



Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

**XX = Board relevance**

**Trinity College Dublin  
The University of Dublin**

**A meeting of the University Council was held on Wednesday 18 January 2017 at 11.15 am in the Board Room.**

<i>Present</i>	Provost, Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, Registrar, Dean of Undergraduate Studies/Senior Lecturer, Dean of Graduate Studies, Senior Tutor, Dean of Research, Vice-President for Global Relations, Dean of Students, Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences, Professor S Garrigan, Professor A Holohan, Professor J Walsh, Professor S Murphy, Professor E O Nuallain, Professor C Comiskey, Professor J P Spiers, Professor M Clarke, Professor P Cronin, Professor A O’Gara, D Whelehan, Ms A MacPherson, Mr N Cooke, Ms E Crespo.
<i>Apologies</i>	Professor D Faas, Dean of Engineering, Mathematics and Science, Professor J Jones, Professor C Gardiner, Dean of Health Sciences, Dr S Chandra, Ms S Cameron-Coen, Mr Ms L Killeen, Ms E Ruiz Jiménez, Mr M Kenyon.
<i>In attendance</i>	Academic Secretary, Secretary to the College, Librarian and College Archivist, Dr A Oldam (Director of Student Services), Ms S De Brunner.
<i>Observers</i>	Secretary to the Scholars (Mr S Johnston).

**SECTION A**

The Provost requested that Council members declare any potential conflicts of interest in relation to the agenda. In relation to agenda item D.18.1, Faculty of Arts, Humanities and Social Science Staffing Summary, December 2016, the Secretary to the College advised that the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer had declared a statement of interest. The Secretary to the College recommended that the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer remain for the item. The Council accepted the recommendation.

**CL/16-17/077 Minutes**

The minutes of the meeting of 30 November 2016 were approved and signed.

**CL/16-17/078 Matters Arising**

- (i) CL/16-17/061: The Registrar noted that Board had approved the ordinance to amend the 2010 Consolidated Statutes and will now seek the assent of the Fellows. She clarified that the Fellows will vote on two items, the first in relation to changes to the chapter on the Fellows the ballots for which are due to be returned by 27<sup>th</sup> January 2017. The second vote concerns the academic year structure and the removal of restrictions on the scheduling of examinations; papers will issue on 30<sup>th</sup> January, to be returned by 20<sup>th</sup> February 2017.
- (ii) CL/16-17/074: Under matters arising, a memorandum, dated 16 January 2017, concerning the selection committee for the Professor of French (1776), was circulated.

The Secretary to the College confirmed that it replaced the memorandum circulated to the previous meeting of Council which had issued from the Head of School of Languages, Literatures and Cultural Studies rather than from the Dean of the Faculty of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences as it should have done. This element has been corrected and all other details remain the same. Council noted the corrected memorandum.

#### **CL/16-17/079 Provost's Report**

- (i) The Provost, noting that the Trinity Education Project featured later on the agenda, highlighted the size and comprehensiveness of the project and its many strands and advised Council that it would feature regularly on Council agendas during the year. He stressed the importance of the upcoming Fellows' vote on the academic year structure and increasing flexibility to examine undergraduate students outside Trinity Term. It is imperative that the College Statutes remain relevant and facilitate up-to-date teaching and learning methods. He advised that he had attended a meeting on the Two Subject Moderatorship (TSM), chaired by the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer and confirmed that they would meet with various groups in College to discuss the academic year structure changes to the 2010 Consolidated Statutes.

Council discussed the possibility that the upcoming Fellows' vote may be used by some of the Fellows to register their discontent about other issues. It was suggested that more could be done to shape the narrative to help ensure that those voting concentrate on the topic of the ballot. Council noted that undergraduate examinations are already occurring in all months of the year, apart from July, under derogations from Council and it also noted the largescale support of the student body for the changes being proposed. The importance of this statutory change to Trinity's internationalisation endeavour was stressed and it was commented that currently a significant proportion of one semester international students are assessed in different ways from full-year registered students and this was not welcomed by home universities. It was noted that this situation is far from ideal and could be negatively affecting revenue streams to College.

There was some discussion about how to communicate directly with the Fellows to emphasise the reasons for the ballot and to indicate the support of the College Officers, however, it was noted that this might be seen as inappropriate as communications should be channelled through the Chair of the Fellows. The Provost advised that he would give an address to the Fellows on this matter and other issues which are independent of the ballot.

- (ii) The Provost advised members that planning for the first largescale comprehensive fundraising campaign for College as a whole is continuing. He noted that the formal decision to run the campaign has yet to be made and will be contingent on ensuring that the targets set can be realistically met. If it proceeds, the campaign is likely to launch during 2018. To support this activity, the restructuring of Trinity Development and Alumni (formerly the Trinity Foundation) has taken place to ensure campaign readiness. The Director, Mr Nick Sparrow, is closely supported in relation to the campaign by Ms Kate Bond, Director of Campaigns, Ms Nicole Matthews, Communications Director, and Mr John Dillon, Alumni Director.
- (iii) The Provost notified Council that the Global Relations Strategy is to undergo a mid-term review and that the Vice-President for Global Relations and staff in her office are preparing for this. This evaluation will form part of a report to Council. Adding to this, the Vice-President for Global Relation commented that Trinity is likely to reach the 18% target but that this would not be evenly spread throughout College. The Provost noted that increased international partnership activity is a more effective means of

reaching and sustaining this target rather than focussing solely on individual student recruitment.

- (iv) The Provost provided an update on E3: The Engineering, Energy and Environment Institute and advised that the Dean of the Faculty of Engineering, Mathematics and Science was working with the Schools of Engineering, Computer Science and Statistics and Natural Sciences to develop their future teaching programmes. He highlighted the ambitious target to increase student numbers in the associated courses by 1,000 and plans to establish a research institute.
- (v) The Provost noted that the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation was working with Turnberry Consulting to develop an estates strategy for Trinity. Heretofore, development of the campus has occurred in an unplanned way and was often based on funding opportunities. The plan being drawn up will provide a blueprint for estates development into the future. The Provost confirmed that funding is in place to refurbish the Arts Block and that this project will be led by the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation who is putting together the necessary team for this purpose. Following this, the Hamilton Building is next on the list for refurbishment. Responding to a question, the Provost confirmed that the Lecky Library will be included in plans for the refurbishment of the Arts Block.
- (vi) The Provost advised that the HEA has launched a small capital funding programme for which the Bursar/ Director of Strategic Innovation and the Director of Estates and Facilities are putting together a submission. Largescale funding is not available but it is hoped that Trinity will be successful in gaining funding for some small capital projects. He also advised that the HEA is revising the way in which the recurring grant is allocated to third-level education institutions. It is not clear at this stage if it will remain based on student numbers, weighted where necessary, or if an element will be introduced to take into account research activity. He noted that Dr Graham Love has been appointed as the CEO of the HEA.
- (vii) The Provost confirmed Trinity's representatives on different panels convened under the auspices of the League of European Research Universities (LERU). He confirmed that a large contingent of Trinity staff will travel to Leuven to meet key staff and to establish ways of working within LERU.

#### **CL/16-17/080 Proposed New Method for Strategic Hires**

**XX**

The Provost welcomed the Director of Human Resources to the meeting.

A memorandum from the Dean of Research and Director of Human Resources, dated 8 December 2016, was circulated. The Dean of Research introduced the item by explaining that Trinity had been in line to recruit five professors under the recent Science Foundation Ireland (SFI) Targeted Professors Initiative, however, despite significant efforts only one of the five candidates was secured. The recent process was evaluated by Human Resources to see what lessons could be learnt for the future and it was concluded that the existing process was too complicated, which led to some confusion, and there was a specific issue related to the hiring of partners/spouses. As a result, Human Resources and Trinity Research and Innovation collaborated to develop a more workable hiring process. Before handing over to the Director of Human Resources, the Dean of Research emphasised that the proposed mechanism relates specifically to the recruitment of those recognised internationally as excellent researchers/scholars; such positions would be in addition to existing staff numbers and would complement existing recruitment schemes.

The Director of Human Resources outlined the main issues identified through the review:

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

- (i) Making the offer subject to the award of an SFI award is too time consuming and does not convey a positive message to highly sought-after individuals.
- (ii) The lack of planning in relation to the recruitment of a candidate's spouse/partner places Trinity at a disadvantage where a number of institutions are competing to attract the same candidate.
- (iii) There was evidence of fragmentation in the processes and a tendency to view the recruitment of such individuals from a school-centric perspective. The recruitment of such high calibre scholars should be viewed and treated as an activity that will benefit the University as a whole.
- (iv) An attractive remuneration package is necessary in a globally competitive market to attract and secure elite academics. The process to approve higher rates of remuneration is lengthy.
- (v) The overall process for recruitment and approval is 'bottom-up', initiated at the school-level and is fragmented.

She summarised the following proposed solutions:

- (vi) The Dean of Research in consultation with the Provost and Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer would be mandated by Board to manage the identification and recruitment of elite scholars in consultation with the relevant Head(s) of School/Faculty Dean(s) and senior academics. Funding would be through a combination of benefactions/philanthropic funding and high-value grants. Funding could be used to create an attractive package for dual appointments (if the partner or spouse is an academic, or, if appropriate and feasible to do so), relocation and, if possible, enhanced benefits for strategic hires.
- (vii) A Sub-Committee on Remuneration (SCR) should be established, chaired by the Provost or an external Board member. The SCR will be mandated by Board to oversee the negotiations of all aspects of the candidate's offer in conjunction with the hiring lead.
- (viii) Under the new process, Schools would be able to make a formal recommendation, supported by a clear strategic business case for a specific named strategic hire to the Dean of Research for his/her consideration. If approved by the Dean of Research, he/she would inform the SCR to review any cases requiring the application of the remuneration departures framework.
- (ix) The Dean of Research, with the authorisation from the SCR, would be able to act as primary negotiator and would be mandated to offer a salary of up to €185,000 without the requirement to seek case-by-case salary approvals from Board in advance.

Clarification was sought in relation to the potential filling of vacant established chairs through this process, noting that the new process would effectively change existing procedures in this area, and in relation to the potential for remit slippage, since all recruitment could be said to be strategic. The Dean of Research confirmed that this process is intended only for elite academics and the Director of Human Resources suggested that the process could link in with the Planning Group as an added approval step. Council noted that if recruitment is linked to an established vacant chair, discussions must first be held with the relevant Faculty Dean. The Dean of Research also confirmed that consultation would occur with the relevant School in relation to the recruitment of a spouse/partner. He also confirmed that funding might wholly derive from philanthropic funding.

#### **Decision/Action**

- 80.1:** Council approved the proposed new procedures subject to the inclusion of the Planning Group in the approval process and the insertion of early consultation with the relevant Faculty Dean in cases where recruitment might involve the offer of a vacant established chair. The words 'and/or' are to be included on p.3 to clarify how funding may be comprised to read 'Such strategic hires will be funded through a combination of benefactions/philanthropic funding and/or high-value grants (SFI, EU, AXA and other funders).'

- 80.2:** The proposal, with tracked-changes showing the agreed revisions, would return to the next meeting of Council for noting.
- 80.3:** The proposal, as revised by Council, can proceed to Board immediately for approval.

*The Director of Human Resources left the meeting.*

**CL/16-17/081 Trinity Education Project**

A document from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, dated 16 January 2017, providing an update on key elements of the Trinity Education Project, was circulated.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer noted that a number of items for consideration and approval will come to Council. Entry routes will be one such item, especially in relation to TSM subjects. He reminded Council members of the grid circulated to the last meeting of Council which would actually allow for even more subject combinations than at present, however, he confirmed that Trinity has committed to the HEA to reduce the current number of entry routes. Another item, related to entry routes, is the development of a fixed timetable. The work involved in this area is of a technical nature and should provide flexibility to allow students to enter programmes at later course stages.

He referred to the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies's work on regulations and academic progression. The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies confirmed that 11 initial recommendations were discussed at the Undergraduate Studies Committee on 17 January 2017 where the focus was given to those items which would require significant cultural change, such as, requiring that each of the Freshman years to be graded as pass/fail, repetition of years, rolling out of supplemental assessments in all years, the removal of compensation and the removal of the special examination session. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer commented that these items are now live for discussion and would affect all of those who are involved in teaching and assessing students. He noted that the Trinity Education Fellows are now in place and work has started in relation to looking at the optimal ways in which to assess students. He confirmed that meetings to discuss required systems changes are being held on a fortnightly basis and that modelling work has commenced in relation to the new undergraduate science education architecture. A paper on internships and student mobility would come to Council in due course. It has been suggested that the title for the Trinity Education project could be more appealing and discussions have been held with areas working on key research themes in College in relation to the development of Trinity elective modules. A paper on the co- and extra-curriculum will also come to Council in due course.

The Provost queried the prevailing stance in Trinity which supports students specialising from their first year. He noted that this is at odds with other universities in Ireland, for example, in the arts and humanities, and questioned if Trinity's approach was pedagogically sound. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer confirmed that the approach was sound but aspects must be reformed. Through the discussion of this matter, it was noted that Trinity provides security of choice for students who know what they want to do from the point of entry and it was commented that since pathways are being developed to allow student movement, safeguards are in place for students who discover they have chosen the wrong area of study. The low attrition rate in TSM was also noted and the feedback from potential applicants during the Open Day was generally in support of early specialisation.

The Provost thanked the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer for the update and invited him to provide a paper outlining the pedagogical basis for retaining denominated entry.

**Decision/Action**

**81.1:** The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer to provide a paper outlining the pedagogical basis for retaining denominated entry routes rather than moving towards more generalised entry as is the case in other universities.

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings**

**CL/16-17/082 M.Sc. in Human Resource Management**

A memorandum from the Dean of Graduate Studies, dated 9 January 2017, was circulated along with a proposal for a new M.Sc. course in Human Resource Management which also provides an exit award of P.Grad.Dip. Speaking to the document, the Dean of Graduate Studies commented that this is the latest proposal from the Business School to add to the suite of courses on offer. It is placed at level 9 on the National Framework of Qualifications, contains 90 ECTS, 60 ECTS of which are related to taught modules and it would be offered over one-year full-time or two years part-time. The taught modules comprise 12, 5 ECTS modules some of which are shared with other courses delivered by the Trinity Business School and others of which are bespoke to the course. The School is already undertaking work to secure accreditation for the course.

The External Reviewer, Professor Tony Dundon, Professor of Human Resource Management and Employment Relations, Alliance Manchester Business School, University of Manchester had provided a positive review and commented that the course is well placed to attract applicants.

**Decision/Action**

**82.1:** Council approved the proposal for a new postgraduate course in Human Resource Management leading to an award of M.Sc. or an exit award of P.Grad.Dip and noted that it is due to commence in September 2017.

**CL/16-17/083 Any Other Urgent Business**

There was no other business.

**SECTION B****CL/16-17/084 Academic Appeals Committee**

XX

The minutes of the meeting of 29 November 2016 were noted and approved.

**CL/16-17/085 Graduate Studies Committee**

The draft minutes of the meeting of 24 November 2016 were noted and approved.

**CL/16-17/086 Quality Committee**

The draft minutes of the meeting of 1 December 2016 were noted and approved along with the following appended documents:

- (i) Progress report for the School of Education;
- (ii) Implementation plan for the B.Sc. in Human Nutrition and Dietetics;
- (iii) Policy/Procedure for Approval of Higher Education Institutions/Linked Providers' Quality Assurance Procedures;
- (iv) Implementation plan for the School of English;
- (v) The Terms of Reference for the Royal Irish Academy of Music (RIAM) Associated Colleges Degree Committee (ACDC).

**CL/16-17/087 Research Committee**

The minutes of the meetings of 4 October 2016 and 8 November 2016 were noted and approved.

**CL/16-17/088 Student Life Committee**

The draft minutes of the meeting of 15 November 2016 were noted and approved.

**SECTION C**

**CL/16-17/089 Higher Degrees—Reports of Examiners**

The Council noted and approved the reports of examiners on candidates for higher degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 30 November 2016 and noted by Board on 14 December 2016.

(i) **Higher Degrees by Research Alone**

**PhD** Eileen Carey; Simon Carroll; Susannah Cass; Bethany Leigh Flanders; Marina Gibbes; Gavin Kenny; Louise Catherine McQuaid; Rebekah Jean Maguire; Nijun Wei

**Amendment (name change only) originally approved by sub-committee of Higher Degrees on 26th October 2016**

Tracey Marie-Celeste Lydon

**MAI** Rían Paul O'Dwyer

**MSc** Marianne Griffiths; Evangelos Kapros; Darina Dawn Iris Kiely; Sahar Osman.

**CL/16-17/090 Membership: Academic Appeals Committees for Graduate Students (Taught and Research)**

The Council noted and approved the Memorandum from the Registrar, circulated, dated 10 January 2016.

**CL/16-17/091 Headship of Discipline of History**

The Council noted and approved the Memorandum from the Head of School of Histories and Humanities, circulated, dated 17 January 2017.

**SECTION D**

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

Signed .....

Date .....

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings