Minutes of Board Meeting, 13 October 2010

Present
Provost (Dr J Hegarty), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Dr P J Prendergast), Senior Lecturer (Dr A Douglas), Registrar (Dr J Barkhoff), Bursar (Dr F M Boland), Dr S P A Allwright, Dr S D C Barrett, Dr M Bouroche, Dr O Braiden, Ms M A Coffey, Mr W J Dowling, Mr J Gallagher, Dr H Gibbons, Ms D Lawless, Dr J F McGilp, Dr K J McGinley, Dr N Marples, Ms N Murray, Dr E J O’Halpin, Professor D O’Neill, Dr H J Rice, Dr D M Singleton, Mr N Trigoub-Rotnem.

Apologies
Dr R Gilligan, Ms S Fleming.

In attendance
Ms S Mac Bride.

(ex officio)
Secretary to the College, Treasurer.

(by invitation)
Chief Operating Officer.

SECTION A

BD/10-11/024 Statutory Declaration
The Provost invited Dr Gibbons to make the Statutory Declaration as provided for in the 2010 Consolidated Statutes.

BD/10-11/025 Minutes
The minutes of the meeting held on 15 September 2010 were approved and signed.

BD/10-11/026 Matters Arising
A number of matters arising from the minutes were discussed and have been recorded below, (see minutes BD/10-11/027 and 028 below).

BD/10-11/027 Membership of Principal Committees/Compliance Committees (see minute BD/10-11/010 of 15 September 2010)
The Secretary advised Board that the Audit Committee had welcomed the proposal that a fourth external member with an accountancy qualification be added to the membership of the Audit Committee. The Board agreed that an accountant with broad management experience would be the appropriate choice for the College and following this appointment in order to maintain a balance between the numbers of
internal and external members the next external vacancy to arise on the Audit Committee would not be filled.

BD/10-11/028 Provost’s Report - Review and Outlook (see minute BD/10-11/007 of 15 September 2010)
In response to a query, the Provost advised Board that, pending the approval of the three founding members, (the College, St James’s Hospital and AMiNCH), the draft Heads of Agreement for Trinity Health would be presented to Board during Michaelmas Term 2010.

BD/10-11/029 Provost’s Report
The Provost, noting the deterioration in the national financial outlook in recent months and the government’s challenge to address the country’s deficit over the next four years, advised Board that it now seemed likely that the core grant could be reduced by 15%-20% in 2011. The Board noted that while the College had been putting measures in place to mitigate a 6%-7% reduction, it would be extremely challenging to continue to deliver the current level of service if faced with the expected reduction in core grant.

The Board agreed that a document outlining possible financial scenarios and their impact on the College would be presented to the next Board meeting. Noting that any proposals arising out of this exercise could not contravene any national agreements, the Provost advised that all options would be under consideration.

BD/10-11/030 Strategic Plan Actions - Update
The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer invited Board’s attention to a memorandum, dated 13 October 2010, which had been circulated. He advised Board that the Strategic Plan had been approved in September 2009 and that this update was intended to assist the Board in overseeing the implementation of the Plan.

The Board noted that despite the national economic crisis and the effect this has had on the College, a large number of the actions specified in the Strategic Plan have been achieved. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that he had met with the Heads of Schools who are now developing their own strategic plans.

In the course of a discussion the following issues were raised by Board members:
(i) emphasis should be placed on governance issues in an effort to promote an environment of communication, participation and inclusivity in the College;
(ii) provisions should be put in place to ensure progress in relation to the introduction of the new resource planning model;
(iii) the cost of implementing of Schools’ strategic plans in relation to curriculum innovation and renewal of undergraduate teaching should be outlined;
(iv) in light of the current national economic crisis the objective to increase student numbers should be deferred and the College should focus on its core objectives.

In response to a query, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that the mandatory student evaluation specified in action 2.2 of the Strategic Plan did not exclusively refer to student surveys. Noting previous commitments on the voluntary

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings
nature of such surveys he stated that he would consult with further with IFUT on this issue.

He also advised Board that significant progress had been made in relation to internal governance structures during the first year of the implementation process and would continue to remain under review, noting that a College Communications Strategy was being prepared under the auspices of the Secretary.

The Board noted that the precise cost of actions relating to Schools will be finalised once all Schools have completed their individual strategic plans. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer emphasised the importance of implementing actions which are cost effective and which will have a positive effect on the College community.

The Provost thanked the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer and noted that the implementation of the Strategic Plan actions will be reviewed regularly by the Board.

**BD/10-11/031 Mid-term Academic Review**

The Provost, introducing the topic, invited Board’s attention to the communiqué to Heads of School, dated 6 July 2010, which had been circulated. He advised Board that at the end of the previous academic year two external reviewers had presented on a number of recommendations to Board on the effectiveness of the academic structures introduced in September 2008 (minute BD/09-10/307 of 30 June 2010 refers). He further advised that the Board, having welcomed the thrust of the report, agreed to establish a Task Force to develop options in consultation with College stakeholders for the implementation of the recommendations as appropriate. The Board noted that the Task Force was now seeking the views of Board members on its findings and would also consult with the University Council on 27 October 2010 before its final report would be presented to Board at its next meeting.

Dr Singleton, Chair of the Task Force, invited Board’s attention to the document from the Task Force, dated 11 October 2010. Paying tribute to the diligence of the Task Force, he advised Board that its report was a response to the options recommended by the reviewers and that its implementation would be a matter for the Board.

Dr Singleton invited Board’s attention to the Task Force’s response under the following headings:

**Multi-disciplinary Schools**

Dr Singleton advised Board that, having considered the reviewers’ proposed options, the Task Force found that in the current climate there was little appetite for the further merger of Schools or the disbandment of the Faculties. He noted that while the Task Force would not rule out the possibility of individual Schools wishing to collaborate in the future, it was not considered desirable or cost effective to coerce Schools into merging at this time.

**Faculty Structure**

Dr Singleton, stating that the Heads of Schools were not of the opinion that Faculties should be disbanded, noted that many of the Faculty-related issues identified by the reviewers could be addressed by establishing a Heads of Schools Committee that would be linked to College decision-making in a meaningful way. The Board also noted **Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**
the Task Force’s recommendation that the Planning Group engage with the Heads of Schools Committee on policy development and implementation.

**Faculty of Health Sciences**

The Board noted that, in the Task Force’s opinion, the composition of Schools in the Faculty of Health Sciences is sufficiently different from the other two Faculties to require an alternative Faculty-School model the details of which have yet to be agreed.

**Annual Officers / Faculty Deans / Heads of Schools**

Dr Singleton invited Board’s attention to the Task Force’s recommendations on Annual Officers, Faculty Deans and Heads of Schools as follows:

(i) the nature and extent of delegated power from the Provost to the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer should be outlined clearly;
(ii) the role and responsibilities of Faculty Deans should be clarified to ensure clear boundaries between the role of the Dean and the role of Heads of Schools;
(iii) Heads of Schools should exercise a strategic role in College through the proposed Heads of School Committee;
(iv) the Senior Lecturer should chair the Undergraduate Studies Committee;
(v) the Bursar should oversee the development and implementation of the Strategic Plan and should be a member of the Planning Group.

**Communication and Administration**

The Board noted that while there is adequate internal communication there is a lack of opportunity for academics to engage in decision-making and policy development in College.

Dr Singleton advised Board that the Task Force endorsed the reviewers’ recommendations in relation to the College administration and that improvements can be made including:

(a) establishing conditions to create greater flexibility in administration within and across Schools to achieve efficiencies;
(b) streamlining the reporting lines of administrative staff in Schools and course offices to provide adequate support for cross-school courses;
(c) the implementation of a fit-for-purpose information system;
(d) facilitating cross-school cooperation in research, teaching and administration;
(e) clarifying the roles of Academic Officers, Deans, Heads of Schools and Heads of Discipline.

Dr McGilp, a member of the Task Force, advised Board of the high financial and reputational risk associated with further restructuring and noted the advantages of the proposed re-establishment of the Heads of Schools Committee. He also stated that the Planning Group would be in a position to engage with the Heads of Schools Committee prior to items being considered at Board thereby establishing clear lines of communication and consultation.

In the course of a long and detailed discussion the following issues were raised by Board members:

(i) Schools that did not merge at the first stage of restructuring are continuing to remain disengaged from the process;

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*
(ii) as the Heads of Schools Committee could be too big to function effectively single discipline Schools could have a rotating representation; the Heads of Schools Committee should not be an executive decision making body but could be a significant contributor to the work of the Planning Group;

(iii) there are varying opinions on the success of the first stage of restructuring and Schools and Faculties introduce an unnecessary new layer of bureaucracy separating academic disciplines from decision making;

(iv) the role of Deans should be clarified in light of the introduction of the Heads of Schools Committee and the College needs strong central management in the current financial crisis;

(v) the Task Force’s recommendations explore the feasibility of the reviewers’ proposals in the context of the current economic and political climate and the College needs strong central management in the current financial crisis;

(vi) the necessity of having a senior officer of the College involved in undergraduate issues could be fulfilled by the Senior Lecturer chairing the Undergraduate Studies Committee;

(vii) the Planning Group would benefit by having the Bursar involved however it should not be at the exclusion of the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer;

(viii) multidisciplinary Schools have benefited from shared administration and further sharing of administrative resources should be encouraged;

(ix) priority should be given to the reform of College administration.

In response to the issues raised by Board members, members of the Task Force clarified a number of issues including that:

(a) it is not a financially feasible and would be damaging to morale to coerce Schools into merging and there is not appetite among the Schools for further restructuring;

(b) the terms of reference and operational detail of the Heads of Schools Committee have yet to be finalised;

(c) the proposals do not aim to diminish the role of the Faculty Deans but to involve the Heads of Schools in the College’s decision-making process;

(d) the proposed additional role of the Bursar is not intended to diminish the role of the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer but to enable to him/her to work more effectively;

(e) it is intended that the Bursar would contribute to all issues under the Planning Group’s remit and not just strategic planning; the Bursar should not be solely responsible for strategic planning as the Provost has responsibility for this under the Statutes and in accordance with the Statutes, the Provost would continue to delegate specific functions to the Bursar;

(f) issues relating to administration will be addressed by the Chief Operating Officer.

In conclusion, the Board noted that the Task Force’s findings would be presented to the University Council, Heads of Schools and Executive Officers for discussion before the final version is presented for decision at the Board meeting on 13 November 2010.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer retired from the meeting

BD/10-11/032 Appointment of the Provost

The Registrar invited Board’s attention to a memorandum, dated 5 October 2010, which had been circulated together with draft documentation including the time-table

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings
for the appointment process, the advertisement and further particulars for the post of Provost and the proposed media in which the advertisement will be placed. He advised Board that the documents had been designed to attract strong external candidates to the post by informing potential candidates of the specific nature of the post and the explaining the structure of the College.

The Board, noting the possibility that a large number of candidates could apply and the fact that all candidates must be interviewed, noted that the interview process may involve two stages including a teleconferencing phase. The Registrar advised Board that Ambassadors would be appointed from amongst the Fellows to assist external candidates acquire the requisite nominations.

In response to queries raised by Board members, the Registrar advised that:
(i) the description of the University will be reviewed and the salary for external candidates will be made clearer in the documentation;
(ii) the College Statutes require that the Provost act as both the Chairman of the Board and the Chief Executive Officer of the College;
(iii) further media outlets in which to place the advertisement may be considered.

Noting the issues raised by Board members, the Board approved the documentation subject to minor drafting amendments. The Board also agreed, in accordance with the Statutes, Provost Chapter Schedule 1, Section 2, to deem the holders of the following positions who submit applications for the Provost to have stepped aside from the exercise of their functions:
(a) Chief Academic Officer;
(b) Vice-Provost for Medical Affairs;
(c) Members of Council.

The Board agreed that should the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer declare his intention to submit an application for the Provost and therefore step aside before the next meeting of Board, the Provost would have authority to appoint a pro-Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer to replace him. The Board noted that the Provost would advise Board of any replacement at its next meeting.

BD/10-11/033  Honorary Degrees
The Board approved the nominations of the Advisory Committee on Honorary Degrees, as presented by the Registrar, noting that those approved will be conferred at Commencements ceremonies during 2010-2011 or as soon as possible thereafter.

BD/10-11/034  University Council
The Board confirmed the Acta of the University Council from its meetings held on 29 September 2010 subject to further comments covering CL/10-11/004(iii), 011, 023 (Items from Section D in the Acta are set out in Section D of these minutes), in particular noting:

CL/10-11/004(iii) Weighting Higher level Mathematics
In response to a query, the Senior Lecturer advised that the decision to award weightings to higher level mathematics was considered the fairest approach when considered in conjunction with other options. The Provost confirmed that although a sectoral approach had now been adopted in relation to higher level mathematics, 

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*
Trinity had independently made this decision prior to other universities. The Board noted views that this decision would not address the national problem of under-qualified mathematics teachers at secondary level. The Senior Lecturer advised Board that weightings in higher level mathematics would be introduced on a temporary pilot basis and further supplementary measures would be considered in furtherance of the national strategy to improve mathematics at second level.

The Board noted the dissent of Dr Barrett, the President of the Graduate Students’ Union and the Students’ Union to Council’s decision in this regard.

**CL/10-11/011 Academic Appeals Committee**
The Board confirmed the decision of the University Council to approve the minutes of the Academic Appeals Committee from its meetings of 30 June, 1 July and 2 July 2010.

**BD/10-11/035 Visitors’ Case**
Under Other Business, the Secretary advised Board that a named student has brought a case to the Visitors under Section 8 of the Chapter on the Visitor in the 2010 Consolidated Statutes and that she would notify Board of the Visitors’ decision in due course.

**BD/10-11/036 IMMA Loan Request for Two Modern Music Manuscripts**
The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Keeper of Manuscripts, dated 11 October 2010, which had been tabled.

**SECTION B**

**BD/10-11/037 Finance Committee**
The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Finance Committee from its meeting of 22 September 2010, noting in particular:

- **FN/10-11/09 Enterprise Ireland OIP Allocation**
  In response to a query, the Treasurer advised that he is in a position to provide copies of the memorandum and associated documentation from the Research Accounting Manager dated 15 September 2010 to Board members who wish to view them.

- **FN/10 - 11/10 Related Entity Financial Reporting**
  In response to a query, the Treasurer advised Board that the external Auditors of Molecular Medicine Ireland had not qualified their opinion however had noted that the absence of secured external funding for the period to 30 September 2011 raised uncertainty over the ability of the company to continue as a going concern.
SECTION C

BD/10-11/038 Principal Committees - Heads of School
The Board noted a memorandum from the Registrar, circulated, dated 5 October 2010, and approved the following appointments of Heads of School to Principal Committees:

**Estates Committee**
Professor S Wilmer
Professor M O’Mahony

**Human Resources Committee**
Professor H Biehler
Professor M McCarron

**Library and Information Policy Committee**
Professor J Wickham
Professor B McGing

**Student Services Committee**
Dr S Smyth
Dr H Smith

BD/10-11/039 Equality Committee (Calendar B141)
The Board noted and approved that the entry for the Staff Secretary should read ‘The Staff Secretary (or nominee)’.

BD/10-11/040 Representation - Dental Council 2010-2015
The Board noted and approved the nomination of Professor J Nunn and Dr J McLoughlin as the College’s representatives on the Dental Council, for five years from 13 November 2010.

BD/10-11/041 Annual Reports
The Board noted the following annual reports:
(i) NIBRT, y/e 31 December 2009;
(ii) MMI, y/e 30 September 2009
(iii) IRIS, y/e 30 June 2009;
(iv) Campus Companies Venture Capital Fund Limited Partnership, y/e 30 December 2009.

BD/10-11/042 Higher Degrees
The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 29 September 2010, as circulated.

_incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings_
Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings
Gold Medals 2009/2010

(i) Faculty of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences

Business Studies
Haughey, Mari
O’Leary, Hannah

Clinical Speech and Language Studies
McQuillan, Cathy

Economic and Social Studies
English, Maria
O’Donnabhain, Barra
Sinnott, Ian Edward (Sch)
O’Connell, Brian Cormac
Pratt, Jennifer

Education
Grimes, Hannah Kathleen

English Studies
Nugent-Folan, Georgina (Sch)
Odlum, Emily Jane
Staunton, Joanna Rose (Sch)
Gray, Catriona Rosemary

European Studies
Kilcourse, James Michael (Sch)
O’Gorman, Aoife Siobhan
Smith, Nigel

History
Paterson, Felix Charles
Taylor, Hugh Bisset
Gammage, Shamim Michael

History and Political Science
Dowd, Caitriona (Sch)

Social Studies
Barnes, Anne
Ridpath, Jenni
Bairéad, Aoife

(ii) Faculty of Engineering, Mathematics and Science

Computer Science (BA)
Clear, Michael (Sch)

Computer Science (BSc)
Popplewell, Luke Anthony

Engineering: Civil, Structural and Environmental Engineering
Day, Michael John Chaloner (Sch)
Deally, David

Engineering - Electronic and Computer Engineering
Murphy, Niall (Sch)
Volkov, Mikhail (Sch)

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings
Engineering: Mechanical and Manufacturing Engineering
Nangle Smith, Sara Maria
Fogg, Harold John
Doorley, Ronan

Manufacturing Engineering with Management Science
Stoney, Rory (Sch)

Mathematics
Blair, Christopher David Andrew (Sch)
McCormack, Clare Patricia (Sch)
Denyer, Myles (Sch)

Medicinal Chemistry
Plunkett, Shane (Sch)
O’Connor, Suzanne Joan
Healy, Alan

Natural Sciences: Biochemistry with Immunology
Ruane, Darren Thomas

Natural Sciences: Chemistry
Ryan, Sean Timothy James (Sch)
MacDonald, Ellen

Natural Sciences: Geography
Sweeney-Landers, Siun Mary

Natural Sciences: Molecular Medicine
Lawrence, Moyra (Sch)

Natural Sciences: Neuroscience
Reynolds, James Peter

Natural Sciences: Physics and Astrophysics
O’Flannagain, Aidan Michael (Sch)

Natural Sciences: Zoology
Piazzesi, Antonia Felicia

Physics and Chemistry of Advanced Materials
Heffernan, Shane Francis (Sch)

Theoretical Physics
Ballantine, Kyle Edward (Sch)
Harris, Tim (Sch)

Faculty of Health Sciences

Medicine
Walsh, Bill (Sch)

Medicine (5-year)
Galvin, Sheila
Beary, Ealga (Sch)
Woods, Robert Seton Rowan

Nursing Studies: General Nursing
McAssey, Zara

Nursing Studies: Psychiatric Nursing
Flanagan, Michael Denis

Pharmacy
Byrne, Catherine
Forde, Eanna
Kirwan, Grainne
Lennon, Mary Patricia

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings
McCarthy, Maeve
Radiation Therapy
Butler, Laura Eleanor
Ryan, John
Lott, Tanith

(iv) Multi-Faculty

Two-subject Moderatorship: Pattern B
Hoyne, Michael Pio (Sch)
Mahony, Ruth Anne
Stacey, Stephen Christopher (Sch)
Southard, Kirsten
Baviera, Giovanna (Sch)
Doherty, Peter Kevin Timothy
Lamb, Padraic (Sch)
Hayden, Andrew

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings
Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

Appendix 2 to Minute BD/10-11/044

Sealings

13 July 2010

Trinity Technology and Enterprise Campus

(i) Unit 4B - Allergy Standards Ltd - Licence Agreement
The Seal of the College was put to two copies of a Licence Agreement between the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and Allergy Standards Ltd.

(ii) Unit 5A - Department of Justice, Equality and Law Reform - Licence Agreement
The Seal of the College was put to two copies of a Licence Agreement between the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and the Department of Justice, Equality and Law Reform.

(iii) Unit G3 - Thomas O’Baill - Surrender of Lease
The Seal of the College was put to two copies of an Indenture between the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and Thomas O’Baill.

(iv) Unit 5.6 - Thomas O’Baill and Anthony O’Connor - Lease Agreement
The Seal of the College was put to two copies of a Lease Agreement between the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and Thomas O’Baill and Anthony O’Connor.

(v) Unit 6.3 - Paper Conservation Ltd - Lease Agreement
The Seal of the College was put to two copies of a Lease Agreement between the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and Paper Conservation Limited.

Science Gallery Café - Licence to Mr Gary Conville
The Seal of the College was put to two copies of a Licence between the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and Mr Gary Conville.

Apollo House, 9th Floor - Extension of Licence
The Seal of the College was put to two copies of a Licence between the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and Cuprum Properties for the short-term business letting agreement of the ninth floor of Apollo House, Tara Street and Poolbeg Street in the Parish of St Mary and City of Dublin.

14 July 2010

Biosciences Site, Pearse Street
The Seal of the College was put to three copies of a Development Agreement between the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings
Elizabeth near Dublin and P. J. Walls Holdings Limited for the development of the Biosciences Site, Pearse Street.

7 September 2010

**Trinity College Dublin Academic of Dramatic Art Limited in association with RADA**

The Seal of the College was put to three copies of an Agreement between the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin, the Drama Academy Development Company Limited and Trinity College Dublin Academy of Dramatic Art Limited for the establishment of the Trinity College Dublin Academy of Dramatic Art.

15 September 2010

**St James’s Hospital – Laboratory Space in Sir Patrick Dun Laboratory**

Source BioScience (UK) Ltd

The Seal of the College was put to two copies of a Licence Agreement between the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin, for use of Laboratory space in the Sir Patrick Dun Laboratory at St James’s Hospital, from 1 January 2010 to 31 August 2011.

**Trinity Technology and Enterprise Campus**

**Unit 1A - Lendac Ltd**

The Seal of the College was put to two copies of a Licence Agreement between the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and Lendac Ltd from 1 February 2010 for four years and nine months.

**Unit 5.7 and 5.8 Tower Building - Amethyst Designs**

The Seal of the College was put to two copies of a Licence Agreement between the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and Amethyst Designs Ltd from 28 September 2009 for four years and nine months.

PROVOST

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings