



**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**

**Minutes of Board Meeting of 19 April 2017**

<i>Present</i>	Provost (Dr P J Prendergast), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Professor C Morash), Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies (Professor G S Martin), Registrar (Professor P Murphy), Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation (Professor V Campbell), Professor D Ahern, Dr O Braiden, Mr S Collins, Professor S M Draper, Dr D Fayne, Professor R Gilligan, Mr J Keogh, Mr T Keohane, Professor C Laudet, Professor C McCabe, Mr K McNulty, Professor R Moss, Professor E O'Halpin, Professor D R Phelan, Professor A Seery, Professor R Timoney, Mr D Whelehan.
<i>Apologies</i>	Professor S Alyn Stacey, Ms S Dunphy, Ms S Farrell, Professor B M Lucey, Ms A Ní Lochlainn.
<i>In attendance</i>	Assistant Secretary to the College (Ms V Butler).
<i>(ex officio)</i>	Secretary to the College (Mr J Coman), Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer (Mr I Mathews).
<i>(by invitation)</i>	Chief Operating Officer (Ms G Ruane), Vice-President for Global Relations (Professor J Hussey).

**SECTION A**

**BD/16-17/218 Statement of Interest**

There were no statements of interest.

**BD/16-17/219 Minutes - Meeting of 22 March 2017**

The minutes of the Board meeting of 22 March 2017 were approved and signed subject to the following amendments:

**1. BD/16-17/177 Matters Arising from the Minutes**

Record the last paragraph referring to minute BD/16-17/148 as the last paragraph referring to minute BD/16-17/142.

**2. BD/16-17/178 Provost's Report**

Correct the spelling of Berkeley in the paragraph on College events.

**3. BD/16-17/179 Audit Committee Annual Report 2016/17**

Amend the second last paragraph of minute to include the sentence shown below:

'He further clarified that this was also an issue for the majority of the other Irish universities. It was noted that there has been a significant period of dialogue and engagement between the University and Higher Education Authority officials on this issue which is currently ongoing and to date, a guarantee in respect of the payment of the Model Pension Scheme has not been received. The Internal Auditor..'

**4. BD/16-17/180 Consolidated Financial Statements for year ended 30 September 2016**

Amend the second last paragraph of minute to include the sentence shown below:

'In response to queries from a Board member, the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer informed the Board that the University had taken external advice on the audit qualification issue and that he would continue to engage with the Department of Education and Skills and the HEA on this matter. It was noted that further consideration is to be given to issuing a communication to the relevant staff members in respect of the current treatment of the Model Pension Scheme.'

**Action/Decision**

**219.1** It was noted that following consultation with a Board member further revisions to minute BD/16-17/179 Audit Committee Annual Report 2016/17 may be required and will be brought to the next meeting of the Board.

**BD/16-17/220 Matters Arising from the Minutes**

The following items were discussed:

**BD/16-17/180 Consolidated Financial Statements for year ended 30 September 2016**

The Secretary to the College advised Board members that the possibility of issuing a communication to the relevant staff members in respect of the current treatment of the Model Pension Scheme in the Financial Statements was considered by the Chief Officers Group and it had been agreed that a communication was not required at this time. The Provost will consider whether to discuss this matter directly with the Chief Executive of the Higher Education Authority.

**BD/16-17/184 Rankings**

It was noted that the Research Excellence Strategy is to come to Board before the end of the Academic Year and will include reference to the rankings and research impact.

**BD/16-17/192 Finance Committee**

The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer advised the Board that, following input from the College Solicitor, the fee increases proposed by the School of Engineering will be introduced with Scholarships offered to those students who had applied and been accepted before the change to fees.

**BD/16-17/221 Provost's Report**

The Provost provided the Board with an update on his work in the past month under the following headings:

- **Review of Income Generating Strategies (Global Relations Strategy 2 and Online Education)**  
It was noted that a review of the Global Relations Strategy 2 had been scheduled and that a review of the Online Education Strategy had been conducted.
- **Strategic Plan Mid-Term Review**  
The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised the Board that a Mid-Term Review of the Strategic Plan is currently underway, the findings of which will be brought to a meeting of the Board before the end of the academic year.
- **National Training Fund Levy**  
The Provost informed the Board that submissions through IBEC, the IUA and also an individual Trinity submission had been made in response to the Government proposal to increase the National Training Fund Levy. He further advised that the possibility of applying to this fund for capital projects was being explored. It was noted that the Students' Union had also submitted a response to the call for consultation on this item.
- **Higher Education Authority CEO**  
The Provost advised the Board that Dr Graham Love had been appointed as the Chief Executive Officer of the Higher Education Authority.
- **Fundraising Campaign**  
It was noted that there had been meetings of both the Provost's Council, the Campaign Forum and the Campaign Steering Group and that the Campaign Forum is to meet quarterly.

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**

- **E3**  
It was noted that the first phase of the E3 project is to be located on the old Biochemistry site in the East-end of the campus. It is envisaged that the provision of additional space will facilitate a growth in staff numbers in each of the three participating schools.
- **Trinity Education Project**  
A proposal on progression and awards is to be considered by Council on 10 May 2017 and that the project will be moving from the planning phase to the implementation phase in the next academic year, with new governance structures to be developed.
- **Relationship with St James's Hospital**  
The Provost advised that a small working group has been established to explore the relationship between Trinity and St James's Hospital. In particular, ways to enhance Trinity's engagement with the hospital consultants are to be explored. A visit to the Mercer's Institute for Successful Ageing (MISA) had also been conducted. The importance of enhancing the relationship between Trinity, St James's Hospital and Tallaght Hospital was acknowledged.
- **Trinity Technology and Enterprise Campus (TTEC)**  
It was noted that the Chief Innovation and Enterprise Officer is to present an update on the proposed redevelopment of the TTEC site at the next meeting of the Board.
- **League of European Research Universities (LERU)**  
The Provost advised that he had recently attended a LERU Spring Meeting which considered ways to enhance engagement with Central and Eastern Europe.
- **Trinity-Intel Employability Awards**  
It was noted that the Provost, Registrar and Senior Lecturer had attended the first Trinity Employability Awards involving the STEM schools. Consideration is to be given to implementing these awards across other undergraduate disciplines.
- **Student Space in the Arts Building**  
The Provost commended the student representatives on securing a dedicated space for students in the Arts Building noting that the proposed increase in the student levy may contribute to similar initiatives across the university.
- **Trinity Week**  
The Provost extended his thanks to the Dean of Health Sciences and members of the Faculty of Health Sciences for contributing to a successful programme of events for Trinity Week 2017.

The Provost invited any comments on his report and a number of members raised queries on which information or clarification was provided.

#### **BD/16-17/222 Five-year Income and Expenditure Forecasts**

The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer with reference to his memorandum, dated 12 April 2017, provided the Board with a summary of the assumptions underlying the five-year financial forecasts, as had been circulated. He also advised that these forecasts would usually form part of the Planning Group Report; however they are to be considered at this point so that the forecasts could be returned to the HEA in time for consideration at the annual budgetary meeting.

The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer informed the Board that the University is striving to achieve a financially sustainable position of a 3% surplus (as defined by the OECD). He advised that while the implications of the Cassells Report in respect of funding for the sector remains

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**

unclear, the University is focusing on increasing non-Exchequer sources of income. The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer then provided the Board with a summary of the best, most-likely and worst-case financial forecasts for the next five years. To further facilitate a growth in non-Exchequer income, he also advised that the Dean of Research and the sector are currently reviewing levels of overhead provided for research projects and that the Planning Group has recommended that all future income-generating strategies and capital expenditure business cases must include a contribution to the recurrent deficit.

The Board, noting the sustainability graph on page 4 of the memorandum, considered the combination of possible additional income generation options as outlined by the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer to generate the €40m of additional income required to achieve financial stability over and above the current income forecast. The Board noted the need to re-profile costs in the first instance and considered the alternative options should other measures fail to deliver the additional income required to return the University to financial sustainability.

In response to queries from a Board member, the Provost advised that the reduction in State funding had been partly countered by a growth in international students. With respect to the possibility of utilising funds from the Endowment Funds, the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer advised that Endowment Funds are largely restricted and, as such, there is limited flexibility for an alternative use of the funds.

Noting that an increase in activity across the University could impact on the quality of teaching and research, the importance of maintaining the staff: student ratio and of ensuring a good student experience was acknowledged. It was also acknowledged that increased levels of activity will have increased resource implications.

Responding to a query from a Board member, the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer advised that discussions are on-going with the HEA, and with industry, in respect of appropriate levels of overhead for research projects. The varying levels of research overhead paid internationally were noted and the need of a government directive regarding appropriate levels of overhead payable was noted. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised that the Planning Group are currently modelling the possible options regarding financial strategies to ensure sustainability.

In response to comments from Board members, it was noted that the Planning Group consider appropriate fee levels; and the importance of managing the operational costs of the University while maintaining a quality service was acknowledged.

The Provost thanked the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer and staff members in the Financial Services Division for their contribution to this informative document.

#### **Action/Decision**

- 122.1** The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer dated 12 April 2017.
- 122.2** The Five-year Income and Expenditure Forecasts were noted.

#### **BD/16-17/223**

##### **Risk Management Group Update and Risk Register**

The Chief Operating Officer introduced the item noting that the risk register, as had been circulated, is a live document and is the product of a body of work which was conducted over the last two years. She informed Board members that the high level risks had been reviewed and revised, as appropriate, with an underlying focus on risk to the Strategic Plan 2014-2019. She also informed the Board that, following on from an Audit Committee recommendation, the process to appoint a Chief Risk Officer was underway and that it is envisaged that the Chief Risk Officer will manage the risk register going forward.

In response to a query from a Board member in respect of the Model Pension Scheme, it was proposed that the potential risk of the government not meeting the liability of the Model

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**

Pension Scheme, as qualified by the external auditors in the audit of the Financial Statements for year ended 30 September 2016, is to be included on the register at an appropriate level. The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer advised that this risk should be considered as a low risk as there is custom and practice of the Government paying the liabilities as they fall due.

The associated risks with diversifying the student population and with the rankings process were acknowledged, as was the risk of not achieving the targets of the fundraising Campaign.

#### **Action/Decision**

**223.1** The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Chief Operating Officer, dated 11 April 2017, and the accompanying risk register.

**223.2** The risks related to the payment of the Model Pension Scheme would be included in the Risk Register at an appropriate level.

#### **BD/16-17/224 College Cultural Diversity Strategy – Discussion Paper**

The Provost introduced this item, noting that this discussion paper was brought forward for consideration at the request of the Board (BD/16-17/086 refers), in the context of the Diversity and Inclusion Strategy

Professor Robert Gilligan, acknowledging the contribution of the Senior Lecturer and the Equality Officer to this paper, provided the Board with a summary of the document as had been circulated. Noting the proposal to increase international student numbers, an observed increase in students born outside of the State and an increase in the number of international staff, he emphasised the importance for the university to further demonstrate social and cultural respect with a view to attracting these staff and students and having them feel at home in Trinity.

Comments and observations in respect of the discussion paper were welcomed.

During discussion on this item, the following comments were noted:

- The tutorial system could play a role in supporting the implementation of this strategy;
- That there are several areas of the university currently addressing these issues, including the students' unions and the Global Relations Office, and a co-ordinated approach which is broad and balanced should be adopted;
- This strategy should also apply to staff members as well as students;
- The possibility of expanding pre-entry language courses should be explored;
- The opportunity for Trinity to provide leadership in this area to the wider community and the education sector.

The Board welcomed the document as prepared by Professor Gilligan and the Provost, on behalf of the Board, thanked Professor Gilligan for his contribution to this item.

#### **Action/Decision**

**224.1** The Board discussed the memorandum from Professor Robbie Gilligan dated March 2017 (ref BD/16-17/086). The Provost and Professor Gilligan are to liaise further to consider the establishment of a Working Group, which is to include representation from the Academic Registry, to progress this strategy.

#### **BD/16-17/225 Science Gallery Annual Report 2016**

*Chair of the Science Gallery Board, Mr Shay Garvey and Mr Ian Brunswick, Head of Programming, attended for this item.*

The Board noted the apologies from the Director of Science Gallery, Ms Lynn Scarff.

The Chair of the Science Gallery Board presented the Annual Report 2016 of the Science Gallery,

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**

as circulated, to the Board, noting some of the highlights of the year. Mr Garvey also provided a summary of the financial performance of the Science Gallery and informed Board members that the current strategic plan for the Gallery is coming to an end and that the Science Gallery Board will be meeting to progress the development of the next strategic plan.

In addition, the Head of Programming advised the Board of an increase in outreach and engagement with second level schools and the development of a new course for second level teachers was noted. He further noted that a large number of school tours had also been conducted throughout the year.

The challenge of additional space to grow activities was acknowledged and the Chief Operating Officer advised that further collaboration with the Commercial Revenue Unit may be able to address this issue and could lead to the development of other initiatives for the Gallery.

In response to comments from Board members, it was confirmed that the Trinity identity is referenced in all of the activities of the Science Gallery and Science Gallery International was noted.

Responding to a query from a Board member, the Treasurer/Chief Financial officer advised that the financial statements of the Science Gallery are reviewed by the Finance Committee twice a year and the diversification of sources of income for the Gallery was noted.

The contribution of the Schools and in particular research teams in the university to the development of the programme of events for the Science Gallery was also acknowledged. The Provost thanked Mr Garvey and Mr Brunswick for their work and their presentation.

#### **Action/Decision**

**225.1** The Board approved the Science Gallery Annual Report 2016 subject to one minor amendment in the reference to the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer.

#### **BD/16-17/226 University Council**

The Board noted and approved the draft Acta of the Council meeting of 5 April 2017 and memorandum from the Dean of Health Sciences dated 7 March 2017 (CL/16- 17/134).

#### **BD/16-17/227 Any Other Urgent Business**

The following items were raised:

- **Nassau Street Entrance**  
The Chief Operating Officer, acknowledging comments from a Board member, advised that while difficulties with the refurbishment of the Nassau Street entrance had been encountered over the lifecycle of the project, the entrance has been much improved. Board members were invited to forward any comments in relation to the project to the Chief Operating Officer.
- **Industrial Relations Matter**  
Following queries from a Board member, the Chief Operating Officer provided the Board with an update of the ongoing discussions between the university and staff representative groups in the Workplace Relations Commission. She also advised that the draft job evaluation proposal had been considered by the Human Resources Committee and would be brought to a future meeting of the Board.
- **Noise disruption caused by the Luas Works**  
The President of the Students' Union advised the Board of the noise disruption being experienced by students who are resident on campus, which is arising from the ongoing Luas works. He informed the Board that the noise was impacting on the students' ability to sleep and prepare for examinations. The Chief Operating Officer, noting that some rooms in Trinity Hall had been made available to students adversely affected by the works, agreed to liaise further with the Students' Union in respect of possible available alternative

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**

accommodation for the students concerned.

**Action/Decision**

**227.1** The Provost, as Chair of the Board, agreed that further representations would be made to the appropriate authorities in respect of this matter.

**SECTION B**

**BD/16-17/228 Board Business**

(i) Callover

The Board noted the Board Callover from the meeting of 22 March 2017.

(ii) Outcomes

The Board noted the Board Outcomes from the meeting of 22 March 2017.

**BD/16-17/229 Equality Committee**

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of the meeting of 22 March 2017.

**BD/16-17/230 Quality Committee**

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of the meeting of 9 March 2017.

**BD/16-17/231 Library and Information Policy Committee**

The Chair of the committee provided Board members with a summary of the main items of relevance to Board members. The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of meeting of 6 February 2017.

**SECTION C**

**BD/16-17/232 Schedule of Board Meetings 2016-17**

The Board noted that the final Board meeting of the 2016-17 academic year will take place on Wednesday 14 June 2017, and that the meeting of 28 June 2017 will not now take place.

**BD/16-17/233 Higher Degrees**

The Board noted Higher Degrees, circulated, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 22 March and 5 April 2017.

**BD/16-17/234 Proctors' Lists for Spring Commencements**

The Board noted that the Proctors' Lists were approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 18 April 2017.

**BD/16-17/235 Committee of the Student Conduct and Capacity**

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Registrar, circulated, dated 23 March 2017.

**BD/16-17/236 Sealings**

The Board noted the sealings, as circulated, and attached as Appendix 1 to this Minute.

**This information is restricted due to commercial sensitivity.**

**BD/16-17/237 Prizes and Other Awards**

(i) **Leslie Bloomer Prize in Human Genetics and Dawson Prize in Genetics – change in values of prizes**

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Head of Genetics, circulated, dated 30 March 2017.

(ii) **Visual and Performing Arts Fund 2016-2017**

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Provost, circulated, dated 3 April 2017.

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**

**BD/16-17/238 Committee Membership – Chair of the Audit Committee**  
The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Registrar, circulated, dated 31 March 2017.

**BD/16-17/239 Heads of School**  
**(i) Psychology (2017-2022)**  
The Board noted and approved that Professor David Hevey has been elected as Head of School of Psychology for a five-year term from 3 July 2017.

**BD/16-17/240 Information Technology Services Annual Report 2015-16 and Service Plan 2016-17**  
The Board noted the report as circulated.

**BD/16-17/241 Almanack 2017-18 term dates**  
The Board noted the Memorandum from the Editor of the Calendar, circulated, dated 12 April 2017.

**SECTION D**

**In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.**

Signed: .....

Date: .....