior Lecturer that Ms Linsey Abreu Molloy be awarded an Entrance Exhibition on the basis of Entrance in 2001;
- (b) **Grace Lawless Lee Fund** The Board noted and approved the recommendations of the Grace Lawless Lee Fund Committee, as set out in the Provost's letter, circulated dated 13 June 2003:

	€
Mr W G G Barry: travel to France for PhD thesis research	800
Ms L Byrne: costs for three months in SW Ireland for research for MLitt thesis	1,500
Ms S Foran: to attend conference in Exeter in connection with PhD research	335
Mr J Gibney: for visit to London for one week for research for PhD thesis	850
Professor J Horne: for visit to France in connection with research for book, <i>Cultural and Social History of France in the Great War</i>	2,000
Ms T R Keenan: for three weeks in Belfast for PhD thesis research	1,000
Mr E T Madigan: costs for two months in London in connection with research for project, <i>Faith in hard times, Anglican army chaplains and combatant faith in the British Army, 1914-1918</i>	700
Professor C E Meek: for visits to Italy in 2002-03, for research project, <i>Lucca under the rule of Paolo Guinigi, 1400-1430</i>	1,200
Ms K O'Malley: for visits to London in July-August 21003 in connection with research project, <i>Ireland, India and Empire: Irish and Indian radical interconnections in the 1920s and 1930s</i>	1,500

**16/352 Bequests and Benefactions**

- (a) **Ray Fuller Prize in Psychology** The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Treasurer, circulated dated 10 June 2003 and recorded its appreciation to Dr Fuller.
- (b) **Butterworths Prizes** The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Treasurer, circulated dated 25 June 2003.

**16/353 Staff Matters – Early Retirement** The Board noted and approved a request from Professor B L Roberts (Zoology) for early retirement on 30 September 2003 (normal date 30 September 2007), with no additional costs arising as it is on a cost neutral basis.

Signed: .....

Date: .....