

The University of Dublin  
Trinity College

Minutes of Research Committee Meeting, 14 November 2017

Present:

Professor Martina Hennessy, Associate Dean of Research (ADoRMH),  
Professor Peter Gallagher, Associate Dean of Research (ADoRPG)

Faculty of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences  
Professor Nicholas Brown, School of Creative Arts  
Professor Stephen Minton, School of Education (part meeting)  
Professor Ann Devitt, Director of Research, School of Education (part meeting)  
Professor Daniel Geary, Director of Research, School of Histories and Humanities  
Professor Brian Brewer, Director of Research, School of Languages Literatures and Cultural Studies  
Professor Gaia Narciso, Director of Research, School of Social Sciences and Philosophy

Faculty of Engineering, Mathematics and Science  
Professor Emma Creagh, Director of Research, School of Biochemistry and Immunology  
Professor Declan O'Sullivan, Director of Research, School of Computer Science and Statistics

Faculty of Health Sciences  
Professor Jeffrey O'Sullivan, Director of Research, School of Dentistry  
Professor Helen Sheridan, Director of Research, School of Pharmacy and Pharmaceutical Sciences

Professor Orla Sheils, Director, TTMI

Mr Shane Collins, President, Graduate Students Union

In attendance:

Ms Doris Alexander, Research Development Manager, Trinity Research and Innovation  
Mr David O'Shea, Director of Financial Services, Financial Services Division  
Ms Helen Shenton, Librarian, Library  
Mr Leonard Hobbs, Director of Trinity Research and Innovation  
Dr Oonagh Kinsman, Trinity Research and Innovation, Secretary to the Committee

Apologies:

Professor Sam Slote, Director of Research, School of English  
Professor Blanaid Clarke, Director of Research, School of Law  
Professor Lorraine Leeson, Director of Research, School of Linguistic, Speech and Communication Sciences  
Professor Trevor Spratt, Director of Research, School of Social Work and Social Policy

Professor Jacob Erickson, Director of Research, School of Religions, Peace Studies and Theology  
 Professor Adrian Bracken, Director of Research, School of Genetics and Microbiology  
 Professor Jane Stout, Director of Research, School of Natural Sciences  
 Professor Seamus Donnelly, Director of Research, School of Medicine  
 Professor Jane Ohlmeyer, Director, Trinity Long Room Hub  
 Dr Geoff Bradley, Head of Academic Services and Operations, IT Services

Not present:

Professor Brian Lucey, Director of Research, School of Business  
 Professor Ruth Byrne, Director of Research, School of Psychology  
 Professor Thorfinnur Gunnlaugsson, Director of Research, School of Chemistry  
 Professor Luiz Da Silva, Director of Research, School of Engineering  
 Professor Sinead Ryan, Director of Research, School of Mathematics  
 Professor Martin Hegner, Director of Research, School of Physics  
 Professor Geralyn Hynes, Director of Research, School of Nursing and Midwifery  
 Professor Stefano Sanvito, Director, CRANN  
 Professor Mani Ramaswami, Director, TCIN  
 Professor Orla Hardiman, Director, TBSI  
 Professor Neville Cox, Dean of Graduate Studies

Actions arising / on-going:

Agenda Item	Owner	Action	Status
RS/15-16/63	Dean of Research	Seek final criteria for Measuring Research Productivity and Excellence from all three Faculties, collate and circulate to the Research Committee	<i>Complete</i>
RS/15-16/49	Dean of Research	Feedback on proposed Research Career Framework policy to be discussed at the IUA VPDoR meeting in November 2017	<i>In progress</i>
RS/15-16/57	Dean of Research	Consideration of additional SITS functionality to provide data for source of funding for PhD fees	<i>In progress</i>
RS/15-16/62	Associate Dean of Research	Report to the Research Committee with policies on bio-banking, data retention and stem cells	<i>In progress</i>
RS/16-17/10	Dean of Research	Feedback any information on SFI research integrity audits	<i>In progress</i>
RS/16-17/20	Dean of Research and President of Graduate Students Union	Consider postgraduate representative forum as a mechanism to raise research concerns in the Dail	<i>In progress</i>
RS/16-17/23	Dean of Research	Provide details of internal programmes to promote visiting academics and external ERC applications on internal web	<i>In progress</i>
RS/16-17/28	Dean of Research	Through the IUA, contribute to a response on SFI's proposed governance model for Centres	<i>In progress</i>

RS/16-17/39	Dean of Research	Raise the possibility of part year PhD fees where funding was provided for less than 4 years with the Dean of Graduate Studies	<i>In progress</i>
RS/17-18/03 & 04	Associate Dean of Research MH	Circulate revised centre proposals for Centre for Environmental Humanities and Centre for Digital Business	<i>Complete</i>
RS/17-18/07	Associate Dean of Research PG	Revert to SFI on equipment call and issues and ask Procurement to investigate contract arrangements for equipment maintenance.	<i>In progress</i>
RS/17-18/07	Dean of Research	The topic will be further explored by the Research Ethics Policy Committee and training needs identified	<i>In progress</i>
RS/17-18/12	Directors of Research	Provide Faculty nominees for Scival Users Group to ADorMH	<i>In progress</i>

### RS/17-18/07 Matters arising from the minutes

ADorMH informed the meeting that the appointment of Professor Linda Doyle as the new Dean of Research was approved by Board and will take up the position on 1 January 2018. (RS/17-18/01).

ADorMH suggested that the final criteria for Measuring Research Productivity and Excellence be obtained from all 3 Faculties, collated into one document and circulated to the Research Committee (RS/15-16/63).

The Research Career Framework will be an agenda item at the IUA VP Research meeting at the end of November. Trinity should then look at the proposed templates and consider how they are at variance with what is our current practice. (RS/15-16/49).

The additional SITS functionality to enable greater clarity on funding of PhD fees needs will be assessed by the new Dean. (RS/15-16/57).

The Ethics Policy Committee will meet next week and feedback in due course on policies on bio-banking, data retention and stem cells (RS/15-16/62).

ADorMH informed the meeting that in 2016 Prof Boland had requested an analysis of expenditure of SFI overheads from each Head of School. This fed into the process led by the Vice-Provost to alter the budgeting from an annual basis to a multi-annual basis. Also this process would aid the transparency of overheads expenditure. A white paper was prepared on the distribution of overheads in 2017. This initiative is being led by the Vice-Provost and will not come to the Research Committee for approval. The Directors of Research may have been involved in the School submission of data. Any changes proposed should come to the Research Committee for information only. (RS/16-17/04).

Feedback is still being sought from Prof Shane O'Mara on SFI's research integrity audit. The general terms and conditions of SFI are now more acceptable in that a report to a single individual in SFI is limited to a proven serious allegation. (RS/16-17/10).

The new Dean will be briefed on possible mechanisms to raise research concerns with politicians (RS/16-17/20).

The proposed governance model for SFI centres will be raised at the IUA VPDoRs meeting in November. (RS/16-17/28).

The ADoRMH will meet with the Dean of Graduate Studies to discuss the part year funding of PhDs. (RS/16-17/39). Questions had been raised about payment of PhD fees for Marie Skłodowska Curie ITNs. There is no waiver in Trinity for such fees and fees are paid from the grant although there is one example where support has been forthcoming from a Faculty. A non-ITN international development project funded through Irish Aid has also been granted permission to charge EU fees for non-EU students as Irish Aid provided only EU fees.

Revised centre proposals were received by the ADoR MH. These revised proposals were deemed to be approved and will be circulated again to the Research Committee for information. (RS/17-18/03 & 04)

#### **RS/17-18/08 Updates from the ADoRs**

ADoRPG updated the committee on new initiatives discussed at the SFI summit. They intend to fund PhD programmes with a total of 240 such PhDs to include SFI centre specific programmes and those which will involve a UK partner. Details were not provided but the Centre focused schemes will be rolled out first with a call in December 2017. He noted that all such PhDs would be enrolled within a School. PhDs are often requested to help out with undergraduate teaching in Schools. Research infrastructure call for equipment will be made however there is no allocated budget to fund at the moment but may be addressed over a 2 year period. Trinity was well represented in the awards made at the summit including Prof Rachel McLoughlin for SFI Early Career Researcher of the Year, himself for I-LOFAR for SFI Best International Engagement Award, Prof Fiona Newell for SFI Best Reported Impact. The research centre Future Milk was funded to a limited extent but all unfunded centres are still on the reserve list but there appears to be no ranking.

The Director of Research, School of Pharmacy and Pharmaceutical Sciences commented that there was an issue with Irish funding agencies requesting suggestions for purchase of new equipment while not providing maintenance costs or any overheads. She suggests that this should be fed back to SFI. Trinity has lost staff that have the capacity and ability to maintain equipment. She suggests that this is a major problem, that there is inefficient use of resources and unnecessary purchase costs and that Trinity should look at internal resourcing again. The Director, TTMI suggested that economies of scale can be made for College wide tendering for service contracts for some equipment types. She also commented that leasing is now an option and may be better value for money. SFI should also allow this option.

Action: ADoRPG will revert to SFI on equipment call and issues and ask Procurement to investigate contract arrangements for equipment maintenance.

The President of the Graduate Students Union asked if there was any information on the proposed new studentships eg the proposed fees or stipends or if there was any proposed extra Dublin living allowance. No further information is available.

IReL is an Irish Library initiative funded initially through PRTL to allow joint access to e-journals and hosted at University of Maynooth. All universities have a representative. The ADorRPG noted that a meeting was held last week to review journals and to discuss other Irish institutions joining the initiative.

The Librarian commented that this was an excellent initiative, is not common in other countries and she would support addition of other institutions. The deal was negotiated during the financial crash so the expectation is that the costs to universities will rise.

ADorMH commented that she had attended a meeting of SFI centres to discuss the public engagement plans. She commented that there was now an increasing emphasis on non-research specific requirements eg public engagement and gender analyses. She noted the LERU meeting for VP/Deans of Research will be held in Trinity in December and the new Dean will attend. She noted the new HRB toolkit for open access of data. She also noted that TCD had received two new ERC Consolidator Awards recently. She complimented Natural Sciences on the recent successful Nature + launch to further engagements with industry and other collaborators to maximise the benefits of Natural Capital.

#### **RS/17-18/09 Implementation of the General Data Protection Legislation in relation to research**

Ms Jenifer Ryan, Data Protection Officer presented the principles, new and enhanced rights and responsibilities. The requirements for research included technical and organisational safeguards, principle of data minimisation, pseudonymisation, transparency and Data Protection Impact Assessments (DPIAs). The processing of personal data for scientific purposes should also comply with other relevant legislation such as clinical trials. There are some exemptions for research where possible derogations are subject to conditions and safeguards set out in Member State or Union law, and where rights are likely to render impossible or seriously impair the achievement of the specific purposes. The Heads of Bill for Irish Law are available.

ADorPG commented that the drive for open access for research data by the Commission has to take this legislation into account. Also the secondary analysis of data for a different purpose where this has not been explicitly allowed in a consent form is a concern. The Director of Research, School of Computer Science and Statistics also commented that the on-going management of consent and compliance is an issue especially how to use data beyond the intended use, how this is tracked and managed and what additional consents are needed. Ms Ryan commented that a Data Protection Working Party will meet and may advise on toolkits especially for DPRIAs and how these might be held centrally. There is an understanding that there is a training need and this might be addressed by on-line training.

The Research Development Manager asked if it was likely that there would be different derogations applied in different Member States. Ms Ryan informed that this was a work in progress and it is likely that further amendments to legislation in Ireland may be necessary to address this issue.

The Librarian commented that open access and research data management is a topic of discussion at LERU meetings and internally with the College Solicitor.

Action: The topic will be further explored by the Research Ethics Policy Committee and training needs identified.

### **RS/17-18/10 Research Metrics Implementation**

Ms Niamh Brennan, Research Informatics, Library reviewed the Faculty Research Metrics (FRM) and the research informatics systems that fed into this process. Tools available to enable the process include an Academic status validation tool, a FRM exceptions validation tool, ABC/FRM Reports: College overview and School drilldown, a quick multi-edit tool, a Journal ranking tool and an individual self-checker (MyRSS). The process timelines for Schools was suggested. These metrics typically are used for returns to the HEA as part of the compact agreement.

The Director of Research, School of Social Sciences and Philosophy commented that the ability to add maternity leave etc on RSS was not possible and this needed to be addressed separately. The Director of Research, School of Pharmacy and Pharmaceutical Sciences commented that it was crucial to look at actual data and not normalised data. Ms Brennan confirmed that PIQA was not used in this process. She also commented that there was an institutional target that at least 80% of academic staff should be 'research productive' but that each School is responsible for its own data and the Directors of Research should be involved in this process. The Director of Research, School of Histories and Humanities queried the process of ranking the journals and suggested that external rankings be used. External rankings of journals was used by Computer Sciences and Statistics

### **RS/17-18/11 ERC Support Strategies**

Ms Emma Siddall, Research Projects Officer, Research Development Office, reviewed this H2020 programme and associated targets. The strategy included steps to identify, encourage and support candidates. Identification included benchmarking our academics and postdocs against recent successful ERC awardees, identifying potential external applicants from alumni, and from speaking with existing staff, inviting external academics to engage in the Trinity Visiting Academic Programme, examining the recently awarded ERC grants to determine if any grantees could be attracted here taking into account SFIs support. However she noted that the process of hosting an external ERC needs to be fully considered before supporting an application, or approaching an existing awardee. She noted that for external candidates, conversations on expectations need to be held early on. For

those not yet competitive the office can identify ways to increase their competitiveness. She asked for assistance with the encouragement at a School level, the timelines involved and the appropriate target year. School support is also needed for those submitting proposals including applying for Enterprise Ireland ERC Support grant, possible teaching buy-out or movement of teaching modules, pre-submission panels, proposal review and ethics, mock interviews and assistance post-award.

ADoRPG noted the financial supports from SFI for research within their remit which can influence the School's financial considerations. The Director of Research, School of Pharmacy and Pharmaceutical Sciences asked if patents were assessed as part of the c.v. Emma confirmed that they were. ADoRMH also noted that an event for Usshers is planned by the Research Development office in the New Year to discuss ERCs. Some have already applied.

#### **RS/17-18/12 AOB**

ADoRMH asked how many of the Committee were using Scival. The majority were not. She noted that the licence is for 3 years, urged use of the package especially for benchmarking, assessing collaborating partners and trends. She requested 2 nominee Directors of Research from each Faculty to join a user group, act as an internal champion and contribute to brainstorming sessions. Other members will be requested from Trinity Research and Innovation, Library, Dean of Research's office etc. A subject librarian is also available to provide training needs which will be assessed. The Librarian noted that plans were in hand for roll out of training.

Action: Nominations for SCIVAL users group to be forwarded to ADoRMH

ADoRMH noted that LERU had requested ideas for 'Research Missions' noted in the LAMY report on FP9. Such examples would be fed into a LERU position paper. These ideas did not need Research Committee approval and should be sent to LERU directly. One had already been proposed by the School of Religions, Peace Studies and Theology.