The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 20 February 2002

Present
Provost (Dr J Hegarty), Vice-Provost (Dr J B Grimson), Registrar (Mr R A Stalley), Bursar (Dr J W O'Hagan), Senior Lecturer (Dr S M Greene), Dr S P A Allwright, Mr B Connolly, Dr L E Doyle, Dr S Duffy, Ms E Drew, Dr J A Fitzpatrick, Dr H Gibbons, Mr H Kearns, Ms Mary Leahy, Dr J G Lunney, Dr J M Mossman, Dr A N M Ní Chasaide, Mrs J O'Hara, Ms A Power, Dr J C Sexton, Dr F Shevlin, Ms E K Stokes, Dr D L Weaire, Dr T T West.

Apologies Mr D Memery, Ms E Nic an Bhaird, Dr C Horn.

In attendance

(ex officio) Secretary, Treasurer, Assistant Secretary.

(by invitation)

The Provost welcomed Mr B Connolly attending Board for the first time.

07/153 Minutes

- (a) The Minutes of the meeting of 23 January 2002 were approved and signed subject to the following amendments:
 - **05/117 Financial Statements for the year ended 30 September 2001** Insert the following sentence before the final sentence of the second paragraph: 'In response to a query from Ms Stokes, the Chairman of the Audit Committee advised Board that the Committee will be reviewing the financial statements of the Haughton Institute as part of its work programme for 2002.'
 - **05/121 Board Membership: External Member** Amend *Mr Christopher Horn* to read *Dr Christopher Horn*.
- (b) The Minutes of the meeting of 13 February 2002 were approved and signed subject to the following amendment:
 - **06/151 Section 843 Developments (a) North East Corner** Replace the final paragraph with the following: 'Following a long discussion on all issues raised, the Board, noting the view of DUCAC, as expressed by Dr West, that the new Sports Complex should be located on one single site, agreed that the development should proceed as proposed, further noting that should any circumstances necessitate a change in the agreed arrangements, the matter would be referred to the Board for further consideration.'
- **07/154 Matters Arising from the Minutes** A number of matters arising from the Minutes were discussed and have been recorded below, (see Minutes 07/155, 07/156, 07/157, 07/158 (a), 07/159).

- **07/155** Senior Lecturer's Annual Report 2000-01 (see Minute 05/131 of 23 January 2002) In response to a query from Dr Duffy, the Provost advised Board that a discussion of the issues raised in the Senior Lecturer's Annual Report for 2000-01 would be scheduled at a future Board meeting.
- 07/156 Site and Facilities Committee Minutes of Meeting of 15 January 2002 (see Minute 05/136 of 23 January 2002) In response to a query from Dr Duffy, the Secretary advised Board that the Fellows' recommendations on the administration of the College's building programme had been forwarded to the secretary of the Site and Facilities Committee for discussion at a future meeting.
- **07/157 Assistant Junior Deans (see Minute 05/137 of 23 January 2002)** The Board approved the Junior Dean's proposal, as advised by the Secretary, that Dr Margaret M O'Mahony, having resigned as an Assistant Junior Dean, will be replaced by Mr Peter Yung.

07/158 Senate Business Meeting – 27 February 2002

- (a) **Bachelor in Acting Studies (see Minute 05/143 of 23 January 2002)** The Secretary invited Board's attention to a memorandum to the Registrar from Ms H O'Hara, dated 19 February 2002, which had been tabled. The Board approved the amendment of the abbreviated title for the Bachelor in Acting Studies to B.A.S., noting that this degree will replace the Bachelor in Theatre Studies (B.T.S.). The Board noted that there would be no change in hood, which is pale blue, lined with white fur.
- (b) **Bachelor in Science (Engineering)** The Board approved the degree title for the undergraduate degree course in Manufacturing Engineering with Management Science as B.Sc. (Ing) as proposed by Ms H O'Hara in a memorandum to the Registrar, dated 19 February 200, which had been tabled:

Degree title:	Baccalaureus in Scientia Ingeniaria
	Bachelor in Science (Engineering)
Degree abbreviation:	B.Sc. (Ing.)
Hood:	Black, lined with green, edged with white

07/159 North East Corner Development (see Minute 06/151 of 13 February 2002) The Bursar advised Board that there had been two third party objections lodged with An Bord Pleanála against Dublin City Council's decision to grant planning permission for the North East Corner Development, noting that the College had decided, as a result, to leave active its first party appeal against some of the conditions imposed by Dublin City Council in an effort to ensure, *inter alia*, that there would be sufficient flexibility in the development for the long-term viability of the commercial entities included as a condition of the permission. The Board noted that the College is in consultation with its planning advisors on the matter.

In response to queries from Board members, the Bursar advised Board that negotiations are continuing with the proposed investors and that the College's Community Liaison Officer is engaged in on-going dialogue with the local community. The Board, noting the delay which a continuing third-party appeal would pose for the College, agreed that necessary infrastructural work, where permissible, should continue in an effort to minimise delays in completing the development. In response to a query from Dr Shevlin, the Treasurer advised Board that in view of the fact that the application of Section 843 to university buildings had been a condition required by the HEA under the Programme for Research in Third Level

Institutes it was unlikely that any proposed changes in the legislation would impact on existing agreements.

The Provost advised Board that it will be kept fully informed on the progress of the development.

07/160 Provost's Report - Finances The Provost advised Board that it is anticipated that the demand for financial support for College initiatives will greatly exceed the funds which will be available in the current year, noting that there is no indication as to when the College will be notified of its recurrent grant for 2002 by the HEA. The Board agreed that, in view of the difficulties such a late notification imposes on the financial management of the College and the associated risk exposures, the Chairman of the HEA and the Secretary-General of the Department of Education and Science should be made aware of the Board's extreme dissatisfaction at the on-going delay in the notification of the grant.

The Provost also advised the Board that Atlantic Philanthropies, which had been a very substantial donor to the university sector in Ireland over the past decade, had recently indicated that they would no longer be providing funds for the university sector having decided to shift the emphasis of their support to other areas. The Board noted, however, that College may be in a position to benefit from some of the research issues which it will fund in the future.

07/161 Policy Issues – Composition of the Student Body The Senior Lecturer invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 13 February 2002, which had been circulated outlining proposals relating to the future size and composition of the student body and their implications for the College.

In the course of a long and detailed discussion of the proposals a number of issues were raised including:

- 1. The need to take account of current commitments, and the policies of associated colleges, in determining the number of undergraduate students
- 2. The need for flexibility in responding to initiatives of benefit to the College
- 3. The value of part-time degree programmes in meeting the needs of mature students and those from disadvantaged backgrounds
- 4. The role of the academic department in developing and fulfilling its own strategic objectives and those of the College
- 5. The need to reduce the administrative work-load on academic members of staff
- 6. The value of the Trinity experience for students transferring from other third level institutions
- 7. The difficulties in relation to resource reallocations and the possible negative impact on smaller departments
- 8. The importance of securing adequate student finance and providing good student facilities, particularly accommodation for international students
- 9. The important role which taught postgraduate courses play as a bridge to research in some disciplines
- 10. The need to liaise with the second level sector concerning subject choices
- 11. The role of postgraduate students as teaching and research assistants

The Board, approving the proposal to maintain undergraduate student numbers at the current level for two years, accepted the overall thrust of the proposals noting the need for a financial model of the College's income and expenditure as a mechanism for evaluating options in this regard. It was agreed that the issues raised in the discussion would be incorporated appropriately in the Strategic Plan which will be presented to Board in due course.

- **07/162** Acta of the University Council The Board confirmed Acta of the University Council from its meeting of 6 February 2002, subject to further comment covering the following: 24/C, 25/A, 27/A, 27/B, 27/F.
- 07/163 Chair Appointments (see Actum 24/C of 6 February 2002) Chair of Pathology (1895) John James O'Leary, MA (Oxon), MSc (NUI), MD (NUI), DPhil (Oxon), MRCPAth The Secretary invited Board's attention to the nomination of Dr John J O'Leary to the Chair of Pathology (1895), with effect from 1 September 2002 on the Professorial Consultant scale, with pension provision, noting that a contract has now been signed.
- **07/164 Departmental Reviews (see Actum 25/A of 6 February 2002)** The Board noted the recommendations arising from the review of the School of Occupational Therapy which had been approved by Council, further noting that a favourable review had been received from the external assessors.

In response to a query from Ms Power, the Board agreed that an additional item would be added to the recommendations for the College's attention, viz. examine the need for adequate student facilities in St James's Hospital. The Bursar advised that a report on this issue is currently being prepared for the Trinity Centre Planning Committee at St James's Hospital.

- **07/165 Personnel and Appointments Committee (see Actum 27/A of 6 February 2002)** The Board confirmed the terms of this Actum arising from the memorandum of 30 January 2002 from the Staff Secretary. In response to a query from Dr Gibbons, the Registrar advised Board that to extend eligibility for Fellowship to staff on contracts of indefinite duration would require a change in the Statutes.
- **07/166** Nominations for Appointment (see Actum 27/B of 6 February 2002) The Board, on the recommendation of the University Council, approved the appointments as summarised in Appendix 1 to these Minutes.
- **07/167 Leave of Absence (see Actum 27/F of 6 February 2002)** The Board confirmed the following applications for leave of absence:
 - (a) **Business Studies** Mr Patrick J McCabe Hilary and Trinity terms 2003;
 - (b) **Modern History** Dr G James C Livesey academic year 2002-3;
 - (c) **Philosophy**
 - (i) Professor David Berman academic year 2002-3;
 - (ii) Dr Vasilis Politis Michaelmas term 2002.
- **07/168** Finance Committee Minutes of Meeting of 30 January 2002 The Board noted the Minutes of the Finance Committee of 30 January 2002 as circulated and approved the recommendations arising therefrom. Particular reference was made to the following:
 - **2002/60** Finance Committee Membership The Registrar advised Board that the conflict between the provisions of the Statutes concerning the membership of the Finance

Committee and the current membership of the Committee would be addressed in the forthcoming review of the Statutes.

07/169 Site and Facilities Committee

- (a) Minutes of Meeting of 15 January 2002 The Board noted the Minutes of the Site and Facilities Committee from its meeting of 5 February 2002 as circulated, noting that the minutes of the meeting held on 14 February 2002 for which Minutes were not yet available would record an amendment to Minute 2.1 – Capital Projects. The Board approved the recommendations.
- (b) **Building Capital Projects** The Board noted the confidential memorandum from the Bursar, dated 1 February 2002, which had been circulated to Board members detailing financial and other issues relating to projects in the Capital Building Programme. The Board noted Dr Duffy's concern that any possible development of the shops on Lincoln Place should pay due regard to their historical interest.
- (c) Arts Building - Top Floor The Bursar invited Board's attention to the on-going problems associated with the addition of the sixth floor to the top of the Arts Building, noting that some of the occupants of Level 5 of the building were experiencing serious difficulties arising from the construction work. The Bursar advised Board that, following discussions with the staff involved, an alternative location in the Ussher Library had been equipped for Level 5 Executive Officer staff but that an industrial relations issue had prevented staff moving to this temporary accommodation. The Board noted that other locations for Executive Officer staff had been explored but none had proved satisfactory. The Bursar advised Board that alternative seminar rooms to those on Level 5 had been made available in Foster Place. The Bursar also advised Board that the Health and Safety Authority had been invited to conduct an audit of the safety of the space, noting that the College's Safety Officer is continually monitoring the situation. The Board noted that the Secretary and the Treasurer are examining the potential availability of space throughout College.

In discussing the issues raised, the Board expressed appreciation to all those who were working to solve the current problems but noted that alternative arrangements will have to be made for examinations scheduled in certain areas of the Arts Building, particularly oral and aural examinations. The Board agreed that efforts should be made to continue to communicate effectively with the staff and students in the Arts Building. In response to a query from Dr Ní Chasaidhe the Bursar advised Board that the work is scheduled for completion in October 2002.

- **07/170 Unit Cost Management Working Party Unit Cost Data, 1998-99** The Board noted the memorandum from the Senior Lecturer, dated 8 February 2002 which had been circulated. The Secretary invited Board members who wished to receive a briefing on the Unit Cost Model to contact his office.
- 07/171 Sealing The Board noted:

Enterprise Centre, Pearse Street – Lease The Seal of the College was put in duplicate to a lease of Unit 6.5 in the Trinity College Enterprise Centre to Michael de Hoog. [17/01/02]

07/172 Higher Degrees The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 5 February 2002, as circulated.

- **07/173 Proctors' Lists Spring Commencements**, **15 February 2002** The Board noted that the Proctors' Lists had been approved by the sub-committee of Board on 12 February 2002.
- 07/174 Prizes and Other Awards The Board approved the following recommendations:
 - (a) **J W Bigger Memorial Scholarship 2001-2002** on the recommendation of the School of Physic Committee: Mr Ian Gargan (99110954), 4th Medical Year;
 - (b) **O'Sullivan Memorial Scholarship 2001-2002** on the recommendation of the School of Physic Committee: Ms Srwa Khalid (01107615), 5th Medical Year;
 - (c) **Cluff Memorial Studentship** on the recommendation of the Head of Department, Modern History: renewal of the above Studentship for 2001-2002 to Mr T J H McCarthy, BA (Mod), MLitt, Oriel College, Oxford;
 - (d) Calendar Changes
 - (i) **Pharmacia and Upjohn Prizes in Medical Pharmacology** The Board noted and approved the terms of a memorandum from the Treasurer, circulated dated 31 January 2002;
 - (ii) **Entrance Awards Page U1** The Board approved the request of the Junior Dean and Registrar of Chambers that paragraph 4 be deleted.
 - (e) **Advisory Committee for the Fund for the Visual and Performing Arts** The Board approved recommendations, as set out in a letter from the Provost, circulated dated 7 February 2002:

Mr Joseph O'Gorman (Chapel Choir), €317 for the purchase of music for the Chapel Choir library;

Dr Peter Cherry (History of Art), €1,175 for the purchase of film still by Clare Langan for the Modern Art Collection;

Mr Stephen Wilmer (Drama Studies), €3,809 for visit of Native American dance company in March 2002;

Mr Donogh Coleman (Music), €1,836 for preparation of short film as part of final master's project;

Ms Joanna Hill and Ms Jane Veitch (DU Players), €2,500 for production of play, Patrick Marber's 'Closer' in Trinity term 2002.

- (f) **Minchin Bursary** The Board approved the recommendation of the Senior Tutor that this year's award should be made to: Paul Flanagan (99062704) Information and Computer Technology, value: €1,269.74.
- **07/175 Bequests and Benefactions Estelle Rayner Deceased** The Board noted a memorandum from the Treasurer, circulated dated 22 January 2002.
- **07/176 Nomination for Appointment** The Board noted the nomination for appointment (see Appendix 2 to these Minutes).
- 07/177 Equality Committee

- (a) Access and Equality Policy The Board noted that memorandum from the Secretary of the Personnel and Appointments Committee, circulated dated 30 January 2000, enclosing document 'Access and Equality Policy', circulated dated September 2001; had been withdrawn, and would be re-circulated following further discussions at the Personnel and Appointments Committee.
- (b) **Membership** The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Secretary of the Personnel and Appointments Committee, circulated dated 30 January 2002 in respect of the following changes in the membership:

Ms E Drew to replace Ms C Naddy as the graduate students' representative; Ms J Colbert to replace Ms A FitzGerald as Secretary to the Committee (Ms FitzGerald to remain a member) Mr T D Turpin has resigned from the membership.

- **07/178 Personnel and Appointments Committee Terms of Reference** The Board noted a memorandum from the Secretary of the Personnel and Appointments Committee, circulated dated 30 January 2002.
- **07/179 Amendment to College Policy Regarding Special Unpaid Leave for Career Breaks** The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Secretary of the Personnel and Appointments Committee, circulated dated 30 January 2002.
- **07/180** Annual Leave and Public Holiday Entitlements for Occasional Staff The Board noted and approved memorandum from the Secretary to the Personnel and Appointments Committee, circulated dated 30 January 2002.
- **07/181 Permissions St Patrick's Festival** The Board approved the request of the St Patrick's Day Festival to decorate the West Front of the College on St Patrick's Day, 17 March 2002. In response to a query from Dr Duffy the Secretary advised Board that the practice had evolved in recent years to facilitate the modest decoration of the West Front of College for the St Patrick's Festival on 17 March only.
- 07/182 Nominating Committees The Board approved the membership of the following committees:
 - (a) Director of Buildings Office Engineering Services Manager (permanent post) Bursar
 Mr T P Cooper
 Mr P M Mangan
 Dr D B Murray
 Mr S Brennan (NUI Dublin)
 - (b) Procurement and Contracts Officer (permanent post)
 Bursar
 Professor K M Devine
 Mr P M Mangan
 Ms G M Dempsey (or nominee)
 Mr P Dalton (NUI Maynooth)
 - (c) Administrative Officer, Office of the Dean of Graduate Studies (permanent post)
 Secretary
 Dean of Graduate Studies
 Ms P Callaghan

Dr E Murphy

- **07/183 Financial Governance of Irish Universities** The Board noted a memorandum from the Secretary, circulated dated 12 February 2002 and enclosed paper entitled, 'The Financial Governance of Irish Universities Balancing Autonomy and Accountability'.
- **07/184 Unit Cost Management Working Party Membership** The Board noted and approved the nomination of the Vice-Provost to the membership of this committee.
- **07/185 TCD Association and Trust Grant Applications Hilary Term 2002** The Board noted and approved the recommendations of the TCD Assocation and Trust in relation to the Research Fund, and noted its recommendations in relation to the General Fund, as circulated dated 11 February 2002:

Research Fund

(a)	Dr Nicholas Allen, Dept of English Towards the publication costs of a book entitled ' <i>George Russell</i> (Æ) and the new Ireland 1905-35'.	€1,740
(b)	Dr Brian Singleton, School of Drama Towards the cost of a lecture tour of three Caucasus countries in May 2002.	€1,130
(c)	Dr Jane C Stout, Botany Department Towards the cost of purchasing an AFLP plant mapping kit to assist with the research project entitled: 'Invasive weeds: the role of pollination mutualisms in population expansion', on condition that the equipment remains the property of the Botany Department.	€1,900
General	Fund	
General	Fund	
(d)	DU Filmmakers Digital Memory for 'Screenplay' editing suite - €600 Pistol Grip for Sonnheiser microphones - €173	€773
	DU Filmmakers Digital Memory for 'Screenplay' editing suite - €600	€773 €10,000 (max.)
(d)	DU Filmmakers Digital Memory for 'Screenplay' editing suite - €600 Pistol Grip for Sonnheiser microphones - €173 Medical Overseas Voluntary Electives €200 per student up to a maximum of 50 students travelling to	€10,000

(h) DU Judo Club €288
 To cover the cost of expenses to compete at the Ipswich Open Judo Competition on 17 March 2002.

07/186 Policy Issues – Recruitment and Retention of Academic Staff (see Minute 05/123 of 23 January 2002) The Board noted a memorandum from the Secretary, dated 13 February 2002 and attachment 'Report of the Committee on the Position of Women Academics', circulated dated June 1989.

07/187 Detained postgraduate student The Board noted that Mr Zhao Ming, the postgraduate student currently in detention in China, may be released in the near future.

Signed:

Date: