

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 23 January 2002

Present Provost (Dr J Hegarty), Vice-Provost (Dr J B Grimson), Registrar (Mr R A Stalley), Bursar (Dr J W O'Hagan), Senior Lecturer (Dr S M Greene), Dr S P A Allwright, Dr L E Doyle, Dr S Duffy, Ms E Drew, Dr J A Fitzpatrick, Dr H Gibbons, Mr H Kearns, Ms Mary Leahy, Dr J G Lunney, Mr D Memery, Dr J M Mossman, Dr A N M Ní Chasaide, Mrs J O'Hara, Dr J C Sexton, Dr F Shevlin, Ms E K Stokes, Dr D L Weaire, Dr T T West.

Apologies Ms E Nic an Bhaird, Ms A Power.

In attendance

(ex officio) Secretary, Treasurer, Assistant Secretary.

(by invitation) Mr P O'Connor of PricewaterhouseCoopers, Mr D Kingston, Chairman of the Audit Committee, the Internal Auditor and the Deputy Treasurer for Minute 05/117.

The Director of Buildings for Minute 05/136.

05/117 Financial Statements for the year ended 30 September 2001 The Board considered the Financial Statements for the year ended 30 September 2001, Additional Financial Information for the same year, financial statements for Ghala Limited for the period from 13 February to 30 September 2001, a reports from PricewaterhouseCoopers and the Comptroller and Auditor General on the Prompt Payment of Accounts Act 1997, the management letter from PricewaterhouseCoopers and the report from the Audit Committee which had been circulated.

The Chairman of the Audit Committee advised Board that, following detailed discussions with PricewaterhouseCoopers and the Treasurer's Office, the Audit Committee was in a position to report that there were no issues of concern which should be brought to the attention of Board when considering the approval of the financial statements for the year under review. The Chairman invited Board's attention to the management letter received from PricewaterhouseCoopers which stated that an unqualified audit report had been issued on 4 December 2001 and that their audit had not identified any adjustments to the financial statements as presented by the Treasurer. In response to a query from the Provost, the Chairman of the Audit Committee advised Board that the Audit Committee was satisfied that it had received all the information and explanations necessary to reach its conclusions, noting that it had held meetings with the Treasurer and the external auditors in the course of its review. In response to a query from Ms Stokes, the Chairman of the Audit Committee advised Board that the Committee will be reviewing the financial statements of the Haughton Institute as part of its work programme for 2002. The Board noted that the Audit Committee will continue to monitor and report on all relevant issues.

Following a discussion during which a number of issues were clarified, the Financial Statements were approved by the Board and signed by the Provost and the Treasurer.

The Treasurer invited Board's attention to a presentation on the financial statements to 30 September 2001 which had been tabled and which highlighted the trends over the past ten years in a number of critical financially-related areas. The Treasurer advised Board of the financial difficulties being experienced by the College as a result of the State grant not keeping pace with the very high growth rates in student numbers and identified a number of issues which will be addressed in the preparation of the Strategic Plan. The Treasurer clarified a number of issues in the discussion which followed.

The Board thanked the Chairman of the Audit Committee, the external auditors and the Treasurer and her staff both for their contributions to the meeting and their on-going work on behalf of the College.

05/118 Minutes

- (a) The Minutes of the meeting of 12 December 2001 were approved and signed subject to the following amendments:

03/84 Policy Issues – Recruitment and Retention of Academic Staff Insert the following sentence at the end of the second paragraph: 'In considering the implications of the issues raised, the Board recorded its serious disquiet at (i) the extent to which women are under-represented on the higher academic grades and (ii) the relatively high number of women on contract academic posts.'

03/98 Government Budget Insert the following after 'Ms Power' on the first line 'who suggested that the College should in future consider, either on its own right or in the context of CHIU, making pre-Budget submissions to the Government'.

- (b) The Minutes of the meeting of 14 January 2002 were approved and signed.

05/119 Matters Arising from the Minutes A number of matters arising from the Minutes were discussed and have been recorded below, (see Minutes 05/120, 05/121, 05/122, 05/123).

05/120 Hearing of the Disciplinary Panel (see Minute 03/82 of 12 December 2001) The Secretary advised Board that Professor J McGilp will be pro-Senior Dean for the meeting of the Disciplinary Panel which will hear new complaints against a named staff member.

05/121 Board Membership: External Members (see Minute 03/83 (a) of 12 December 2001) The Board noted the recommendation of the Board sub-committee that Dr Christopher Horn will be the external Board member nominated in accordance with the provisions of Section 3, (2) of the Trinity College Dublin (Charters and Letters Patent Amendment) Act, 2000.

05/122 Pearse Street Development (see Minute 03/83 (d) of 12 December 2001) The Provost invited Board's attention to a proposal that Dr Shane Butler of the Department of Social Studies would be the College's Community Liaison Officer on an interim basis until more formal long-term structures were developed. The Provost advised Board that Dr Butler, who would report directly to him, would have as his primary functions liaison with the local community in the Pearse Street and surrounding areas and the co-ordination of a group of interested parties within College to contribute to the work and life of the local area. The Provost also proposed that Dr Butler be assisted in his work by other members of staff as required. The

Board, approving the proposal and the associated necessary financial resources, strongly recommended that consideration be given to gender balance in College's representation at local community meetings.

05/123 Policy Issues – Recruitment and Retention of Academic Staff (see Minute 03/84 of 12 December 2001) In response to comments from Board members, the Vice-Provost advised that the gender imbalance at the higher academic levels, where women are poorly represented, and the gender balance among contract academic staff, which is heavily biased in favour of women, are being considered by the Equality Committee and will be addressed in a future paper to Board. The Secretary undertook to circulate to Board members the 1989 report of the Committee on the Position of Women Academics.

05/124 Provost's Report

- (a) **Library Dispute** The Provost advised Board that the long-standing dispute with SIPTU staff in the Library has been resolved and that normal services are in the process of being restored. The Board noted that there are on-going discussions with staff representative groups concerning the move to the Ussher Library which it is expected will be officially opened in Autumn 2002. The Provost also advised that a tour of the Ussher Library will be organised for Board members.
- (b) **Legal Case:** The Board noted that a settlement had been reached between the College and a named staff member in the legal case relating to costs associated with the introduction of the College's Private Bill.

05/125 Acta of the University Council

- (a) The Board confirmed the Actum from its meeting of 7 December 2001
- (b) The Board confirmed the Actum from its meeting of 13 December 2001
- (c) The Board, noting amendments to the list of those present and to Actum 19/C (Academic Promotions Working Party – Membership) confirmed Acta of the University Council from its meeting of 9 January 2002 subject to further comment covering the following: 19/D, 20/A, 20/B, 21/A, 23/D

05/126 Chair of Organic Chemistry (2001) (see Actum 17/A of 7 December 2001) The Board confirmed the appointment of

Mathias O Senge, Vordiplom (Freiburg),
Diplom-Chemiker (Philipps University, Marburg),
Dr.rer.nat. (Philipps University, Marburg), Habil.) (FU Berlin)

to the Chair of Organic Chemistry (2001), further noting that discussions are on-going with Dr Senge on the terms of his appointment.

05/127 Chair of French (1776) (see Actum 18/A of 13 December 2001) The Board confirmed the appointment of

Johnnie Gratton, BA (Kent), Ph.D. (Kent)

to the Chair of French (1776) further noting that Dr Gratton will take up his position on 1 September 2002.

05/128 Personnel and Appointments Committee (see Actum 19/D of 9 January 2002) The Board confirmed the terms of this Actum arising from the memorandum of 11 December 2001 from the Staff Secretary.

05/129 Nominations for Appointment (see Actum 20/A of 9 January 2002) The Board, on the recommendation of the University Council, approved the appointments as summarised in Appendix 1 to these Minutes.

05/130 Departmental Reviews (see Actum 20/B of 9 January 2002) The Board noted the recommendations arising from the review of the Department of Genetics and the review of the School of Physiotherapy which had been approved by Council, further noting that in both cases favourable reviews had been received from the external assessors.

The Board, discussing the implications of the reviewers' recommendations for College as a whole, agreed that consideration should be given to the implications of SFI staffing in departments such as Genetics and that a strategic approach to the academic development of newly-created Schools in the Faculty of Health Sciences should be adopted.

05/131 Senior Lecturer's Annual Report 2000-01 (including Admissions Data for 2001) (see Actum 21/A of 9 January 2002) The Senior Lecturer invited Board's attention to her report for 2000/01 including Admissions data for 2001, which had been circulated and which provided information and analyses on a range of academically-related topics including applications and admissions data, entrance exhibition awards and matriculation results as well as a profile of the student population and data on academic progress. The Senior Lecturer also invited Board's attention to the results of a survey which identified new entrants' stated motivation for coming to Trinity and the sources of information on College which they used, noting the importance of the College website in this regard. The Board noted the main elements of the Schools Liaison Programme and the activities of the Centre for Educational Access and Community Development. The report concluded with an analysis of academic appointments made during the year and a review of innovations in teaching and the quality improvement programme.

In response to a number of queries, the Senior Lecturer advised Board that the Deans' Committee is reviewing the pattern of awards and the procedures used in Faculties for awarding scholarship and invited Board members to submit comments directly to her on this and related topics.

The Provost, thanking the Senior Lecturer and her staff for the report, advised Board that the implications for College of the issues raised would be the subject of further discussion at a future Board meeting.

05/132 Leave of Absence (see Actum 23/D of 9 January 2002) The Board confirmed the following applications for leave of absence:

- (a) **Business Studies**
 - (i) Dr Mairead Brady – 28 November 2001 to 6 January 2002;
 - (ii) Dr Patrick Butler – Hilary and Trinity terms 2002.

- (b) **Classics**

- (i) Dr Christine Morris – Michaelmas term 2002;
 - (ii) Dr Judith M Mossman – Hilary term 2003.
- (c) **Mechanical and Manufacturing Engineering** Professor David Taylor – Trinity term 2002;
- (d) **Modern History** Professor Louis M Cullen – academic year 2002-03.

05/133 Skilbeck Report – ‘The University Challenged – A Review of International Trends and Issues with Particular Reference to Ireland’ The Provost invited Board’s attention to the summary of a report entitled ‘The University Challenged – A Review of International Trends and Issues with Particular Reference to Ireland’ which had been published recently by the HEA and CHIU, noting that the full document is now available on the HEA website.

05/134 Bologna Process The Senior Lecturer invited Board’s attention to a briefing note, dated 14 January 2002, which had been circulated outlining the main features of the Bologna Process. The Senior Lecturer advised Board that the Bologna Process, which aims to create a European Higher Education Area, was signed by twenty-nine Ministers for Education (including the Irish Minister) in June 1999 and that it was expected that the process would be adopted much sooner than the target date of 2010. The Board, noting that the implementation of the Bologna objectives would have a very significant impact on College, agreed that discussions should begin as soon as possible throughout the College and requested that the Academic Affairs Committee report to Council and Board on the policy implications for the College.

05/135 Finance Committee – Minutes of Meeting of 17 December 2001 The Board noted the Minutes of the Finance Committee of 17 December 2001 as circulated and approved the recommendations arising therefrom. Particular reference was made to the following:

2002/45 Student Fees – Non-EU and Postgraduate fees – 2002/2003 The Treasurer invited Board’s attention to the recommended increase in the level of non-EU and postgraduate fees which had been set following consultation with the Dean of Graduate Studies and the Director of International Student Affairs who it was recommended should advise currently registered students of the increase at the earliest possible date. Ms Drew registered her dissatisfaction at the level of the increase which, she advised Board, was not accompanied by a commensurate improvement in the facilities available to graduate students. In response to a query from Ms Drew the Treasurer advised Board that the views of the President of the Students’ Union, who could not attend the Finance Committee meeting on that day, had been transmitted to the Finance Committee as an input to the discussion.

05/136 Site and Facilities Committee - Minutes of Meeting of 15 January 2002 The Director of Buildings, present by invitation, attended for this item. The Board noted the Minutes of the Site and Facilities Committee from its meeting of 15 January 2002 as circulated. The Board approved the recommendations, noting in particular:

2.2 Provost’s Stables Planning Application The Board noted Dr Duffy’s request that any future use of the Provost’s Stables be in keeping with the historical importance of the building.

2.6 Capital Building Programme The Bursar invited Board's attention to a confidential memorandum from the Bursar, dated 16 January 2002, which had been circulated to Board members detailing financial and other issues relating to projects in the Capital Building Programme. Following a presentation of the main features of the report by the Bursar, he and the Director of Buildings answered queries from a number of Board members.

3.4 Operation and Management of Buildings In response to a query from Dr Lunney, the Director of Buildings advised Board that an academic project officer is now included as a member of new buildings committees and that the text of the paper on the Operation and Management of Buildings would be amended to reflect this. The Bursar advised Board that there would be a full discussion on the Fellows' recommendations on the administration of the College's building programme at a future meeting of the Site and Facilities Committee. (Board minute 140/2 of 9 May 2001 refers).

05/137 Assistant Junior Deans Under Other Business the Board approved the appointment of the following Assistant Junior Deans and Reserve Assistants as proposed by the Junior Dean in a memorandum dated 17 January 2002 which had been tabled:

Junior Dean and Registrar of Chambers	Mr D Brendan Tangney
Assistant Junior Deans	Dr Margaret M O'Mahony Dr Carl Vogel Dr Paula Murphy
Reserve Assistants	Dr Sean D C Barrett Dr Frederick R Falkiner Dr T Trevor West Professor Patrick J O'Meara Mr Peter Yung

05/138 Map Collection Under Other Business the Board approved an extension of the agreement with Sitescope Limited to scan part of the College's collection of British Ordnance Survey maps as proposed by the Librarian in a memorandum dated 22 January 2002 which had been tabled.

05/139 Trinity Ball 2002 Under Other Business the Board agreed that the Trinity Ball 2002 would take place on 10 May 2002, noting that a planning application to this effect will now be submitted.

05/140 Future Board Agenda In view of the very short time available to discuss some items on the Agenda the Board agreed that future Agenda should be structured in such a way as to facilitate Board members having the opportunity to present their views on matters under consideration.

05/141 Sealings The Board noted:

(a) **James Ussher Library** The Seal of the College was put to the following documents in connection with the James Ussher Library:

- (i) A Deposit Agreement (VAT Deposit Account) in triplicate between the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin, Allied Irish Banks, plc and Skovale.
- (ii) A Deposit Agreement (Rental Deposit Account) in triplicate between the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin, Allied Irish Banks plc and Skovale.
- (iii) A Deposit Assignment (Rental Deposit Account) in triplicate between the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and Skovale.
- (iv) A Supplemental Agreement in triplicate between Skovale and the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin.
- (v) A Deposit Assignment (VAT Deposit Account) in triplicate between the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and Skovale.
- (vi) A 9 Year 9 Month Lease of Library Facility, Main Campus, Trinity College, Dublin (in duplicate) between Skovale and the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin.

[12/12/01]

- (b) **James Ussher Library** The Seal of the College was put to a Co-ordination agreement between Skovale, the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and Allied Irish Banks, plc. [13/12/01]
- (c) **Student Residences – 11-14 Botany Bay** The Seal of the College was put in duplicate to a sub-lease between the Botany Bay Co-ownership and the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin. [19/12/01]
- (d) **Student Residences – 11-14 Botany Bay** The Seal of the College was put in duplicate to a buyer loan agreement between the Botany Bay Co-ownership and the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin. [19/12/01]
- (e) **Student Residences – 11-14 Botany Bay** The Seal of the College was put in duplicate to a put and call option agreement between the Botany Bay Co-ownership and the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin. [19/12/01]
- (f) **Student Residences – 11-14 Botany Bay** The Seal of the College was put in duplicate to a mortgage over sinking fund agreement between the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and the Botany Bay Co-ownership. [19/12/01]
- (g) **Student Residences – 11-14 Botany Bay** The Seal of the College was put in duplicate to a deed of warranty and indemnity between the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and the Botany Bay Co-ownership. [19/12/01]
- (h) **Portion of the Premises at Pearse Street and Westland Row (North East Corner) – Commissioners of Charitable Donations and Bequests for Ireland** The Seal of the College was put in duplicate to a Statement of Proposal for Lease by the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of Trinity College Dublin to the Commissioners of Charitable Donations and Bequests for Ireland. [10/1/02]

05/142 Headship of Department

- (a) **Computer Science** The Board approved the appointment of Dr D M Abrahamson to the headship of the Department of Computer Science for 3 years from 1 January 2002, noting that this will be reviewed as Chairs are filled.
- (b) **Histopathology and Morbid Anatomy** The Board approved the appointment of Dr G S A McDonald as head of the Department of Histopathology and Morbid Anatomy in succession to Professor E C Sweeney for one year in the first instance, or until arrangements for filling the Chair have been completed.

05/143 Senate Business Meeting – 27 February 2002

- (a) **Bachelor in Acting Studies (see Actum 121/A of 2 May 2001)** The Board noted that the Latin title and abbreviation of the degree of Bachelor in Acting Studies should be proposed to the Senate as follows: *Baccalaureatus in Studiis Histrionicis*; B.A. (Hist.)
- (b) **Degrees M.A. (jure officii)**
The Board approved a memorandum from Ms H O'Hara to the Registrar, circulated dated 15 January, 2002.

05/144 Entrance Exhibition Report 2001 The Board noted the Senior Lecturer's final report, dated 15 January 2002, and a correction which was tabled.

05/145 Prizes and Other Awards

- (a) **Begley Studentship** The Board noted that the 2001-2002 Studentship be awarded to the following (value €1,269.74 each):

Jay Hannigan, (99107473), 4th Medical Year
Mary Durcan (97805301), 5th Medical Year
Robert Bruce-Brand (99101289), 3rd Medical Year.
- (b) **Isabella Mulvaney Award** The Board noted that following a recheck of the Leaving Certificate examination results, the Senior Lecturer had recommended Ms Gillian Kearon for this award in place of the candidate recommended in her memorandum dated 14 November 2001 circulated to the last meeting.

05/146 Calendar Change - Faculty of Business, Economic and Social Studies – Department of Economics (Calendar B27) The Board noted the following change:

delete: 'and Director of the Centre for the Economics of Globalisation' from the title of Professor Kevin H O'Rourke.

insert: above the name of Professor Philip R Lane 'Associate Professor of Economics and Director of the Institute for International Integration Studies'.

05/147 Faculty of Health Sciences The Board noted the following appointments in the Faculty:

- (a) Professor C Feighery – Vice-Dean of the Faculty and Director of Pre-Clinical Studies of the Medical School;
- (b) Dr F R Falkiner – Director of Graduate Studies (Health Sciences) and Director of the Graduate School of Health Sciences;
- (b) Professor D Kelleher – Director of Research (Health Sciences).

05/148 Nominations for Appointment

- (a) The Board noted the list of nominations for appointment approved by the Board and Council staffing sub-committee on 18 December 2001 (Appendix 2);
- (b) The Board noted and approve the list of nominations for appointment, dated 15 January 2002 (Appendix 3).

05/149 Tutorship The Board noted the appointment of Mr James Quinn (Business Studies) to replace Mr Andrew Somerville (leave of absence) from 1 January 2002.

05/150 Student Services Committee – Sub-committees The Board noted and approved the following proposals from the Student Services Committee:

- (a) **Careers Advisory Service Committee** the inclusion of the following employers' representatives as members of the Careers Advisory Service Committee:

Mr Frank Turpin (Intel Ireland)
Ms Patricia O'Grady (Civil Service and Local Appointments Commission)
Mr Liam Cummins (Holy Faith School, Glasnevin)
- (b) **Student Counselling Service Committee** the replacement of Professor R H Gilligan as chairman of the committee by Dr H V Smith.

Signed:

Date: