The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 15 September 2010

Present
Provost (Dr J Hegarty), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Dr P J Prendergast), Senior Lecturer (Dr A Douglas), Bursar (Dr F M Boland), Dr S D C Barrett, Dr M Bouroche, Dr O Braiden, Mr W J Dowling, Ms S Fleming, Mr J Gallagher, Dr R Gilligan, Ms D Lawless, Dr K J McGinley, Dr N Marples, Ms N Murray, Dr E J O’Halpin, Professor D O’Neill, Dr H J Rice, Dr D M Singleton. Mr N Trigoub-Rotnem.

Apologies
Registrar (Dr J Barkhoff), Dr S P A Allwright, Ms M A Coffey, Dr H Gibbons, Dr J F McGilp.

In attendance
Ms S Mac Bride.

(ex officio)
Secretary to the College, Treasurer.

(by invitation)
Chief Operating Officer.

SECTION A

BD/10-11/001 Statutory Declaration
The Provost, welcoming all new Board members, invited the Board to make the Statutory Declaration as provided for in the 2010 Consolidated Statutes.

BD/10-11/002 Minutes
The minutes of the meeting held on 30 June 2010 and 2 July 2010 were approved and signed.

BD/10-11/003 Matters Arising
A number of matters arising from the minutes were discussed and have been recorded below, (see minutes BD/10-11/004, 005, 006 below).

BD/10-11/004 Mid-Term Review of Academic Restructuring (see minute BD/09-10/307 of 30 June 2010)
Dr Singleton, Chair of the Task Force appointed by Board in July 2010, advised Board that the Task Force had met frequently over the summer and expected to present a report to Board at the next meeting. The Board, noting that Professor J Parnell and Dr
H Smith had been nominated by the Heads of Schools as members of the Task Force, approved the addition of the Head of School of Medicine as a member.

**BD/10-11/005 Student Residences Project (see minute BD/09-10/313(ii) of 30 June 2010)**

In response to a query, the Provost advised Board that the decision to advance the Student Residences Project will be considered by the Estates Committee in due course prior to it being referred to Board for final decision.

**BD/10-11/006 Senior Promotions Committee (see minute BD/10-11/ of 30 June 2010)**

In response to a query, the Provost advised Board that the College has continued to engage with the HEA in relation to promotions within the context of the employment control framework and is awaiting a meeting requested by the Provost with the sector’s implementation body.

**BD/10-11/007 Provost’s Report - Review and Outlook**

The Provost, introducing his Outlook for 2010-2011, invited Board’s attention to the external factors affecting College, including the national financial situation and increased international competition, noting the need for the College to achieve its strategic goals and maintain its position as a university of global consequence.

He outlined the College’s main achievements during the previous academic year including:

(i) maintaining a balanced budget;
(ii) receiving substantial research funding under PRTLI5;
(iii) completing the Strategic Plan 2009-2013;
(iv) launching the Ussher Lectureship Scheme funded from non-exchequer funds;
(v) the establishment of TAMC (now Trinity Health);
(vi) the introduction of the Consolidated Statutes 2010;
(vii) maintaining the College’s high academic standing in international rankings;
(viii) establishing institutional alliances;
(ix) securing €100m research income and increasing the number of campus companies;
(x) introducing the Graduate Network to provide support to graduates who are now facing unemployment due to the current economic crisis;
(xi) agreeing a policy on the Student Registration Charge;
(xii) launching the new academic year structure.

The Board noted that, in light of the current financial climate, it is expected that the core grant will decrease further this year. The Provost advised that this decrease, mitigated by the existing reduction in pay costs, will result in an expected 7-10% overall reduction in recurrent funding for the College’s activities. The Provost further advised that it will be challenging for the College to maintain its quality standards given the reduction in staff numbers and the increase in student numbers. The Board noted that in order to maintain the current student:staff ratio, the College would have to recruit 70 academic staff by 2011. This level of recruitment would be in addition to the Ussher Lectureship Scheme and would require funding from non-exchequer sources. The Provost advised that these challenges should be addressed by examining the College’s efficiency levels, exploring alternative non-exchequer funding sources, identifying new revenue generation schemes and making strategic cost
savings. The Board noted the need to communicate the effect of reduced funding on the quality of service that the College delivers.

During the course of a discussion the Provost clarified a number of technical issues including:

(a) that the student charge contributes to the provision of student services in the College;
(b) that educational institutions have the legal right to introduce fees, noting however that if the College was to do so it is likely that an equivalent amount would be deducted from its core grant;
(c) that the College will seek to recruit the highest quality academic staff under the Ussher Lectureship Scheme;
(d) the restructuring of administrative and services areas will be aligned to the academic structures of the College;
(e) research posts are paid from non-exchequer funding and therefore are not subject to the terms of the employment control framework.

The Provost invited Board’s attention to the specific Board targets for the current academic year.

BD/10-11/008 Delegated decision-making

The Secretary invited Board’s attention to the memorandum, dated 6 September 2010, which had been circulated. She advised Board that following the discussion of the Committees Review Group’s Report at the previous Board meeting (see minute BD/09-10/295 of 30 June 2010), she had consulted with Dr O’Dell regarding the issues raised by Board members. The Board noted that the revised report now addresses these concerns by the inclusion of all relevant references to the 2010 Consolidated Statutes.

The Secretary invited Board’s attention to the proposed list of decisions which are reserved for Board and the role which Principal Committees play in supporting Board in reaching these decisions. In response to queries raised by Board members, the Secretary and Vice Provost/Chief Academic Officer clarified the risk management process within the College and the policy and oversight role which Principal Committees play in ensuring that risk is appropriately managed.

The Board approved the list of reserved business which is set out in Appendix 1 to these minutes, noting that it would be included as a Schedule to the 2010 Consolidated Statutes. The Board also approved the Terms of Reference and membership for Principal Committees as amended following the discussion at the previous meeting.

BD/10-11/009 Appointment of the Provost: Membership of Steering, Appeals and Interview Committees

The Board, noting that the process for the appointment of the Provost had been formally commenced by the Secretary and Registrar (see minute BD/09-10/300 of 30 June 2010), approved the membership of the following committees established in accordance with the Consolidated Statutes (Chapter on the Provost, Section 6, 7 and

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings
8) as outlined in a memorandum from the Registrar, dated 8 September 2010, which had been circulated.

(i) **Steering Committee**
    Registrar *Chair*
    Professor S Allwright
    Ms M Coffey
    Dr J McGinley
    Secretary to the College (secretary)

(ii) **Appeals Committee**
    Professor R Gilligan *Chair*
    Dr H Gibbons
    Ms N Murray
    Alternate: Dr N Marples

(iii) **Interview Committee for the Provost (on the advice of the Recommendation Committee)**
    Professor D Singleton *Chair*
    Dr S Barrett
    Dr O Braiden
    Professor E O’Halpin
    Professor D O’Neill

**BD/10-11/010 Membership of Principal Committees/Compliance Committees**
The Board approved the membership of the Principal Committees of Board as presented in a memorandum from the Registrar, dated 8 September 2010, which had been circulated. Following a discussion on the appropriateness of the Principal Committees to deal with the current financial crisis, it was agreed that the inclusion of an additional fourth external member (with an accountancy qualification) on the Audit Committee would be considered further at the next meeting. The suggestion to explicitly include reference to the Audit Committee’s functions in relation to risk oversight on behalf of the Board was also noted.

**BD/10-11/011 Interments in College – Dr W A Watts (deceased)**
Under Other Business, the Board, noting a previous discussion of Board in 1995 (see minute 97/1 of 15 March 1995) that no further burials would take place in College, agreed that, in response to a request from his family, the ashes of the late former Provost Dr W A Watts would be interred in the College’s burial plot on an *ad hominem* basis. The Board also requested the Director of Buildings to prepare proposals on future interments in College.

**BD/10-11/012 New Academic Year Structure**
Under Other Business, in response to a query raised, the Board noted that outstanding issues relating to the introduction of the new academic year structure are still to be addressed by the Staff Office in consultation with the relevant staff representatives.

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*
BD/09-10/013 Staffing Matters
Under Other Business, the Board noted IFUT’s comments in relation to PMDS and the Full Economic Cost Model.

SECTION B

There was no business under this heading.

SECTION C

BD/10-11/014 Statutes - The 2010 Consolidated Statutes of Trinity College and of the University of Dublin
The Board noted that the Visitors had approved the restatement of the Statutes on 12 July 2010 and that the 2010 Consolidated Statutes had come into force on 30 August 2010.

BD/10-11/015 Board Members
(i) Technical, Administrative and Support Staff
The Board noted that Ms P Murphy had tendered her resignation with effect from 30 August 2010, and that as a consequence a by-election to fill this vacancy would be held.

(ii) External Members
(a) The Board noted that the Minister for Education and Skills had appointed Mr J Gallagher as a member of the Board from 2010 to 2015;
(b) The Board noted that Dr O Braiden’s term of office will be from 2010 to 2014.

BD/10-11/016 Seal of the College
The Board noted a memorandum from the Secretary, circulated, dated 6 September 2010. In accordance with Section 9 (4) of the Universities Act 1997, and Statutes, (Chapter on the College, section 2 (2) (g) and section 3) the Board approved the adoption of the existing seal as the official seal of the College.

BD/10-11/017 Administrative Procedures, 3 July to 29 August 2010
The Board noted business dealt with during the period 3 July to 29 August 2010, set out in the memorandum from the Secretary to the College, circulated, dated 8 September 2010.

BD/10-11/018 School of Medicine - Headship
The Board noted and approved the election of Professor D Kelleher as Head of the School of Medicine for a second term from 2010-2014.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings
BD/10-11/019  Election of Pro-Chancellor - Dr P S Florides
The Board noted that Dr P S Florides had been declared to be elected to the office of
Pro-Chancellor, to fill the vacancy arising from the resignation of the Hon Ms Justice
Susan Gageby Denham, following the closing date for nominations on 25 June 2010.

BD/10-11/020  Tutorship
The Board noted and approved the following appointments:

Dr R Porter (Biochemistry) (full chamber)
Dr M Creaner (Psychology) (half chamber)
Dr B O’Connell (English) (half chamber)

Under Other Business:

Dr V Politis (Philosophy) (half-chamber)

BD/10-11/021  Memorandum of Understanding – TCD/ESRI
The Board noted that the Memorandum of Understanding between TCD and the ESRI
had been signed on 12 July 2010.

SECTION D
In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

Signed: ........................................

Date: ........................................
Reserved Business of Board

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1.</th>
<th>Primary Responsibilities of the Governing Body</th>
<th>Decisions Reserved to the Governing Body</th>
<th>Relevant Principal Committee and where relevant Council to review reserved business in advance of Board consideration¹</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>(Relevant sections of the Universities Act (UA) and the section in the revised Statutes. <em>Unless otherwise stated the references to the Statutes below refer to the Chapter on the Board.</em>)</strong></td>
<td><strong>To approve the annual report and accounts of the University</strong></td>
<td>Finance</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>To approve the annual budget</strong></td>
<td>Finance</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>To approve reports to the Governing Body from the Finance Committee</strong></td>
<td>Finance</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>To approve significant acquisitions, disposals and retirement of assets of the College or its subsidiaries above a value of €3m.</strong></td>
<td>Estates and Finance</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>To approve major investments (above a value of €3m) and treasury policy</strong></td>
<td>Investment and Finance</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>To approve individual capital projects the value of which will exceed €3m in any one financial year</strong></td>
<td>Estates and Finance</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>To be the principal financial and business authority of the institution, to ensure that proper books of account are kept, to approve the annual budget and financial statements, and to have overall responsibility for the University’s assets, property and estate. [S.18(1)(a)]; [S.37]; [S.39]; [S.42]</td>
<td><strong>To approve the annual report and accounts of the University</strong></td>
<td>Finance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[S.13 (1) (e)]; [S. 18(1)(a)]; [S.42(1)]</td>
<td><strong>To approve the annual budget</strong></td>
<td>Finance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[Statute Sections 11 and 12]</td>
<td><strong>To approve reports to the Governing Body from the Finance Committee</strong></td>
<td>Finance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>To approve significant acquisitions, disposals and retirement of assets of the College or its subsidiaries above a value of €3m.</strong></td>
<td>Estates and Finance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>To approve major investments (above a value of €3m) and treasury policy</strong></td>
<td>Investment and Finance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>To approve individual capital projects the value of which will exceed €3m in any one financial year</strong></td>
<td>Estates and Finance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>To be the institution’s legal authority and, as such, to ensure that systems are in place for meeting all the institution’s legal obligations, including those arising from contracts and other legal commitments made in the institution’s name. [Third Schedule, (1),(2)and (3)]; [Statutes Section 17]</td>
<td><strong>To appoint the University’s Solicitors</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>To approve as necessary:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Statutes for submission to the Fellows for assent</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Regulations and policies for the good governance of the University</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Regulations for Board</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

¹ Terms of reference of Principal Committees should permit joint meetings with other Principal Committees to enable consideration and decisions on issues of mutual relevance

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings
<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>To make Laws, Statutes, Ordinances for the amendment to the Statues; to ensure that the University’s Statutes, Regulations and the Universities Act, 1997, are followed at all times and that appropriate advice is available to enable this to happen. [Statutes Sections 9 and 17]</td>
<td>elections</td>
<td>• Schedules to Statutes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Governance [Code of Governance]</td>
<td>To approve the Annual Governance Statement and the Statement of Internal Control for submission to the HEA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Appoint the Provost [S. 24] [Private Act S 4 (1)] [Statutes Chapter on the Provost]</td>
<td>To approve all procedural matters as laid out in the Statutes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. To act as trustee for any property, legacy, endowment, bequest or gift in support of the work and welfare of the institution.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Finance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. To approve major infrastructural investments and the physical development of the campus</td>
<td>To approve investments above €3m in value</td>
<td>Library and Information Policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To approve the College’s Physical Development Control Plan</td>
<td></td>
<td>Estates</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. To approve the mission and strategic vision of the institution, long-term academic and business plans and key performance indicators, and to ensure that these meet the interests of stakeholders. [S. 34(2)]</td>
<td>To approve the Strategic Plan</td>
<td>All Principal Committees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. To ensure that the College shall have an Academic Council to control the academic affairs of the College [S. 27 (1)]</td>
<td>To receive the minutes of Council meetings and to approve recommendations referred therein</td>
<td>Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. To appoint such and as many committees to assist it in the performance of its functions and may assign to those committees such of its [S. 18 (4), (5)] [Statutes Chapter on Committees S. 3 (1) and S. 1 (6)]</td>
<td>To establish Principal Committees and to approve their Terms of Reference, including the powers delegated to them by Board</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. To establish and keep under regular review the policies, procedures and limits within such management functions as shall be undertaken by</td>
<td>To establish policies, procedures and limits within which such delegation is</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings
<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>To ensure the establishment and monitoring of systems of control and accountability, including financial and operational controls and risk assessment, and procedures for handling internal grievances. [S.26] [Code of Governance]</td>
<td>To note reports from Audit Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[Fourth Schedule S. (1), (2) and (3) ]</td>
<td>To initiate Statutory change to ensure compliance with the Universities Act in relation to grievance and dispute resolution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Audit Finance Human Resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>To establish procedures for quality assurance [S. 35 (1)] and to prepare a statement of the policies of the University in respect of access to the University and equality, including gender equality. [S. 18 (6)(b) and 36 (1)]</td>
<td>To approve reports on Quality Promotion, Equality [including gender equality] and Access to the University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Council Equality Undergraduate Studies Graduate Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td>To establish procedures for the promotion and use of the Irish language [S. 18 (6)(a)]</td>
<td>To approve the College’s Scheme within the terms of the Official Languages Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Coiste na Gaeilge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.</td>
<td>To establish processes to monitor and evaluate the performance and effectiveness of the Governing Body itself. [Code of Governance]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.</td>
<td>To appoint the Provost [S. 18(1)(b)] and [S. 24(1)], [Private Act S. 4 (1)] and [Chapter on Provost in the Statutes S. 13 (2)]</td>
<td>To appoint the Provost [Chief Officer].</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>To make such provision as it thinks fit for the academic progress and general welfare of students, in consultation with Council. [Statutes Section 14 and Chapter in Students S.3 and 4]</td>
<td>To approve the College’s Personnel Policies and Procedures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Human Resources Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.</td>
<td>To make such provision as it thinks fit for the academic progress and general welfare of students, in consultation with Council. [Statutes Section 14 and Chapter in Students S.3 and 4]</td>
<td>To approve student-related policies and procedures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>To conduct external relations [Statutes Section 10]</td>
<td>Council Student Services</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**
<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>20.</strong></td>
<td>To arrange for and conduct elections of Fellows, Officers, Scholars and Sizars [Statutes Section 13]</td>
<td>Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>21.</strong></td>
<td>Disciplinary matters [Statutes Section 16 and Division on Conduct]</td>
<td>To make appropriate appointments and receive reports of Panels of Enquiry and Disciplinary Panels</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>22.</strong></td>
<td>Senate matters [Statutes Chapter on Senate Section 4]</td>
<td>To approve all matters which will be considered by the Senate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>23.</strong></td>
<td>Visitors [Statutes Chapter on Visitors]</td>
<td>Receive reports from the Visitor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>24.</strong></td>
<td>To appoint Deans &amp; Heads of School [Regulations]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*