Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

XX = Board relevance

The University of Dublin
Trinity College

A meeting of the University Council was held on Wednesday 18 November 2015 at 11.15 am in the Board Room.

Present
Provost, Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, Registrar, Dean of Undergraduate Studies/Senior Lecturer, Dean of Graduate Studies, Vice-President for Global Relations, Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences, Professor D Faas, Professor C Morash, Professor J Walsh, Professor R Dahyot, Professor J P Spiers, Professor P Cronin, Professor M Clarke, Dr S Bloomfield, Ms M Kenny, Ms P O’Beirne, Mr D Whelehan, Dr G Hegarty, Mr M McInerney.

Apologies
Senior Tutor, Dean of Research, Dean of Students, Professor A Holohan, Dean of Engineering, Mathematics and Science, Professor G Watson, Professor I Donohue, Professor J Jones, Dean of Health Sciences, Professor C Comiskey, Professor D Kelleher, Ms S Cameron-Coen, Mr J Bryant, Chief Operating Officer.

In attendance
Academic Secretary, Librarian and College Archivist, Secretary to the College, Ms S De Brunner.

Observers
Secretary to the Scholars (Ms A P Worrall), Mr A McDermott.

By invitation
Professor E O’Dell (for CL/15-16/053), Mr P Millar for (CL/15-16/054), Professor P Browne for (CL/15-16/057).

SECTION A

The Provost requested that Council members declare any potential conflicts of interest in relation to the agenda items. None was declared.

CL/15-16/049 Statutory Declaration
A new observer made the declaration.

CL/15-16/050 Minutes
The minutes of the meeting of 21 October 2015 were approved and signed subject to the addition of the following sentence to the end of the second paragraph of CL/15-16/031:

‘The opportunity for the Library to be involved with the new Ussher posts was welcomed and it was noted there had been enormous value in the discussions about potential collaborations across the Schools and that several of the successful posts involved the Library.’
Matters Arising

CL/15-16/031: A document from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer confirming the conditions attached to each new Ussher assistant professor position, dated 17 November 2015, was circulated. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer noted that at the last meeting of Council it was not sufficiently clear, in the case of all Ussher positions, that the associated conditions were in fact final. She referred to the circulated document and confirmed that these had all been approved by the appropriate head of school and school executive committee. Council noted and approved the conditions attached to each new Ussher position, as outlined in the circulated document.

Provost’s Report

(i) The Provost informed Council that there had been a consultative meeting involving Mr Peter Cassells, chairperson of the expert group to examine future funding policy for higher education in Ireland, and the presidents of the Irish universities. He also referred to a funding consultative forum which had been attended by Trinity’s Chief Financial Officer. The Provost noted that the information provided at each of these fora was consistent and that the underfunding of higher education in Ireland is now clearly recognised. This signals an important change in perception on higher education funding which was, perhaps, influenced by the symposium ‘21st Century Universities: Performance and Sustainability’. He noted that income-contingent loans were suggested as a possibility but that it is unlikely that the group will put forward final recommendations until after the general election in 2016.

Responding to a question, he confirmed that the Irish Universities Association (IUA) would wait to analyse the details of the Cassels Group report, when it is published, before it adopts a position on the recommendations. He noted that the IUA has not taken a position on income-contingent loans, however, he also commented that the higher education sector cannot operate on reduced funding. It can already be seen that some industries are finding it difficult to find sufficient numbers of graduates in their field and if the funding issue is not rectified, additional problems are being stored up for the future. If student loans are proposed, it is not clear which model would be recommended.

(ii) The Provost notified members that the first large-scale integrated fundraising campaign in Trinity would be launched soon. The Campaign Cabinet, comprising five internal and five external members, and a Provost’s Council are already in place. The purpose of the campaign is to increase philanthropic donations and to build support for the institution, for example, from the government and its agencies, and industry. The success of this campaign will be crucial to projects like the Engineering, Energy and Environment Institute. He confirmed that the fundraising strategy would incorporate funding for the Library.

(iii) The Provost noted that met with the panel conducting the Higher Education Authority’s Review on Gender Equality in Higher Education, chaired by Mrs Maire Geoghegan-Quinn. He commented that the panel are determined to identify the root-causes of barriers to gender equality among academic staff.

(iv) The Provost spoke of a trip to China to develop relationships with a number of universities, which included the acceptance of an invitation from Mrs Carrie Lam, Chief Secretary of Administration of Hong Kong, to visit Hong Kong. He invited the Vice-President for Global Relations to speak to activities in the region.

The Vice-President for Global Relations updated Council on the recent delegation to China with the Minister for Education and Skills. She particularly referred to visits to Beijing and Shanghai and Trinity’s attendance at student fairs. She noted that there is evidence of greater recognition of Trinity as a third-level education destination and
commented that the establishment of the Centre for Asian Studies has helped in this regard. Partnerships are being explored with higher education institutions in China in relation to their students spending one or two years of their undergraduate education at Trinity. Finally, she informed Council of the IUA sponsored visit to Vietnam which initially pertained to Ph.D. education but which has now opened up other opportunities. Irish Aid has provided a grant in the area of data science for an Irish partner based in Vietnam.

(v) The Provost reported on the provision, by the Atlantic Philanthropies, of a grant of approximately €140 million, jointly to Trinity and the University of California, San Francisco, to establish the Global Brain Health Institute which will focus on the area of dementia. He noted that some €70 million of the total grant will be directed towards Trinity, which makes it the largest private donation in the history of the State. The Trinity team is being led by Professor of Psychology, Ian Robertson, and the Conolly Norman Professor of Old Age Psychiatry, Brian Lawlor.

**Professor E O’Dell joined the meeting**

**CL/15-16/053 Revision of Chapters and Schedules of the Statutes**

The Provost welcomed Professor Eoin O’Dell to the meeting. A memorandum from the Registrar, on behalf of the Schedules Working Party, dated 11 November 2015, was circulated. The Registrar, introducing the item noted that upon the completion of the work of the Statutes Review Working Party, with the adoption of the 2010 Consolidated Statutes of Trinity College Dublin and of the University of Dublin (2010 Consolidated Statutes), Board established the Schedules Working Party to revise the schedules to the Statutes and to make consequential recommendations for revisions to the chapters of the Statutes. Several issues had been left over by the Statutes Review Working Party, and these have now been concluded by the Schedules Working Party. It has already made a number of proposals to Board and Council, and will bring a comprehensive revision of the schedules, and some associated revisions to the chapters, to a joint meeting of Board and Council on 20 January 2016.

She outlined the main areas of change and noted that the Schedules Working Party did not have a policy development role but was responsible only for drafting changes to the Statutes, where necessary, arising from policies approved by Board and/or Council. She noted a correction to the circulated document in relation to the proposed change to the Schedule on the Process by which the Provost is chosen by College and confirmed that this should refer to the right of candidates, who are not members of the electorate, to be present in the voting chamber.

Professor O’Dell then spoke to the Committee in more detail about the proposed changes to the schedules and chapters related to the following areas:

(i) Academic and administrative units. These give effect to governance documents, to various Board decisions, and to START (Supports in Trinity Administrative Review and Transformation); and they were not provided in 2010 as these policies had not been either decided or properly bedded down.

(ii) Elections. In particular, there is a new Schedule on Electorate and Register, which gives effect to various decisions of board relating to elections.

(iii) Academic titles.

(iv) Standing orders of Board and Council.

(v) Changes to the chapters on Students and Scholars arising from a decision of a 2014 Visitors’ case and also from the High Court decision in the case of Fogarty v TCD.

(vi) Inter-relationship of the academic year with the terms of office for Annual Statutory Officers.
Council Minutes of 18 November 2015

(vii) Principles of agency and delegation. Whilst these were provided for in the 2010 Consolidated Statutes, the revisions were not as extensive as necessary.

He advised that the proposed changes to the text would be published on the Trinity website and that the community would be notified by e-mail when these are available to read. He also provided details on the timescale and stages of approval. Responding to a query regarding the incorporation of changes necessitated by changes to the policy on Fitness to Practise, he noted that these would not be ready for this round of revisions, however, the process of maintaining the Statutes is continual and changes would be incorporated at a later stage.

The Provost thanked the Registrar and Professor O’Dell for providing an update to Council and for their work, and the work of the Schedules Working Party, in revising the 2010 Statutes.

Professor E O’Dell withdrew from the meeting and Mr P Millar joined the meeting.

CL/15-16/054 Academic Registry Enhancement Programme - Update

The Provost welcomed the Director of the Academic Registry Enhancement Programme, Mr Pat Millar, to the meeting to give an update on activities and developments in the Academic Registry.

Mr Millar outlined the objectives of the Academic Registry Enhancement Programme and spoke to the progress made under each of the programmes’ work streams. He noted that the organisational structure of the Academic Registry had been redesigned and now comprises three main functional areas each with its own head; Operations, Service, and Business Support and Planning. The heads of these areas report to the Director of the Academic Registry, Ms Leona Coady. Offers had been accepted for the positions of Head of Business Support and Planning and the Head of Service; recruitment processes have not concluded for the Head of Operations. He advised that the organisational structure being implemented would allow for greater flexibility to respond to the needs of the student lifecycle. It will also foster a culture of continuous process improvement by providing the capacity and space, through the Business Support and Planning pillar, to enhance processes and to be more proactive. Likewise, the service culture will be enhanced through the establishment of a strong Service pillar. He provided details of a number of initiatives under the Service theme including the compilation and publication of key metrics against set targets, the development of a process to manage problems by looking at their root causes and the creation of an Academic Registry forum to allow greater engagement with schools and other stakeholders.

He noted the progress made on a number of systems improvements in SITS and gave details of the processes which have been examined and re-designed. The migration of data from Admin 5 to SITS had been nearly completed with 97.6% of records transferred and with the remaining 2.4% to be manually cleaned and transferred. He outlined difficulties with the design and implementation of modularisation for postgraduate taught courses, primarily due to a delay in information from the vendor of SITS, Tribal, in relation to options available in the system and examples in other universities. Some progress had been made to find a solution and a high-level approach will be discussed with the Dean of Graduate Studies and Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer.

He drew the attention of the committee to statistics related to calls logged in September 2015 compared to the same period in the previous year. These showed an improvement in the proportion of calls resolved and closed within one day and those resolved within four days. He also highlighted the increase in the number of online registrations completed in September 2015 (12,800) when compared to September 2014 (10,993).

Responding to a query related to the transfer of the Student Cases function to the Academic Registry, and concerns related to the serious backlog of cases, Mr Millar advised that work is

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings
planned for the start of 2016 to look at the underlying processes. The Dean of Undergraduate Studies commented on the increasing pressures faced by the Student Cases team with the volume and complexity of cases increasing. She stressed the importance of finding solutions in the short-term to address the large backlog of cases and advised that a working group is examining appeals processes with a view to reduce the number of appeals being made, as well as the time spent processing these cases.

Responding to further queries, Mr Millar noted that questions would have to be directed to IT Services in relation to the implementation of general modularisation under the Education Project and the capabilities of SITS; he confirmed that a breakdown of the categories of calls received by the Academic Registry could be provided; and that if there are recurring problems these can be raised at the Academic Registry forum.

The Provost thanked Mr Millar for the update.

Mr P Millar withdrew from the meeting.

It was stressed by a member that Trinity's reputation is at risk if a short-term solution is not put in place to deal with the large backlog of student cases. The Dean of Undergraduate Studies/Senior Lecturer noted that Trinity has an individualised way of dealing with student cases and, if this is to be retained, it must be adequately resourced. Council requested that action be taken as a matter of priority to alleviate the backlog in the short-term.

Postgraduate Course Proposals

(i) Joint M.Sc. in Comparative Social Change with UCD
A memorandum from the Dean of Graduate Studies, dated 11 November 2015, was circulated along with a proposal for a joint course leading to a jointly awarded M.Sc. in Comparative Social Change. The Dean of Graduate Studies introduced the proposal, noting that it complies with the framework agreed with UCD for the development and delivery of joint postgraduate courses. She remarked on the history of collaboration between the counterpart sociology departments in Trinity and UCD and their sharing of expertise. She confirmed that Trinity is to be the administrative hub in the partnership.

Speaking about the course structure, she stated that it is a one-year, 90 ECTS, full-time course, with an exit diploma available after the accumulation of 60 (taught modules) ECTS. Within the taught portion of the course, students must take core modules carrying 30 ECTS and a further 30 ECTS worth of optional modules, with at least 10 ECTS of these from each institution. In addition, there is a 30 ECTS dissertation module. She advised that a broad range of assessment methods are to be used, that the pass mark is placed at 40% and that, as the administrative hub, Trinity will host the conferral ceremony and be responsible for the production of the joint award parchments.

She noted that the proposal had received a positive review from Professor Fiona Smyth, Associate Dean, Teaching, Learning and Students in the Faculty of Humanities, University of Manchester.

Council approved the proposal for a new course in Comparative Social Change leading to the award of M.Sc., with an exit award of P.Grad.Dip., to be jointly delivered and awarded with UCD. It was noted that the course was due to commence in September 2016.

(ii) M.Phil. in Philosophy with an exit award of P.Grad.Dip
A memorandum from the Dean of Graduate Studies, dated 11 November 2015, was circulated along with a proposal for a new course leading to the award of M.Phil. in
Philosophy. The Dean of Graduate Studies noted that, if approved, it would be the first taught postgraduate course in Philosophy offered in the School of Social Sciences and Philosophy. She explained that the Department of Philosophy wishes to increase its student numbers to create critical mass and to provide a pipeline of potential Ph.D. students.

She noted that the proposal concerns a one-year, full-time course carrying 90 ECTS with an exit P.Grad.Dip. available on the successful completion of taught modules to the value of 60 ECTS. There is also a dissertation module which carries 30 ECTS. She advised that the course is assessed mainly by essay and dissertation and that the pass mark is set at 40%.

She advised that the proposal had been reviewed by Professor Duncan Prichard FRSE, Chair of Epistemology and Deputy Head of the School of Philosophy, Psychology and Language Sciences, University of Edinburgh, who deemed it to be an excellent proposal.

Responding to a query concerning potential collaboration with UCD, the Dean of Graduate Studies, stated that UCD has a well-established suite of taught postgraduate courses, whereas, this would be the first on offer in Trinity. Time is necessary for Trinity to establish a strong taught postgraduate offering in Philosophy and, in any case, there would be little incentive for UCD to replace one of its existing courses with a joint course. The Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences spoke of the powerful sense of ownership felt by the Department of Philosophy in relation to the new course.

Council approved the proposal for a new postgraduate course in Philosophy leading to the award of M.Phil., with an exit award of P.Grad.Dip. It was noted that the course is due to commence in September 2016.

Professor D Faas retired from the meeting.

Undergraduate Course Proposal

B.A. (Mod.) in Middle Eastern and European Languages and Cultures
A memorandum from the Dean of Undergraduate Studies/Senior Lecturer, dated 10 November 2015, was circulated with a proposal for a new course in Middle Eastern and European Languages and Cultures leading to the award of B.A. (Mod.) with an exit award of ordinary B.A. The Dean of Undergraduate Studies/Senior Lecturer introduced the proposal and noted that the course builds on the existing undergraduate course in European Studies delivered by the School of Languages, Literatures and Cultural Studies. The development of the course supports the strategic objective of strengthening and further embedding the discipline of Near and Middle Eastern Studies in the School.

The course, if approved, would be unique in Ireland and the United Kingdom as it takes an integrated approach to the study of its underlying subjects rather than adopting a disjointed joint honors structure. In addition to providing students with the opportunity to study a European and a Middle Eastern language and their associated cultures, the course also enables the study of the interactions and clashes between the two regions and their cultures, and examines the evolution of those cultures from antiquity to the present. She outlined the main features of the course structure, noting that students choose a European language in the Junior Freshman year and take up a Middle Eastern language in their second year. The Junior Sophister year is spent abroad in a European or in a Middle Eastern university; it is expected that most students will go to institutions in Europe. In their final year, students must complete a

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings
Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings
students which would increase by 20 students in each of the subsequent four years, leading to a maximum number of 180 new entrants.

In relation to teaching arrangements, she confirmed that SIT staff will deliver modules carrying 120 ECTS and Trinity staff will deliver modules accounting for 60 ECTS. In particular, Trinity will take the lead on modules related to research methods and the dissertation, though the supervision of submitted dissertations would be split between staff in Trinity and SIT. As the course must be professionally accredited, all modules are mandatory and it includes five blocks of clinical practice to be taken over the third and fourth years of the course.

In relation to the support of the course, SIT has been designated as the administrative hub institution and its regulations, academic and disciplinary, will apply. SIT will be responsible, in the main, for the academic administration of the programme from admitting students to hosting the conferral ceremony. Students will be registered in both institutions and, since students will not need access to any services in Trinity, the possibility of applying a ‘lighter’ registration status here, comparable to that provided to students on the Study Group foundation programme, is being explored. The chair of the course committee will be held by representatives of SIT and TCD on an alternating three-year basis, and the external examiners will be jointly appointed. The course will lead to a single degree, jointly awarded by both institutions.

She noted that the proposal was reviewed by Dr Una Jones, Senior Lecturer in the School of Health Care Sciences at Cardiff University, who provided a comprehensive review with a number of suggestions; these have been addressed through revisions to the proposal.

Council approved the proposal for a new joint course in Physiotherapy, leading to the award of B.Sc. (Physio.) to be jointly awarded with SIT. It was noted that the course is due to commence in September 2016.

*Professor P Browne joined the meeting.*

**CL/15-16/057 Proposed Revisions to Academic Titles: Clinical Track**

The Provost welcomed the Head of the School of Medicine, Professor Paul Browne to the meeting. A memorandum from the Head of the School of Medicine and the Dean of Health Sciences, dated 10 November 2015, was circulated along with proposed amendments to the document *Academic Titles in Trinity College Dublin*.

Introducing the item, Professor Browne explained that the amendments had been drawn up in consultation with Human Resources and had been considered by the School of Medicine Executive Committee, the Faculty of Health Sciences Executive Committee and the Human Resources Committee. He explained that those holding clinical titles are usually hospital-based staff members who provide part-time unremunerated teaching within the Faculty of Health Sciences. The changes being proposed are designed to:

(i) Address anomalies, arising from the re-designation of clinical titles in 2012, in the appointment and promotion of Clinical Lecturers and Clinical Senior Lecturers in the School of Medicine, on a once-off basis.

(ii) Introduce the title of Clinical Associate Professor to address a gap in the clinical track, to allow for the introduction of an intermediate promotional step and to bring Trinity’s clinical titles in line with those used in other universities.

(iii) Change the criteria for appointment and promotion to broaden the scope of the clinical titles to better encompass all schools in the Faculty of Health Sciences and the various health professionals that contribute to teaching and research.

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*
(iv) Clarify titles such as those used for Academic Consultants and Lecturer Registrars/Specialist Registrars to better reflect current naming conventions used in practice.

The discussion that followed focussed on the re-introduction of an intermediate promotion grade to be called Clinical Associate Professor. Council noted that this title was mapped to the pre-2012 clinical title of Clinical Professor (by promotion only) in the proposal document. A number of suggestions were made in relation to how the new clinical titles should map to the pre-2012 clinical titles and to standard academic titles used in Trinity.

Council noted that the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, the Head of the School of Medicine and Professor J P Spiers would discuss the document and clarify matters related to the alignment of the promotion stage ahead of the document coming back to the next meeting of Council for approval.

Professor P Browne withdrew from the meeting.

**CL/15-16/058 Any Other Urgent Business**

The Dean of Undergraduate Studies/Senior Lecturer noted that, following the Paris terrorist attacks of Friday, 13 November 2015, she had met with the Senior Tutor, the Head of the Student Counselling Service and the Head of the School of Law to discuss options for Trinity students on exchange programmes in France. The Senior Tutor and the Head of the Student Counselling Service had travelled to Paris to meet with students individually and in groups. The academic options for those wishing to leave Paris would be assessed. It was noted that the Students’ Union had organised a candlelit vigil, to take place on the evening of Thursday 19 November outside the Chapel.

**SECTION B**

**CL/15-16/059 Graduate Studies Committee**

Council noted and approved the draft minutes of the meeting of 22 October 2015.

**CL/15-16/060 Human Resources Committee**

The draft minutes of the meeting of 24 September 2015 were noted and approved along with updated policies concerning:

(i) Adoptive Leave
(ii) Regulations on Outside Earnings

**CL/15-16/061 Quality Committee**

The draft minutes of the meeting of 15 October 2015 were noted and approved.

**CL/15-16/062 Student Life Committee**

The draft minutes of meetings of 6 May and 8 October 2015 were noted and approved.

**CL/15-16/063 Research Committee**

The draft minutes of 3 November 2015 were noted and approved.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings
SECTION C

CL/15-16/064 Membership of the University Council
(i) Graduate Students’ Union Observer
The Council noted that Mr Adam McDermott would represent the GSU Observer in 2015-2016.

(ii) Faculty of Engineering, Mathematics and Science (FEMS), Senior Constituency, Head of School
The Council noted that Professor Jeremy Jones would represent the FEMS Senior Constituency, Head of School in 2015-2016.

CL/15-16/065 Higher Degrees—Reports of Examiners
The Council noted and approved the reports of examiners on candidates for higher degrees, circulated, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 21 October 2015 and noted by Board on 11 November 2015.

(i) Professional Higher Degrees by Research Alone
D.Ch.Dent. Anna Beattie; Kate Farrell; Danielle Louise Mc Geown.

(ii) Higher Degrees by Research Alone
Ph.D. Michael Gordon Babechuk; Colm Bhhandal; Linda Marie Biesty; Edel Hennessey; Emilia Jerman; Omar Mahfoud; Rebecca Murphy; Marie O Dwyer; Sayandeep Purkayasth.

M.A.I. Recurrent Education John Paul Rooney.

M.Sc. Tatiana MacKlin; Aideen Ni Choileain.

M.Litt. Mary Silvia Roche.

CL/15-16/066 Committees - Personal Chairs Sub-Committee and Junior Academic Progressions Committee
The Council noted and approved a memorandum, circulated, from the Manager, Staff Performance and Review, dated 2 November 2015.

CL/15-16/067 Headship of Schools
(i) School of Education
The Council noted that the Board had approved on 11 November 2015 the nomination of Professor Michael Shevlin as Head of School (2015-2016).

(ii) School of Dental Science
The Council noted that the Board had approved on 11 November 2015 the nomination of Professor Brian O’Connell to the headship of the School of Dental Science/Dean of Dental Affairs from 1 November 2015 to 31 October 2020.

CL/15-16/068 School Directors
The Council noted and approved the following appointments:

(i) School of Genetics and Microbiology

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings
(ii) School of Languages, Literatures and Cultural Studies
   a) Director of Research: Dr Roja Fazaeli;
   b) Director of Teaching and Learning (Postgraduate): Dr Giuliana Adamo.

CL/15-16/069 School of Medicine: Head of Discipline - Psychiatry
The Council noted and approved the nomination of Professor Aiden Corvin as Head of Discipline of Psychiatry for three years from 1 January 2016.

CL/15-16/070 Royal Irish Academy of Music (RIAM)
(i) Nomination for appointment of external examiners
   The Council noted and approved a memorandum from the Dean of Graduate Studies and Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies, circulated, dated 9 November 2015.

(ii) Change to RIAM Course Committee membership
   The Council noted and approved a memorandum from the Registrar/Chair of the Royal Irish Academy of Music Associated College Degrees Committee (RIAM ACDC), circulated, dated 9 November 2015.

SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

Signed  ...................................................

Date  .....................................................